# IR – PERPUSTAKAAN UNIVERSITAS AIRLANGGA

# **CHAPTER 5**

# **CONCLUSION**

# **5.1 Conclusion**

This review highlights that there are various interventions that can improve the quality of nursing work life to make better nursing services based on problems that occur in the field. There are multifactorial interventions that can be applied in Indonesia are positif thinking, motivation, sosial support, stress reduction, management stress. The interventions make quality of nursing work life improvement with the steps to achieve them through study literature.

Each intervention can solve the specific problem. Positif thinking intervention and stress reduction management focus on reducing stress and increasing social support and work motivation. Meanwhile knowledge and physiological empowerment management focus on reducing burnout and improve job satisfaction. Stres reduction, burnout and job satisfaction are considered important indicators of quality of health care and quality of work life for health professionals. Making better quality of nursing work life is a complex method that should be taken into consideration in interventions and if possible, combined and multifactorial intervention should be used.

# **REFERENCES**

- Abdul Muhith, N. N. (2012). Quality of Nursing care Based on Analysis of Nursing Performance and Nurse and Patient Satisfaction. *Jurnal Ners*, 7(1), 47–55. https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.20473/jn.v7i1.3998
- Adriaenssens, J., De Gucht, V., & Maes, S. (2015). Determinants and prevalence of burnout in emergency nurses: a systematic review of 25 years of research. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 52(2), 649–661.
- Agus, A., & Selvaraj, R. (2019). The mediating role of employee commitment in the relationship between quality of work life and the intention to stay. *International Journal* © *Emerald Publishing Limited*. https://doi.org/10.1108/ER-07-2019-0292
- Akter, N, Akkadechanunt, R. Chontawan, A. K. (2017). Factors predicting quality of work life among nurses in tertiary-level hospitals, Bangladesh. *International Nursing Review*, 1–8. https://doi.org/doi: 10.1016/j.enfcli.2019.06.001
- Altman, D., Liberati, A., Altman, D. G., Tetzlaff, J., Mulrow, C., Gøtzsche, P. C., ... Devereaux, P. J. (2009). The PRISMA Statement for Reporting Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses of Studies That Evaluate Health Care Interventions: Explanation and The PRISMA statement for reporting systematic reviews and meta-analyses of studies that evaluate health care inter. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, 62(January 2020), 1–34. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclinepi.2009.06.006
- Amutio, A., Martínez-Taboada, C., Hermosilla, D., & Delgado, L. C. (2015). Enhancing relaxation states and positive emotions in physicians through a mindfulness training program: A one-year study. *Psychology, Health & Medicine*, 20(6), 720–731. https://doi.org/DOI: 10.1080/13548506.2014.986143
- Armijo-Olivo, S., Ospina, M., da Costa, B. R., Egger, M., Saltaji, H., Fuentes, J., ... Cummings, G. G. (2014). Poor reliability between Cochrane reviewers and blinded external reviewers when applying the Cochrane risk of bias tool in physical therapy trials. *PloS One*, *9*(5).
- Augusto-Landa, J. M., Pulido-Martos, M., & Lopez-Zafra, E. (2011). Does perceived emotional intelligence and optimism/pessimism predict psychological well-being? *Journal of Happiness Studies*, *12*(3), 463–474.
- Bakar, A., Adriani, M., Qomariah, S. N., & Efendi, F. (2018). The development of islamic caring model to improve psycho spiritual comfort of coronary disease patients. *Indian Journal of Public Health Research & Development*, *9*(10), 312–317.
- Based, E., Pract, M., & Leonardo, R. (2018). PICO: Model for Clinical Questions Evidence Based Medicine and Practice PICO: Model for Clinical Questions. *Evidence-Based Medicine*, (August). https://doi.org/10.4172/2471-

