

## BUKTI KORESPONDENSI (Syarat Khusus)

Judul Tulisan : The Effects Of Reforming Regulation In Resolving Insolvency Towards EODB Rank Improvement: Evidence From Indonesia

Nama Jurnal : INTERNATIONAL INSOLVENCY REVIEW

Nama Penerbit : WILEY

Terindeks di : Clarivate Analytc Web Of Science (WoS) dengan **JIF = 0,848**

Korespondensi terdiri dari :

1. Submission
2. Review Substantif dari Refree 1
3. Review Substantif dari Referee 2
4. Perbaikan atas Review
5. Accepted
6. Publication

# SUBMISSION



hadi shubhan &lt;hadimetro@gmail.com&gt;

**Manuscript for International Insolvency Review**

14 messages

**M HADI SHUBHAN** <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

Tue, Jun 4, 2019 at 5:02 PM

To: khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk

Cc: hadi shubhan &lt;hadimetro@gmail.com&gt;

Dear Professor Paul J. Omar  
Editor INSOL International Insolvency Review.

I am Assoc. Prof. Dr. M. Hadi Shubhan, a lecturer at Faculty of Law Universitas Airlangga, Indonesia. My expertise is Indonesia Bankruptcy Law, my Ph.D in Bankruptcy Law.


Please find my submission of manuscript titled " The Effects of Regulation Reform in Resolving Insolvency Towards EODB Rank Improvement : Evidence from Indonesia".

I hereby affirm that the contents of this manuscript are original. Furthermore, it has neither been published elsewhere in any language fully or partly, nor is it under review for publication anywhere.

I hope that my manuscript matches the aim and scope of your journal.

Best Regards,

M. Hadi Shubhan  
Universitas Airlangga, Indonesia

**2 attachments** **manuscript for Journal IIR.docx**  
67K **title page.docx**  
15K**P.J.Omar** <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>

Tue, Jun 4, 2019 at 5:44 PM

To: M HADI SHUBHAN &lt;hadi@fh.unair.ac.id&gt;

Cc: hadi shubhan &lt;hadimetro@gmail.com&gt;

Dear Hadi,  
Thank you for submission. This looks very interesting and I will send it for review.  
Salam sejahtera dan Selamat Hari Raya Aidilfitri.  
Paul

Sent from Yahoo Mail for iPhone

[Quoted text hidden]

**hadi shubhan** <hadimetro@gmail.com>

Tue, Jun 4, 2019 at 8:19 PM

To: "P.J.Omar" &lt;khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk&gt;

Dear Prof. Omar,  
Thank your for your response, and Thank you for your greetings for Aidil Fitri.

**Review Substantif dari Refree I**

Wassalamu alaikum  
Best regards,

M. Hadi Shubhan  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

**P.J.Omar** <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>  
To: hadi shubhan <hadimetro@gmail.com>

Sat, Aug 10, 2019 at 3:29 AM

Dear Hadi,  
Just to confirm your article is still in the review process and I hope to have more information for you in the not too distant future.  
Best wishes, Paul

Sent from Yahoo Mail for iPhone

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**hadi shubhan** <hadimetro@gmail.com>  
To: "P.J.Omar" <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>

Sat, Aug 10, 2019 at 8:20 AM

Dear Professor Omar,  
Thank you very much for this information.  
Best regards,

M. Hadi Shubhan  
Universitas Airlangga, Indonesia  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

**P.J.Omar** <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>  
Reply-To: "P.J.Omar" <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>  
To: hadi shubhan <hadimetro@gmail.com>

Thu, Dec 12, 2019 at 4:01 PM

Dear Hadi,

The first referee reports:

"The article provides an interesting history of reforms that is slightly more detailed than those currently published. However, the primary contribution is in the case statistics and argument that insolvency is the main factor in Indonesia's rise on the EODB index, both of which make an important addition to the existing (English language) literature on Indonesian "insolvency" law. The article could use some editing to address sections that aren't clear, language flow and to provide clear roadmaps. Additionally, it is lacking in citations. I therefore recommend accepting after the author makes the following modifications.

1. A careful language edit.
2. The introduction states that it borrows "the typology of Nonet and Selznick" and, as such, would benefit from introducing the theory and tying it to the rest of the text.

