Korespondensi Penulis dengan Jurnal Millennial Asia
MLA-2020-0241: Decision on manuscript - Millennial Asia

SAGE peer review: Horngyi Pietrera@gmail.com

Mon, Nov 23, 2020, 9:41 PM

Dear Dr. Sri Vasuki,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript, MLA-2020-0241 titled Power Relations of Husbands and Wives Experiencing Domestic Violence in Dual-Career Families in Indonesia.

I have now reviewed the manuscript and the reviews are attached to this email. I have summarized the reviewers’ comments, e.g., all are in favor of publication. Reviewer 1 is the most constructive, and Reviewer 2 is the most negative regarding publication. I have also asked for your manuscript and the reviewers’ comments. On the basis of the initial feedback, I encourage you to rework and resubmit your manuscript in accordance with the reviewers’ comments and the comments in this letter.

I hope that you are able to address these comments as I believe that the result will be a stronger contribution to the journal.

If you decide to revise and resubmit, please use the link below to begin the revised submission process:

https://sagepub.com/journals/doi/10.1177/1119984120974164

When submitting the revised manuscript, please complete the author response letter describing how you handled each of the comments in the reviews and in this letter. I will then send your paper back to the reviewers to see if they have satisfied their concerns.

Thank you for considering Millennial Asia as an outlet for your work.

Sincerely,

[Signature]

Editor

Millennial Asia

---

MLA-2020-0242: Decision on manuscript - Millennial Asia

SAGE peer review: Horngyi Pietrera@gmail.com

Mon, Nov 23, 2020, 9:41 PM

Dear Dr. Sri Vasuki,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript, MLA-2020-0242 titled Power Relations of Husbands and Wives Experiencing Domestic Violence in Dual-Career Families in Indonesia.

I have now received reviews from two experts. Their reviews are constructive and thorough and are attached to this email, along with the reviewers’ comments, e.g., all are in favor of publication. Reviewer 1 is the most constructive, and Reviewer 2 is the most negative regarding publication. I have also asked for your manuscript and the reviewers’ comments. On the basis of the initial feedback, I encourage you to rework and resubmit your manuscript in accordance with the reviewers’ comments and the comments in this letter.

I hope that you are able to address these comments as I believe that the result will be a stronger contribution to the journal.

If you decide to revise and resubmit, please use the link below to begin the revised submission process:

https://sagepub.com/journals/doi/10.1177/1119984120974164

When submitting the revised manuscript, please complete the author response letter describing how you handled each of the comments in the reviews and in this letter. I will then send your paper back to the reviewers to see if they have satisfied their concerns.

Thank you for considering Millennial Asia as an outlet for your work.

Sincerely,

[Signature]

Editor

Millennial Asia
MLA-2020-0241.RV1: Your revised manuscript submitted to Millennium Asia.

SAAS peer review:

23 Dec 2020

Dear Author,

Your manuscript titled "Power Relations of Husband and Wives Experiencing Domestic Violence in Dual-Career Families in Indonesia" has been successfully submitted online and is currently being given full consideration for publication in Millennium Asia.

Your Manuscript ID is MLA-2020-0241.RV1.

Please review the manuscript in the following reference:

Millennium Asia

For any queries, please contact the Editorial Office at

Millennium Asia editorial office

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Millennium Asia.

Sincerely,

Millennium Asia Editorial Office

---

MLA-2020-0241.RV1: Decision on manuscript - Millennium Asia

SAT 13 Feb 2021

Dear Dr. Sri Widyastuti,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript MLA-2020-0241.RV1 titled "Power Relations of Husband and Wives Experiencing Domestic Violence in Dual-Career Families in Indonesia". I have reviewed the manuscript and have provided comments. As a reviewer, I have also made some comments on the manuscript. I hope you will find these comments helpful and will respond to them accordingly.

Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any further questions or concerns.

Sincerely,

Lothar Grif
Editor
Millennium Asia

Reviewer Comments:

[Reviewer comments and suggestions on the manuscript]
MLA-2020-0241RV1: Revised submission reminder

To: [Email Address]

Subject: MLA-2020-0241RV1: Revised submission reminder

Dear Dr. [Surname],

This is a reminder that you need to submit the revised version of your manuscript within the next week.

If you need an extension, please contact me at the earliest to seek an extension with a return date.

I look forward to receiving the revised submission.

Sincerely,
[Name]
[Email Address]

MLA-2020-0241RV1: Revised submission option overdue

To: [Email Address]

Subject: MLA-2020-0241RV1: Revised submission option overdue

Dear Dr. [Surname],

Please note that the revised submission is now overdue.

Should you wish to submit the revised manuscript, please feel free to contact me for an extension with a return date.

For any questions or assistance, please do not hesitate to get in touch with me.