# 9919.1000115

- Bawafaa, E., Wong, C. A., & Laschinger, H. (2015). The influence of resonant leadership on the structural empowerment and job satisfaction of registered nurses. *Journal of Research in Nursing*, 20(7), 610–622.
- Berendonk, C., Kaspar, R., Ba, M., & Hoben, M. (2019). Improving Quality of Work life for Care Providers by Fostering the Emotional well-being of Persons with Dementia: A Cluster-randomized Trial of a Nursing Intervention in German long-term Care Settings. *Dementia*, 18(4), 1286–1309. https://doi.org/10.1177/1471301217698837
- Bhatti, M. A., Mat, N., & Juhari, A. S. (2018). Effects of job resources factors on nurses job performance (mediating role of work engagement). *International Journal of Health Care Quality Assurance*.
- Blumberga, S., & Olava, S. (2016). Quality of hospital nursing work life, psychological and subjective well-being. *Rural Environment Education Personality*, 13, 295–300.
- Bonamer, J. (Rheingans), & Aquino-Russell, C. (2019). Self-Care Strategies for Professional Development: Transcendental Meditation Reduces Compassion Fatigue and Improves Resilience for Nurses. *Journal for Nurses in Professional Development*, 35(2). Retrieved from https://journals.lww.com/jnsdonline/Fulltext/2019/03000/Self\_Care\_Strategies\_for\_Professional\_Development\_.6.aspx
- Booth, A. M., Wright, K. E., & Outhwaite, H. (2010). Centre for Reviews and Dissemination databases: value, content, and developments. *International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care*, 26(4), 470–472.
- Çankaya, S., & Dikmen, H. A. (2020). Archives of Psychiatric Nursing The relationship between posttraumatic stress symptoms of maternity professionals and quality of work life, cognitive status, and traumatic perinatal experiences. *Archives of Psychiatric Nursing*, (March), 0–1. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apnu.2020.04.002
- Card, N. A. (2015). *Applied meta-analysis for social science research*. Guilford Publications.
- Eknithiset, R., & Somrongthong, R. (2017). Effectiveness of a diabetes mellitus pictorial diary handbook program for middle-aged and elderly type 2 diabetes mellitus patients: A quasi-experimental study at Taladnoi Primary Care Unit, Saraburi, Thailand. *Journal of Multidisciplinary Healthcare*, 10, 327–334. https://doi.org/10.2147/JMDH.S138815
- Eriksen, M. B., & Frandsen, T. F. (2018). The impact of patient, intervention, comparison, outcome (PICO) as a search strategy tool on literature search quality: a systematic review. *Journal of the Medical Library Association: JMLA*, 106(4), 420.
- Fadhillah, H., Nursalam, N., & Mustikasari, M. (2020). Development of Nurse Performance Model Based on Knowledge Management: SECI with Caring Approach to Quality of Nursing Services in Hospital. *Sys Rev Pharm*, 93(27),

75–77.