3. Other papers already discuss the reforms. As such, the important contribution of this article is the case numbers and impact of the reforms. More discussion of the impact and which reforms the author believes have resulted in increased number of cases would be beneficial. Also, aside from global ranking, have the reforms improved the business environment? For example, the author notes that bankruptcy is a collection regime in Indonesia that doesn't actually require the debtor to be insolvent. Have the reform then made it easier for creditors to collect debt (if so, any positive impacts such as increased availability of credit?) or is the procedure so costly as to bar utilization aside from large enterprises (as the low numbers suggest).
4. The sources of data should be cited. Additionally, the article does not cite any academic articles (mostly books on other jurisdictions to tie in theory). There are a handful of articles and chapters that already address the reforms discussed in this article that should be cited. As a minimum, these include:

Darminto Hartono, 'Debtor and Creditor Learning: Changes over Time in Indonesian Bankruptcy Reorganization Approaches' in David K Linnan (ed), *Legitimacy, Legal Development, and Change: Law and Modernization Reconsidered* (Ashgate Publishing, 2012).

David K Linnan, 'Insolvency Law and Institutions in Indonesia' in Roman Tomasic (ed), *Insolvency Law in East Asia* (Ashgate Publishing, 2006) 355 (overview of Indonesian insolvency law)

Stacey Steele, 'The New Law on Bankruptcy in Indonesia: Towards a Modern Corporate Bankruptcy Regime?' (1999) 23 *Melbourne University Law Review* 144. (introduces the reforms)

Roman Tomasic et al, 'Insolvency Law Administration and Culture in Six Asian Legal Systems' (1996) 6 *Australian Journal of Corporate Law* 248.

Casey G. Watters "SPVs as a Barrier to Cross-Border Insolvency Proceedings: Lessons from Indonesia" 32 *Australian Journal of Corporate Law* 241 (2017) (introduces reforms and takes about the PKPU)."

You may wish to wait for the second report before undertaking any amendments.

Best wishes, Paul

INSOL Europe Academic Forum Conference, Copenhagen, 25-26 September 2019  
INSOL Europe Main Conference, Copenhagen, 26-28 September 2019

[Quoted text hidden]

**hadi shubhan** <hadimetro@gmail.com>  
To: "P.J.Omar" <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>

Thu, Dec 12, 2019 at 5:11 PM

Dear Professor Omar,

First, I thank you for the information regarding the report from the first referee.

Second, I will immediately amend or revise my manuscript according to the advice of the first referee.

Third, I am waiting for a report from the second referee, and I hope to report from the second referee in the near future (will not be too long).

Best regards,

M. Hadi S

[Quoted text hidden]

**P.J.Omar** <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>

Thu, Dec 12, 2019 at 8:11 PM

**Review Substantif dari Refree II**



Reply-To: "P.J.Omar" <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>  
To: hadi shubhan <hadimetro@gmail.com>

Dear Hadi,

The second reviewer has this to say:

"This article might, with appropriate changes as discussed here, be acceptable as a useful summary of changes and proposals for further changes in Indonesian bankruptcy law in light of the EODB rankings, but the English is quite poor, and in many places looks like a bad google translate decision has been made, so that it was a challenge to work out what the author meant. While this might be a case of needing to go back and ensure that all concepts are properly translated (eg separatist creditors I take to mean secured creditors), there are many concepts and terms which also need to be explained for the international audience.

There also seems to be a paucity of referencing in the body of the text (eg no pinpoint referencing of sections of Bankruptcy Law, just general references to 'the Law has done x')

I think that some of the tables/stats don't really show what the author says they will show, and some broad generalisations are made, and/or lack of precision.

Other comments are made throughout in the margin Comment boxes.

Generally the author needs to go away and spend more time on this, keeping in mind that he/she is speaking to an international audience in IIR who are not familiar with local terms, acronyms, system."

There are further comments in the attached file.

I would suggest, in light of both sets of comments, that you take some time to do the changes and send me back the piece at the end of January/beginning of February (or later, if you need it).