Sincerely,
[Name]
[Email Address]
MLA-2020-0241RV2: Your revised manuscript submitted to Millenai Asia

15 April 2021
Dear [Author],

Your manuscript titled "Power Relations of Husbands and Wives Experiencing Domestic Violence in Cross-Cultural Families in Indonesia" has been successfully submitted online and is currently being given full consideration for publication in Millenai Asia.

Your manuscript ID is MLA-2020-0241RV2.

Please review the manuscript in any future correspondence regarding the manuscript.

You may view the status of your manuscript online by accessing your author's profile at the millenaiasia.com website.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Millenai Asia.

Sincerely,

[Editor's Name]

MLA-2020-0241RV2: Decision on manuscript - Millenai Asia

21 May 2021
Dear [Author],

Thank you for submitting your manuscript, MLA-2020-0241RV2 titled "Power Relations of Husbands and Wives Experiencing Domestic Violence in Cross-Cultural Families in Indonesia." I have now received reviews from two experts. The experts have made several useful suggestions that I recommend you to consider carefully.

I hope that you are able to address these concerns so I believe that the result will be a stronger contribution to the journal.

If you decide to revise and resubmit, please use the link below to begin the revised submission process.

https://milenaiasia.com/en/submissions

When submitting the revision, please complete the author response letter detailing how you addressed each of the comments in the reviews and in this letter. I will then send your paper back to the reviewers to see if they have satisfied their concerns.

Thank you for considering Millenai Asia as an outlet for your work.

Sincerely,

[Editor's Name]
MLA-2020-0241RV3: Your revised manuscript submitted to Millennial Asia: 

Dear [Author],

Your manuscript titled "Power Relations of Hostelmates and Their Experiences of Domestic Violence in Campus: A Feminist Lens" has been successfully submitted online and is currently being given full consideration for publication in Millennial Asia.

Your Manuscript ID is MLA-2020-0241RV3.

Please monitor the Manuscript for any future correspondence regarding the manuscript.

You may view the details of your manuscript online by accessing your author panel at the following link: [https://millennialasia.nepaus.com/]

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Millennial Asia.

Sincerely,

[Name]

Millennial Asia Editorial Office

---

MLA-2020-0241RV4 has been submitted Millennial Asia: 

Dear [Author],

Your manuscript MLA-2020-0241RV4, titled "Power Relations of Hostelmates and Their Experiences of Domestic Violence in Campus: A Feminist Lens" has been successfully submitted to Millennial Asia.

Thank you very much for your patience and responses about the referees' comments. Your article is almost there and considered your position as well.

Your need to include a final paragraph at the end of your introduction and before the section title of "Conclusion" will be acceptable. Please make sure each section is self-contained. For this reason, I suggest you to read your article carefully and examine each section in your theme and learn how the paragraph suggested to be written in short. These lines of ideas which you will read from Millennial Asia are also expected to be used in your article as well should be in the final section.

One can have submitted only two. One life-page with author details and another final main document.

Sincerely,

[Name]

Millennial Asia Editorial Office

---
MLA-2020-0241RV4: Your manuscript re-submitted to *Millennial Asia*.

---

SAGE peer review: Hornish Perriente@sespase.com

**29 JUN 2021**

Dear Mr. Wilson,

Your manuscript titled "Power Relations of Subordinate and Host Experiencing Domestic Violence in Dual Career Families in Indonesia" has been successfully re-submitted online and is currently being given full consideration for publication in *Millennial Asia*.

Your manuscript ID is MLA-2020-0241RV4.

Please refer to the manuscript ID in any future correspondence regarding the manuscript.

You may view the status of your manuscript online by accessing your author profile at the [https://journalexpress.sagepub.com/](https://journalexpress.sagepub.com/)

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to *Millennial Asia*.

Sincerely,

*Millennial Asia* Editorial Office

---

MLA-2020-0241RV4 has been unsubmitted to *Millennial Asia*.

---

SAGE peer review: Hornish Perriente@sespase.com

**29 JUN 2021**

Dear Mr. Wilson,

Your manuscript, MLA-2020-0241 RV4 titled "Power Relations of Subordinate and Host Experiencing Domestic Violence in Dual Career Families in Indonesia" has been unsubmitted to *Millennial Asia*. Please send one paragraph stating why your paper is unsuitable. This paragraph should be added at the end of your submission and before the beginning second section. Until you will not do it, it cannot go through.

Sincerely,

*Millennial Asia* Editorial Office

---
MLA-2020-0241.RV4: Your manuscript re-submitted to Millennial Asia

SAGE peer review

Monica Pierrini@mupub.com

29-JUL-2021

Dear Mr. [Author's Name],

Your manuscript titled "Power Relations of Spouses and Women Experiencing Domestic Violence in Dual-Career Families in Indonesia" has been successfully resubmitted online and is currently being given full consideration for publication in Millennial Asia.