- Flaxman, P. E., Bond, F. W., & Livheim, F. (2013). The mindful and effective employee: An acceptance and commitment therapy training manual for improving well-being and performance. New Harbinger Publications.
- Gough, D., Oliver, S., & Thomas, J. (2017). An introduction to systematic reviews. Sage.
- Hayes, S. C., & Hofmann, S. G. (2017). The third wave of cognitive behavioral therapy and the rise of process-based care. *World Psychiatry*, 16(3), 245.
- Hemsworth, D., Baregheh, A., Khorakian, A., Muterera, J., Plough, J. F., Garciarivera, B. R., ... Aoun, S. (2019). The resource-based reflective risk assessment model for understanding the quality of work life of nurses. *Nursing Outlook*, 68(2), 194–206. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.outlook.2019.10.006
- Hevezi, J. A. (2016). Evaluation of a Meditation Intervention to Reduce the Effects of Stressors Associated With Compassion Fatigue Among Nurses. *Journal of Holistic Nursing*, 343–350. https://doi.org/10.1177/0898010115615981
- Hong, Q., Pluye, P., Fàbregues, S., Bartlett, G., Boardman, F., Cargo, M., ... Vedel, I. (2018). Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool (MMAT) Version 2018: User guide. *McGill*, 1–11. Retrieved from http://mixedmethodsappraisaltoolpublic.pbworks.com/
- Hosseinabadi, R., Karampourian, A., Beiranvand, S., & Pournia, Y. (2015). The effect of quality circles on job satisfaction and quality of work-life of staff in emergency medical services. *International Emergency Nursing*, 21(4), 264–270. https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ienj.2012.10.002
- Huang, H., Zhang, H., Xie, Y., Wang, S., Cui, H., Li, L., ... Geng, Q. (2020). Effect of Balint group training on burnout and quality of work life among intensive care nurses: A randomized controlled trial. *Neurology, Psychiatry and Brain Research*, 35(November 2019), 16–21. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.npbr.2019.12.002
- Husebø, B. S., Ballard, C., Aarsland, D., Selbaek, G., Slettebo, D. D., Gulla, C., ... Flo, E. (2019). The Effect of a Multicomponent Intervention on Quality of Life in Residents of Nursing Homes: A Randomized Controlled Trial (COSMOS). *Journal of the American Medical Directors Association*, 20(3), 330–339. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jamda.2018.11.006
- Hutton, B., Catala-Lopez, F., & Moher, D. (2016). The PRISMA statement extension for systematic reviews incorporating network meta-analysis: PRISMA-NMA. *Med Clin (Barc)*, 147(6), 262–266.
- Jensen, K. A. (2018). 7 STEPS TO THE PERFECT PICO SEARCH (EBSCO Health, ed.). EBSCO Health: EBSCO Health.
- Joanna Briggs Institute. (2014). The Joanna Briggs Institute Reviewers 'Manual 2014 Methodology for JBI Mixed Methods Systematic Reviews. *Joanna Briggs Institute*.
- Joanna Briggs Institute. (2017a). Checklist for Quasi-Experimental Studies. *Joanna Briggs Institute*.

- Joanna Briggs Institute. (2017b). Checklist for Randomized Controlled Trials. Joanna Briggs Institute.
- Joanna Briggs Institute. (2017c). Checklist for Systematic Reviews and Research Syntheses. *Joanna Briggs Institute*.
- Kagan, I., Shachaf, S., Rapaport, Z., Livne, T., & Madjar, B. (2017). Public Health Nurses in Israel: A Case Study on a Quality Improvement Project of Nurse's Work Life. *Public Health Nursing (Boston, Mass.)*, 34(1), 78–86. https://doi.org/10.1111/phn.12261
- Kamper, S. J. (2020). Risk of Bias and Study Quality Assessment: Linking Evidence to Practice. *Journal of Orthopaedic & Sports Physical Therapy*, 50(5), 277–279.
- Kelbiso, L., Belay, A., & Woldie, M. (2017). Determinants of quality of work life among nurses working in Hawassa town public health facilities, South Ethiopia: A cross-sectional study. *Nursing Research and Practice*, 2017. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1155/2017/5181676
- Kent, W., Hochard, K. D., & Hulbert-williams, N. J. (2019). Journal of Contextual Behavioral Science Perceived stress and professional quality of life in nursing sta ff: How important is psychological fl exibility? *Journal of Contextual Behavioral*Science, 14(February), 11–19. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcbs.2019.08.004
- Kirkman, B. L., & Rosen, B. (1999). Beyond self-management: Antecedents and consequences of team empowerment. *Academy of Management Journal*, 42(1), 58–74.
- Kwon, M. (2019). Effects of recognition of flexible work systems, organizational commitment, and quality of life on turnover intentions of healthcare nurses. *Technology and Health Care*, (Preprint), 1–9.
- Lee, H.-F., Kuo, C.-C., Chien, T.-W., & Wang, Y.-R. (2016). A meta-analysis of the effects of coping strategies on reducing nurse burnout. *Applied Nursing Research*, 31, 100–110.
- Lewis, A., & Woodhouse, M. (2015). Using The PICOS Model To Design And Conduct A Systematic Search: A Speech Pathology Case Using the PICOS model to design and conduct a systematic search: A Speech Pathology case study. A collaborative effort by Charn Nang, Bianca Piano, Abigail. *Australia University*, (September).
- Lippe, M. P., & Becker, H. (2015). Improving attitudes and perceived competence in caring for dying patients: an end-of-life simulation. *Nursing Education Perspectives*, 36(6), 372–378.
- Lira, R. P. C., & Rocha, E. M. (2019). PICOT: Imprescriptible items in a clinical research question. *Arq Bras Oftalmol*, 10(1), 20190028. https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.5935/0004-2749.20190028
- Maatouk, I., Mueller, A., Schmook, R., Angerer, P., Herbst, K., Cranz, A., ... Gündel, H. (2016). Mental Health & Prevention Healthy aging at work Development of a preventive group intervention to promote quality of life of