Best wishes, Paul

INSOL Europe Academic Forum Conference, Copenhagen, 25-26 September 2019  
INSOL Europe Main Conference, Copenhagen, 26-28 September 2019

[Quoted text hidden]

---

 manuscript for Journal IIR (1)dbcomments.docx  
75K

---

hadi shubhan <hadimetro@gmail.com>  
To: "P.J.Omar" <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>

Thu, Dec 12, 2019 at 8:41 PM

Dear Prof. Omar,

Thank you for your email containing comments from the second referee. I will revise according to the advice of the first referee and the second referee. After the revision, I did an English editing to a professional editing via Wiley Editing Services or Enago, because of the two referees, giving suggestions for language editing improvements. Thank you for giving January until the revision, and I will send the revision in January.  
Best regards,

M. Hadi S



**Perbaikan atas Review**

[Quoted text hidden]

**hadi shubhan** <hadimetro@gmail.com>  
 To: "P.J.Omar" <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>

Thu, Jan 30, 2020 at 8:21 PM

Dear Professor Omar,

Please find the revised file from my manuscript. there are 3 files in the attachment:

1. manuscripts was revised - clean;
2. manuscripts was revised – tracked (can be traced to changes);
3. certificate of editing from professional language editing (Wiley Editing Services).

As for the revisions that I have done are:

From the first reviewer (revisions in blue letters/words):

1. A careful language edit.

Revision: I have done careful editing and also by wiley editing services (certificate attached).

2. The introduction states that it borrows "the typology of Nonet and Selznick" and, as such, would benefit from introducing the theory and tying it to the rest of the text.

Revisions : have also been added to the benefits of the Nonet theory.

3. Other papers already discuss the reforms. As such, the important contribution of this article is the case numbers and impact of the reforms. More discussion of the impact and which reforms the author believes have resulted in increased number of cases would be beneficial. Also, aside from global ranking, have the reforms improved the business environment? For example, the author notes that bankruptcy is a collection regime in Indonesia that doesn't actually require the debtor to be insolvent. Have the reform then made it easier for creditors to collect debt (if so, any positive impacts such as increased availability of credit?) or is the procedure so costly as to bar utilization aside from large enterprises (as the low numbers suggest).

Revision : I have explained about the impact of the bankruptcy law revision, even the data have been added up to 2019. Besides that, I have also quoted several things from his book Hartono, Linnan, Steele, Tomasic, Casey.

4. The sources of data should be cited.

Revision : have added citations from suggested books and Journal :

1. Darminto Hartono, 'Debtor and Creditor Learning: Changes over Time in Indonesian Bankruptcy Reorganization Approaches' in David K Linnan (ed), *Legitimacy, Legal Development, and Change: Law and Modernization Reconsidered* (Ashgate Publishing, 2012).
2. David K Linnan, 'Insolvency Law and Institutions in Indonesia' in Roman Tomasic (ed), *Insolvency Law in East Asia* (Ashgate Publishing, 2006) 355 (overview of Indonesian insolvency law)
3. Stacey Steele, 'The New Law on Bankruptcy in Indonesia: Towards a Modern Corporate Bankruptcy Regime?' (1999) 23 *Melbourne University Law Review* 144. (introduces the reforms)
4. Roman Tomasic et al, 'Insolvency Law Administration and Culture in Six Asian Legal Systems' (1996) 6 *Australian Journal of Corporate Law* 248.
5. Casey G. Watters "SPVs as a Barrier to Cross-Border Insolvency Proceedings: Lessons from Indonesia" 32 *Australian Journal of Corporate Law* 241 (2017) (introduces reforms and takes about the PKPU)."

and added other references :

6. Oh, Soogeun. (2006). "Comparative Overview Of Asian Insolvency Reforms In The Last Decade".
7. Omar, Paul J.. (2002). "The Landscape of International Insolvency Law", *International Insolvency Review*, Vol. 11.
8. Linna T. Insolvency Proceedings from a Sustainability Perspective. *International Insolvency Review*. 2019;28:210–232. <https://doi.org/10.1002/iir.1345>.

From the second reviewer (revisions in red letters/words):

1. the English is quite poor.

revision: language editing has been done. and even done by very professional by Wiley Editing Services

2. there are many concepts and terms which also need to be explained for the international audience.

Revision : Concept improvements have been made, such as separatist creditors becoming secured creditors.

curator becomes a receiver. material goods guarantee becomes collateral goods. bankruptcy estate becomes

bankruptcy assets.

3. There also seems to be a paucity of referencing in the body of the text.

Revision : have added citations from suggested books and Journal (9 books and journal added).

4. the suggestions written in the manuscript have all been corrected as well.


I thank you for this cooperation.