Your Manuscript ID is MLA-2020-0241.RV4.

Please review the manuscript for any future correspondence regarding the manuscript.

You may view the details of your manuscript online by accessing your author panel at the https://sageauthorsonline.sagepub.com/

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Millennial Asia.

Sincerely,

Millennial Asia Editorial Office

---

MLA-2020-0241.RV4: Decision on your manuscript

SAGE peer review

Monica Pierrini@mupub.com

29-JUL-2021

Dear Mr. [Author's Name],

Thank you for submitting your manuscript, MLA-2020-0241.RV4 titled "Power Relations of Spouses and Women Experiencing Domestic Violence in Dual-Career Families in Indonesia." I am pleased to inform you that I have had an opportunity to review your manuscript along with the reviewers’ comments, and I am happy to say that I find your submission acceptable from a substantive standpoint for publication in the Millennial Asia. Let me just congratulate you again on a job well done. The reviewer comments appear at the end of the e-mail.

Your manuscript will be scheduled for publication in a future issue.

You will receive a separate notification with instructions for accessing and completing the contributor form.

Thank you again for your continuing interest in Millennial Asia.

Sincerely,

Lihyeon Choi
Editor-in-Chief
Millennial Asia

Reviewer comments:
Millennial Asia contributor form notification

SAGE peer review<br>Morphy Pierremess@psych.ac.uk<br><br>26-JUL-2021

Dear Dr. Soemodihardjo,

Your manuscript MLA-2020-0241-RV1 has been accepted for publication in Millennial Asia.

In order for SAGE to proceed with publication of your article, you must complete a Contributor Form. Under the agreement, you retain copyright to your work and grant an exclusive license to SAGE to publish the article.

You should download and complete the form online. Make sure the instructions to access and complete the online form:

1. Go to your Author Dashboard.
2. Click on the Manuscripts with Decision section.
3. Under the decision section, click on the title the Contributor Form.
4. Please the online form and click on the "I agree" button to submit it.

You may also access it directly via the URL below:
https://www.sagepub.com/kew/handle/10.1177/1125101019868601

Should you need any assistance with accessing or completing the form, please feel free to get in touch with me.

Sincerely,
Prof. Laurentiu Olău
Millennial Asia
martonnga@iupui.edu

---

MLA-2020-0241-RV4: Contributor form submitted successfully

SAGE peer review<br>Morphy Pierremess@psych.ac.uk<br><br>26-JUL-2021

Dear Dr. Soemodihardjo,

Thank you for submitting the contributor form.

After an internal checking of your contributor form, we will proceed with processing your manuscript for production.

Please do not hesitate to get in touch for any assistance.

Sincerely,
Prof. Laurentiu Olău
Millennial Asia
martonnga@iupui.edu
Dear Prof. Stil Masilan,

I attach the proof of your article which is to be published in *Millennials Asia*.

It is SAGE's aim to publish your work as quickly as possible. Could you therefore please read, correct and return the proof to me within 5 working days. This proof represents your final opportunity to review your article prior to its publication, so please read through this information carefully.

Please return corrections to me by email, ideally by uploading the PDF (new guidelines on the first page of your proof). This is the method that is currently the fastest and most reliable for transmitting your corrections to the book editor. If you are unable to do this, please email your changes in the form of a text file containing page numbers, paragraph and line in which the correction has to be made.

This proof has been lightly edited for grammar and style, and should be accurate in respect of the copy supplied.

Please read the proof for errors or missing elements. However, please do not revise or make other major changes affecting layout or the final extent.

Any similar figures have been reproduced for the online version only. Colour printing in the journal can be arranged for a charge. Please contact me for further details.

*Colors in publication*:

We will publish the corrected, final article online (OnlineFirst) as soon as possible, paginated from 1 as normal. As soon as this happens you will be sent an email enabling you to access it.

*Images in publication*:

After publishing OnlineFirst we will include your article in advance for publication online and print. These details are not yet fixed, but please note that we will make no further updates except from adding volume, issue and page numbers. Therefore, please be sure to send all of your corrections now.

To receive notification of when your article and of any new journal content is published, sign up to our Contents Alert service at http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/contalerts.
Re: Page proofs for MLA 1039730 for review

Bill Maudlin <bill.maudlin@sbu.ac.uk>  Tue, Aug 17, 10:42 PM

Dear Dr. Si,

Thank you for your time and kind consideration. I have reviewed your paper, and it is correct, for your queries I respond to it with a separate file attachment.

I hope you can publish it easily.