- nursing staff aged 45 years and older. *Mental Health & Prevention*, 4(1), 42–48. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mhp.2016.01.002
- Mackey, A., & Bassendowski, S. (2017). The history of evidence-based practice in nursing education and practice. *Journal of Professional Nursing*, 33(1), 51–55.
- Makasheva, N. P., Gromova, A. S., Ishtunov, S. A., Burykhin, B. S., & Makasheva, Y. S. (2016). *The problem of professional burnout in stress management*.
- Maria, T., Kozasa, E. H., Carmagnani, I. S., Tanaka, L. H., Lacerda, S. S., & Nogueira-martins, L. A. (2016). Positive Effects of a Stress Reduction Program Based on Mindfulness Meditation in Brazilian Nursing Professionals: Qualitative and Quantitative Evaluation. *Explore: The Journal of Science and Healing*, 12(2), 90–99. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.explore.2015.12.005
- Maslach, C., & Leiter, M. P. (2016). Understanding the burnout experience: recent research and its implications for psychiatry. *World Psychiatry*, 15(2), 103–111.
- Meng, L., Liu, Y., Liu, H., Hu, Y., Yang, J., & Liu, J. (2015). Relationships among structural empowerment, psychological empowerment, intent to stay and burnout in nursing field in mainland C hina—based on a cross-sectional questionnaire research. *International Journal of Nursing Practice*, 21(3), 303–312.
- Methley, A. M., Campbell, S., Chew-Graham, C., McNally, R., & Cheraghi-Sohi, S. (2014). PICO, PICOS and SPIDER: a comparison study of specificity and sensitivity in three search tools for qualitative systematic reviews. *BMC Health Services Research*, *14*(1), 579.
- Mokkink, L. B., De Vet, H. C. W., Prinsen, C. A. C., Patrick, D. L., Alonso, J., Bouter, L. M., & Terwee, C. B. (2018). COSMIN Risk of Bias checklist for systematic reviews of Patient-Reported Outcome Measures. *Quality of Life Research*, 27(5), 1171–1179.
- Momeni, B., Shafipour, V., Esmaeili, R., & Yazdani Charati, J. (2016). The relationship between the quality of work life and sleep in nurses at the intensive care units of teaching hospitals in Mazandaran, Iran. *Journal of Nursing and Midwifery Sciences*, 3(1), 28–34.
- Moola, S., Munn, Z., Tufanaru, C., Aromataris, E., Sears, K., Sfetcu, R., ... Mu, P.-F. (2017). Systematic reviews of etiology and risk. In: Aromataris E, Munn Z (Editors). Joanna Briggs Institute Reviewer's Manual. *Joanna Briggs Institute Reviewer's Manual*, 6. https://doi.org/10.17221/96/2009-CJGPB
- Moreno-Villalón, A., Guerra-Martin, A., & Boemo, E. (2014). MiniFPGA: An educational app for teaching partitioning, placemnent and routing on Andriod devices. 2014 IX Southern Conference on Programmable Logic (SPL), 1–4. IEEE.
- Motamed-jahromi, M., Fereidouni, Z., & Dehghan, A. (2017). Effectiveness of Positive Thinking Training Program on Nurses 'Quality of Work Life through