[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

---

3 attachments

 **Manuscript was revised - clean.docx**  
89K

 **manuscript was revised - tracked.docx**  
90K

 **Certificate\_of\_editing-HAUBH\_1.pdf**  
61K

---

**P.J.Omar** <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>  
Reply-To: "P.J.Omar" <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>  
To: hadi shubhan <hadimetro@gmail.com>

Fri, Jan 31, 2020 at 7:11 PM

Dear Hadi,

Thank you so much for this. It looks good.

I will proceed to an edit sometime in the next two weeks and let you know if I find anything to comment on.

Best wishes, Paul

**INSOL Europe Conferences 2020:**

27-28 March: Joint Conference on Applicable Law in Cross-Border Insolvency (with DG Justice and Consumers, Croatian Presidency of the Council of the EU, Ministry of Justice of Croatia and the Faculty of Law of the University of Zagreb), Zagreb (Croatia)

21-22 May: EECC Conference, Kiev (Ukraine)

11 June: Joint Conference (with INSOLAD), Amsterdam (The Netherlands)

25-26 June: Joint Conference (with DAV), Brussels (Belgium)

30 September-1 October: Academic Forum Conference, Sorrento (Italy)

1-4 October: Annual Congress, Sorrento (Italy)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**P.J.Omar** <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>  
Reply-To: "P.J.Omar" <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>  
To: hadi shubhan <hadimetro@gmail.com>

Thu, Apr 2, 2020 at 12:04 AM

Dear Hadi,

With a little delay, I can now report your article is with the production team in Manila. You should expect to receive proofs to check soon.

Best wishes and stay healthy, Paul

**INSOL Europe Conferences 2020:**

27-28 March (**postponed**): Joint Conference on Applicable Law in Cross-Border Insolvency (with DG Justice and Consumers, Croatian Presidency of the Council of the EU, Ministry of Justice of Croatia and the Faculty of Law of the University of Zagreb), Zagreb (Croatia)

21-22 May (**postponed**): EECC Conference, Kiev (Ukraine)

11 June (**postponed**): Joint Conference (with INSOLAD), Amsterdam (The Netherlands)

25-26 June (**cancelled**): Joint Conference (with DAV), Brussels (Belgium)

30 September-1 October: Academic Forum Conference, Sorrento (Italy)

1-4 October: Annual Congress, Sorrento (Italy)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**hadi shubhan** <hadimetro@gmail.com>  
To: "P.J.Omar" <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>

Thu, Apr 2, 2020 at 7:44 AM

Dear Professor Paul Omar,

Thank you for this information.

best regards,

M. Hadi Shubhan  
Universitas Airlangga, Indonesia  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

**hadi shubhan** <hadimetro@gmail.com>  
To: "P.J.Omar" <khaemwaset@yahoo.co.uk>

Wed, Apr 29, 2020 at 4:03 PM

Dear Professor Paul Omar,

I would like to thank you for publishing my article in the International Insolvency Review.

By the way, I hope you are in good health during the current corona pandemic outbreak.

My greetings from Indonesia, hopefully I can work together again in the future.

Best regards,

M. Hadi Shubhan

**M HADI SHUBHAN** <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

---

**Information: Production Editor Contact International Insolvency Review | The Effects of Reforming Regulation in Resolving Insolvency towards EODB Rank Improvement: Evidence from Indonesia**

2 messages

---

**BI-wiley@spi-global.com** <BI-wiley@spi-global.com> Wed, Apr 8, 2020 at 10:15 PM  
To: hadi@fh.unair.ac.id

Dear Dr. M. Hadi Shubhan,

We are in the process of preparing "The Effects of Reforming Regulation in Resolving Insolvency towards EODB Rank Improvement: Evidence from Indonesia" for publication. Your production editor, Dana Matias Marie, will support you and your article throughout the process.

Please get in touch with your Production Editor at [dmmatias@wiley.com](mailto:dmmatias@wiley.com) if you have any questions.

Sincerely,  
Booking-in Team,  
On behalf of Wiley

Article ID: IIR\_1372  
Article DOI: 10.1002/IIR.1372

---

**M HADI SHUBHAN** <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>  
To: BI-wiley@spi-global.com

Wed, Apr 8, 2020 at 10:23 PM

Thank you for your email.

Best wishes,

M. Hadi Shubhan  
[Quoted text hidden]





M HADI SHUBHAN <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

## Proof for International Insolvency Review article iir1372 (2020-1-A4 (SHUBHAN) (IIR 1372)) is now available

5 messages

Dana Marie Matias <IIRproofs@wiley.com>

Sat, Apr 18, 2020 at 12:48 PM

To: "Dr. M. Hadi Shubhan" <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

Cc: belle.ligutom@spi-global.com, dmmatias@wiley.com, IIRproofs@wiley.com, journals-eproofs@spi-global.com, Jumalyn.Canizares@spi-global.com, wileyreceiver@spi-global.com

Dear Dr. M. Hadi Shubhan,

The proof of your **International Insolvency Review** article **iir1372** is now available for review at:

<https://apps.spi-global.com/eProofing/VerifyTokenandAuthenticate.aspx?token=6VuiADXbbBojbFvm/3jaLg&ChapterOrArticleOrBook=Article>

**The COVID-19 pandemic has affected us in many ways which may include your timeline for proof corrections or production queries. If this is the case, please don't hesitate to let us know. Please submit proof corrections as soon as you are able. We will not proceed with publication without your review and approval.**

A copyeditor has edited your manuscript to comply with the formatting and text style requirements for the journal. Please check that you are satisfied with the completeness and correctness of the text, tables, and figures. Any necessary changes should be entered via the proofing system.

Your article may also include queries, and these must be replied to using the system before the proof can be submitted. Once your changes are complete, submit the article after which no additional corrections can be made.

To avoid a delay in publication of your article, please complete your proof review and return your corrections within the next **48 hours** (again we understand there may be delays).

If you are unable to meet this deadline, if you encounter any problems, or if you have further questions, please contact the Journal Production Editor, Dana Marie Matias ([IIRproofs@wiley.com](mailto:IIRproofs@wiley.com)) and reference your article ID in all correspondence.

Best regards,

**the International Insolvency Review editorial team**

**M HADI SHUBHAN** <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

Sat, Apr 18, 2020 at 5:03 PM

To: Dana Marie Matias <IIRproofs@wiley.com>

Cc: belle.ligutom@spi-global.com, dmmatias@wiley.com, IIRproofs@wiley.com, journals-eproofs@spi-global.com, Jumalyn.Canizares@spi-global.com, wileyreceiver@spi-global.com

Dear Dana Marie Matias,

**The International Insolvency Review editorial team**

Thank your for this information. I am satisfied and agree with the completeness and correctness of the text, tables and figures.

Best regards,

M. Hadi Shubhan

Faculty of Law, Airlangga University, Indonesia

Email : [hadi@fh.unair.ac.id](mailto:hadi@fh.unair.ac.id)

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Matias, Dana Marie** - <dmmatias@wiley.com>

Mon, Apr 20, 2020 at 7:36 PM

To: M HADI SHUBHAN <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

Dear Dr. M. Hadi Shubhan,

Thank you for your email.

Please kindly add your corrections in the system to proceed further.

Let me know if you have questions.

Best regards,

Dane

---

Dana Marie F. Matias

Production Editor

On behalf of Wiley



Manila

*We partner with global experts to further innovative research.*

E-mail: [dmmatias@wiley.com](mailto:dmmatias@wiley.com)

Tel.: +632 8855 8618

Fax: +632 5325 0768

**From:** M HADI SHUBHAN [mailto:[hadi@fh.unair.ac.id](mailto:hadi@fh.unair.ac.id)]

**Sent:** Saturday, April 18, 2020 6:04 PM

**To:** IIR Proofs <[iirproofs@wiley.com](mailto:iirproofs@wiley.com)>

**Cc:** [belle.ligutom@spi-global.com](mailto:belle.ligutom@spi-global.com); Matias, Dana Marie - <[dmmatias@wiley.com](mailto:dmmatias@wiley.com)>; [journals-eproofs@spi-global.com](mailto:journals-eproofs@spi-global.com); [Jumalyn.Canizares@spi-global.com](mailto:Jumalyn.Canizares@spi-global.com); [wileyreceiver@spi-global.com](mailto:wileyreceiver@spi-global.com)

**Subject:** Re: Proof for International Insolvency Review article iir1372 (2020-1-A4 (SHUBHAN) (IIR 1372)) is now available



This is an external email.