- Smartphone Applications. *International Scholarly Research Notices*, 2017, 1–6. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1155/2017/4965816 Research
- Movahedi, M., Ghafari, S., Nazari, F., & Valiani, M. (2020). The e ff ect of acupressure on quality of life among female nurses with. *Applied Nursing Research*, 51(November 2018), 151175. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apnr.2019.05.020
- Munn, Z., Barker, T. H., Moola, S., Tufanaru, C., Stern, C., McArthur, A., ... Aromataris, E. (2020). Methodological quality of case series studies: an introduction to the JBI critical appraisal tool. *JBI Evidence Synthesis*.
- Munn, Z., Peters, M. D. J., Stern, C., Tufanaru, C., McArthur, A., & Aromataris, E. (2018). Systematic review or scoping review? Guidance for authors when choosing between a systematic or scoping review approach. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, 18(1), 143.
- Nayak, Tanaya and Sahoo, C. (2015). Quality of Work Life and Organizational Performance: The Mediating Role of Employee Commitment. *Journal of Health Management*, 17(3), 263–273. https://doi.org/10.1177/0972063415589236
- Nursalam, Fibriansari, R. D., Yuwono, S. R., Hadi, M., Efendi, F., & Bushy, A. (2018). Development of an empowerment model for burnout syndrome and quality of nursing work life in Indonesia. *International Journal of Nursing Sciences*, 5(4), 390–395.
- Nursalam, Nursalam, Fibriansari, R. D., Yuwono, S. R., Hadi, M., Efendi, F., & Bushy, A. (2018a). Development of an empowerment model for burnout syndrome and quality of nursing work life in Indonesia. *International Journal of Nursing Sciences*, 5(4), 390–395.
- Nursalam, Nursalam, Fibriansari, R. D., Yuwono, S. R., Hadi, M., Efendi, F., & Bushy, A. (2018b). Development of an empowerment model for burnout syndrome and quality of nursing work life in Indonesia. *International Journal of Nursing Sciences*, 5(4), 390–395. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijnss.2018.05.001
- Nursalam, Nursalarn, Fibriansari, R. D., Yuwono, S. R., Hadi, M., Efendi, F., & Bushy, A. (2018). Development of an Empowerment Model for Burnout Syndrome and Quality of Nursing Work Life in Indonesia. *International Journal of Nursing Sciences*, 17(2). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijnss.2018.05.001
- Oc, B. (2018). Contextual leadership: A systematic review of how contextual factors shape leadership and its outcomes. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 29(1), 218–235.
- Orgambídez-Ramos, A., & Borrego-Alés, Y. (2017). Social support and engagement as antecedents of job satisfaction in nursing staff. *Enfermería Global*, 16(4), 217–225. https://doi.org/doi.org/10.6018/eglobal.16.4.260771
- Oshodi, T. O., Bruneau, B., Crockett, R., Kinchington, F., Nayar, S., & West, E. (2019). The nursing work environment and quality of care: Content analysis