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**M HADI SHUBHAN** <[hadi@fh.unair.ac.id](mailto:hadi@fh.unair.ac.id)>  
To: "Matias, Dana Marie -" <[dmmatias@wiley.com](mailto:dmmatias@wiley.com)>

Mon, Apr 20, 2020 at 9:15 PM

Dear Dana Marie F. Matias,

I have made my correction through the proofing system. I hereby also attach notes manually.

If my correction through proofing the system does not match the system, please let me be informed .

Thak you very much.

Best regards,

M. Hadi Shubhan.

Airlangga University, Indonesia.

[Quoted text hidden]



Query and remarks.docx

14K

---

**Matias, Dana Marie** - <dmmatias@wiley.com>  
To: M HADI SHUBHAN <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

Tue, Apr 21, 2020 at 4:52 PM

Dear Dr. M. Hadi Shubhan,

Thanks for submitting your corrections.

I will proceed accordingly and will let you know if we have further queries.

[Quoted text hidden]

Accepted



M HADI SHUBHAN &lt;hadi@fh.unair.ac.id&gt;

---

**In Production: Your article accepted in International Insolvency Review**1 message

---

**cs-author@wiley.com** <cs-author@wiley.com>  
To: HADI@fh.unair.ac.id

Mon, Apr 27, 2020 at 5:07 PM

Dear M. HADI SHUBHAN,

Article ID: IIR1372

Article DOI: 10.1002/iir.1372

Internal Article ID: 16732701

Article: The Effects of Reforming Regulation in Resolving Insolvency towards EODB Rank Improvement: Evidence from Indonesia

Journal: International Insolvency Review

Congratulations on the acceptance of your article for publication in International Insolvency Review.

Your article has been received and the production process is now underway. We look forward to working with you and publishing your article. Using Wiley Author Services, you can track your article's progress.

Please click below to login - if you are using a different email address than this one, you will need to manually assign this article to your Dashboard (see How do I assign a missing article to My Dashboard?):

[https://authorservices.wiley.com/index.html#login?campaign=email\\_invitation-new](https://authorservices.wiley.com/index.html#login?campaign=email_invitation-new)

If applicable, a list of available actions will appear below – check out your Author Services Dashboard for all actions related to your articles.

Sign your license agreement (REQUIRED) -- you will receive an email when this task is ready on your dashboard.

Track your article's progress to publication

Access your published article

Invite colleagues to view your published article

If you need any assistance, please click here to view our Help section.

Sincerely,  
Wiley Author Services

**P.S. – Some journals accept artwork submissions for Cover Images. This is an optional service you can use to help increase article exposure and showcase your research. Pricing and placement options vary by journal. For more information, including artwork guidelines, pricing, and submission details, please visit the [Journal Cover Image](#) page. If you want help creating an image, Wiley Editing Services offers a professional [Cover Image Design](#) service that creates eye-catching images, ready to be showcased on the journal cover.**



M HADI SHUBHAN <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

---

## License signing required

1 message

---

cs-author@wiley.com <cs-author@wiley.com>

Mon, Apr 27, 2020 at 5:07 PM

To: HADI@fh.unair.ac.id

Dear M. HADI SHUBHAN,

Article ID: IIR1372

Article DOI: 10.1002/iir.1372

Internal Article ID: 16732701

Article: The Effects of Reforming Regulation in Resolving Insolvency towards EODB

Rank Improvement: Evidence from Indonesia

Journal: International Insolvency Review

This is a notification that a signed license is required for this article -- we need this to be signed before we can publish your article. To sign the license, simply click the button on your [Wiley Author Services Dashboard](#).

Sincerely,

Wiley Author Services



M HADI SHUBHAN <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

---

## License agreement successfully signed!

1 message

---

cs-author@wiley.com <cs-author@wiley.com>

Mon, Apr 27, 2020 at 5:14 PM

To: HADI@fh.unair.ac.id

Dear M. HADI SHUBHAN,

Article ID: IIR1372

Article DOI: 10.1002/iir.1372

Internal Article ID: 16732701

Article: The Effects of Reforming Regulation in Resolving Insolvency towards EODB

Rank Improvement: Evidence from Indonesia

Journal: International Insolvency Review

You've successfully completed license signing for your article – thank you! You can view your signed agreement at any time by visiting your [Wiley Author Services Dashboard](#).