- of comments made by registered nurses responding to the Essentials of Magnetism II scale. *Nursing Open*.
- Permarupan, P. Y., Mamun, A. Al, Samy, N. K., Saufi, R. A., & Hayat, N. (2020). Predicting Nurses Burnout through Quality of Work Life and Psychological Empowerment: A Study Towards Sustainable Healthcare Services in Malaysia. *Sustainability Journal*.
- Peters, M. (2015). Methodology for JBI Scoping Reviews The Joanna Briggs Institute Reviewers 'Manual 2015 Methodology for JBI Scoping Reviews. *Joanna Briggs Institute*, (August).
- Peters, M. (2017). 2017 Guidance for the Conduct of JBI Scoping Reviews Chapter 11: Scoping Reviews Scoping Reviews. *Joanna Briggs Institute*, (September).
- Pigott, T., & Shepperd, S. (2013). Identifying, documenting, and examining heterogeneity in systematic reviews of complex interventions. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, 66(11), 1244–1250.
- Portney, L. G. (2020). Foundations of Clinical Research: Applications to Evidence-Based Practice. FA Davis.
- Prihastuty, J., Damayanti, N. A., & Nursalam, N. (2017). Quality Of Nursing Work Life Improvement Model to Decrease Nurse Intention to Quit in Premier Surabaya Hospital. *Jurnal Ners*, 8(2), 349–356.
- Pujiyanto, T. I., & Hapsari, S. (2020). Performance Enhancement of Nurses with Quality of Nursing Work Life Model. *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation*, 24(7), 7736–7743.
- Saaiq, M., & Ashraf, B. (2017). Modifying "Pico" Question into "Picos" Model for More Robust and Reproducible Presentation of the Methodology Employed in A Scientific Study. *WJPS*, 6(3), 2016–2018.
- Sampson;, M., & Bernadette Mazurek Melnyk; Jacqueline Hoying. (2020). The MINDBODYSTRONG Intervention for New Nurse Residents: 6-Month Effects on Mental Health Outcomes, Healthy Lifestyle Behaviors, and Job Satisfaction. *Sigma Theta Tau Internationa*, 16–23. https://doi.org/10.1111/wvn.12411
- Sinclair, C., Auret, K. A., Evans, S. F., Williamson, F., Dormer, S., Wilkinson, A., ... Brims, F. (2017). Advance care planning uptake among patients with severe lung disease: a randomised patient preference trial of a nurse-led, facilitated advance care planning intervention. *BMJ Open*, 7(2), e013415.
- Sinclair, C., Auret, K. A., Uwa, M. H., Evans, S. F., Jane, F., Dormer, S., ... Koay, M. A. (2020). Impact of a Nurse-Led Advance Care Planning Intervention on Satisfaction, Health-Related Quality of Life, and Health Care Utilization

- Among Patients With Severe Respiratory Disease: A Randomized Patient-Preference Trial. *Journal of Pain and Symptom Management*, *59*(4), 848–855. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpainsymman.2019.11.018
- Sirin, M., & Sokmen, S. M. (2015). Quality of nursing work life scale: the psychometric evaluation of the Turkish version. *International Journal of Caring Sciences*, 8(3), 543.
- Suleiman, K., Hijazi, Z., Al Kalaldeh, M., & Sharour, L. A. (2019). Quality of nursing work life and related factors among emergency nurses in Jordan. *Journal of Occupational Health*, 61(5), 398–406. https://doi.org/10.1002/1348-9585.12068
- Sundaray, T. N. C. K. S. P. K. M. B. K. (2016). HR Interventions and Quality of Work Life of Healthcare Employees. *Emerald Group Publishing Limited*, 48(5). https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/ICT-02-2015-0019
- Tri Ismu Pujiyanti, Suprihati Suprihati, N. N., & Anastasia Ediyati. (2016). Improving Nursing Work Services Through Development Model of Quality of Nursing Work Life. *Jurnal Ners*, 11(1), 212–218. https://doi.org/doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.20473/jn.v8i1.3893
- Tufanaru, C., Munn, Z., Aromataris, E., Campbell, J., & Hopp, L. (2014). Checklist for Quasi-Experimental Studies. *The Joanna Briggs Institute*, 1–18.
- Tufanaru, C., Munn, Z., Aromataris, E., Campbell, J., & Hopp, L. (2020). Checklist for Randomized Controlled Trials. *Joanna Briggs Institute*, 1–9. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pgen.1000960
- Van Roy, K., Vanheule, S., & Inslegers, R. (2015). Research on Balint groups: a literature review. *Patient Education and Counseling*, 98(6), 685–694.
- Winasih, R., Nursalam, N., & Kurniawati, N. D. (2015). Cultural Organization and Quality of Nursing Work Life on Nurses Performance and Job Satisfaction in Dr. Soetomo Hospital, Surabaya. *Jurnal Ners*, 10(2), 332–342. https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.20473/jn.v10i2.1403
- Yu, G. (2018). Using meshes for MeSH term enrichment and semantic analyses. *Bioinformatics*, *34*(21), 3766–3767.
- Zeng, X., Zhang, Y., Kwong, J. S. W., Zhang, C., Li, S., Sun, F., ... Du, L. (2015). The methodological quality assessment tools for preclinical and clinical studies, systematic review and meta-analysis, and clinical practice guideline: a systematic review. *Journal of Evidence-Based Medicine*, 8(1), 2–10.