Sincerely,

Wiley Author Services

---

 LicenseCopy\_IIR1372\_2020-04-27.pdf  
52K



**M HADI SHUBHAN** <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

---

**[IMPORTANT] IIR1372 - Signed License Agreement**

4 messages

---

**Matias, Dana Marie** - <dmmatias@wiley.com>  
To: M HADI SHUBHAN <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

Mon, Apr 27, 2020 at 2:40 PM

Dear Dr. M. Hadi Shubhan,

I hope this email finds you well.

I am writing with regard to your article "The Effects of Reforming Regulation in Resolving Insolvency towards EODB Rank Improvement: Evidence from Indonesia".

Upon checking in our system I noticed that you have not yet signed the license agreement for your article.

With this, would you please log in into Author Services (<https://authorservices.wiley.com>) and click on "My Dashboard."

When you locate your article on the Dashboard, please click the button that says "Sign License" to use the Wiley Author Licensing Service (WALS) to complete your license agreement.

Thank you and I hope to hear from you soon.

Best regards,

Dane

-----

Dana Marie F. Matias

Production Editor

On behalf of Wiley

Manila

*We partner with global experts to further innovative research.*

E-mail: [dmmatias@wiley.com](mailto:dmmatias@wiley.com)

Tel.: +632 8855 8618

Fax: +632 5325 0768

---

**M HADI SHUBHAN** <[hadi@fh.unair.ac.id](mailto:hadi@fh.unair.ac.id)>  
To: "Matias, Dana Marie -" <[dmmatias@wiley.com](mailto:dmmatias@wiley.com)>

Mon, Apr 27, 2020 at 3:44 PM

Dear Dana Marie F.M.,

I have logged in om "my dashboard", but I cannot find the button that says "Sign Licence", like attached photo.

Please advise me fo the process.

Thank you

Best regards,

M. Hadi Shubhan

[Quoted text hidden]



my dashboard article.jpg  
6822K

---

**M HADI SHUBHAN** <[hadi@fh.unair.ac.id](mailto:hadi@fh.unair.ac.id)>  
To: "Matias, Dana Marie -" <[dmmatias@wiley.com](mailto:dmmatias@wiley.com)>

Mon, Apr 27, 2020 at 6:03 PM

Dear Dana Marie ,

I have signed the license agreement for my article. Licensed copy was Attached.

Thank you very much.

Best regards,

**M. Hadi Shubhan**  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

 LicenseCopy\_IIR1372\_2020-04-27.pdf  
52K

---

**Matias, Dana Marie** - <dmmatias@wiley.com>  
To: M HADI SHUBHAN <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

Tue, Apr 28, 2020 at 1:34 PM

Dear Dr. M. Hadi Shubhan,

Thank you for letting us know.

I will now proceed to publication.

Have a nice day!

Best regards,

Dane

---

Dana Marie F. Matias

Production Editor

On behalf of Wiley

Manila

*We partner with global experts to further innovative research.*

E-mail: [dmmatias@wiley.com](mailto:dmmatias@wiley.com)

Tel.: +632 8855 8618

Fax: +632 5325 0768

**From:** M HADI SHUBHAN [mailto:hadi@fh.unair.ac.id]  
**Sent:** Monday, April 27, 2020 7:04 PM  
**To:** Matias, Dana Marie - <dmmatias@wiley.com>  
**Subject:** Re: [IMPORTANT] IIR1372 - Signed License Agreement

 This is an external email.

[Quoted text hidden]

Publication

**M HADI SHUBHAN** <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>**Published: Your article is now published in Early View!**

2 messages

**cs-author@wiley.com** <cs-author@wiley.com>

Tue, Apr 28, 2020 at 6:24 PM

To: HADI@fh.unair.ac.id

Dear M. HADI SHUBHAN,

Your article The Effects of Reforming Regulation in Resolving Insolvency towards EODB Rank Improvement: Evidence from Indonesia in International Insolvency Review has the following publication status: Published as Early View

To access your article, please click the following link to register or log in:

<https://authorservices.wiley.com/index.html#register>

You can also access your published article via this link: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/iir.1372>

If you need any assistance, please click [here](#) to view our Help section.

Sincerely,

Wiley Author Services

**M HADI SHUBHAN** <hadi@fh.unair.ac.id>

Tue, Apr 28, 2020 at 6:38 PM

To: cs-author@wiley.com

Thank you very much.

Best regards,

M. Hadi Shubhan

[Quoted text hidden]