Regards,

On Tue, Aug 17, 2021, at 4:18 PM Richa Divan <richa.divan@seas.ac.in> wrote:

Dear Prof. Si,

I attach the proof of your article which is to be published in <www.journal.com>

It is 93% OK to publish your work as quickly as possible. Could you therefore please read, correct and return this proof to me within 5 working days. This proof represents your final opportunity to review your article prior to its publication, so please read through this information carefully.

Please return corrections to me by email, ideally by annotating the PDF (see guidelines as the first page of your proof). This is the method that is currently the fastest and most reliable for transmitting your corrections to the typesetter. If you are unable to do this, please email your changes in the form of a list (including page number, paragraph and line in which the correction has to be made).

This proof has been lightly edited for grammar and style and should be accurate in respect of the copy supplied.

Please read the proof for prose or missing elements, however, please do not request or make any other major changes affecting layout or the final effect.

As you have noted, the table has been added, and some colour figures have been incorporated for the online version only. Colour printing in the journal can be arranged for a charge. Please contact me for further details.

Richa Divan
richa.divan@seas.ac.in

On Wed, Aug 18, 2021 at 8:27 PM Richa Divan <richa.divan@seas.ac.in> wrote:

Dear Dr. Si,

Thank you for your time and kind consideration. I have reviewed your paper, and it is correct, for your queries I respond to it with a separate file attachment.

I hope you can publish it easily.

Regards,

On Tue, Aug 17, 2021, at 4:18 PM Richa Divan <richa.divan@seas.ac.in> wrote:

Dear Prof. Si,

I attach the proof of your article which is to be published in <www.journal.com>

It is 93% OK to publish your work as quickly as possible. Could you therefore please read, correct and return this proof to me within 5 working days. This proof represents your final opportunity to review your article prior to its publication, so please read through this information carefully.

Please return corrections to me by email, ideally by annotating the PDF (see guidelines as the first page of your proof). This is the method that is currently the fastest and most reliable for transmitting your corrections to the typesetter. If you are unable to do this, please email your changes in the form of a list (including page number, paragraph and line in which the correction has to be made).

This proof has been lightly edited for grammar and style and should be accurate in respect of the copy supplied.

Please read the proof for prose or missing elements, however, please do not request or make any other major changes affecting layout or the final effect.

As you have noted, the table has been added, and some colour figures have been incorporated for the online version only. Colour printing in the journal can be arranged for a charge. Please contact me for further details.

Richa Divan
richa.divan@seas.ac.in

On Wed, Aug 18, 2021 at 8:27 PM Richa Divan <richa.divan@seas.ac.in> wrote:

Dear Dr. Si,

Thank you for your time and kind consideration. I have reviewed your paper, and it is correct, for your queries I respond to it with a separate file attachment.

I hope you can publish it easily.

Regards,

On Tue, Aug 17, 2021, at 4:18 PM Richa Divan <richa.divan@seas.ac.in> wrote:

Dear Prof. Si,

I attach the proof of your article which is to be published in <www.journal.com>

It is 93% OK to publish your work as quickly as possible. Could you therefore please read, correct and return this proof to me within 5 working days. This proof represents your final opportunity to review your article prior to its publication, so please read through this information carefully.

Please return corrections to me by email, ideally by annotating the PDF (see guidelines as the first page of your proof). This is the method that is currently the fastest and most reliable for transmitting your corrections to the typesetter. If you are unable to do this, please email your changes in the form of a list (including page number, paragraph and line in which the correction has to be made).

This proof has been lightly edited for grammar and style and should be accurate in respect of the copy supplied.

Please read the proof for prose or missing elements, however, please do not request or make any other major changes affecting layout or the final effect.

As you have noted, the table has been added, and some colour figures have been incorporated for the online version only. Colour printing in the journal can be arranged for a charge. Please contact me for further details.

Richa Divan
richa.divan@seas.ac.in
RE: MLA: Information regarding your article

Richa Dhan
richa.dhan@sapscod.in

Please find attached for your record here.

I’ve also pasted the re-use policy below:

You may use the Final Published PDF (or Original Submission or Accepted Manuscript, if preferred) in the following ways:

- In relation to your own teaching, provided that any electronic distribution maintains machine-readable access
- To share on an individual basis with research colleagues, provided that such sharing is not for commercial purposes
- In your dissertation or thesis, regardless where the dissertation or thesis will be posted in any electronic Institutional Repository or database
- In a book authored or edited by you, at any time after the Contributor’s publication in the journal.

Provided that:

- The journal as the original publication of your Contribution is appropriately credited by including the full citation information.
- You acknowledge SAGE as the original publisher of your work, and if you are a Member, you shall pay the Member benefit fee indicated on the SAGE Membership Agreement.
- You notify SAGE of the name and location of the repository or archive to which your work will be submitted.
- You agree to the embargo period as set by SAGE for journal contributions submitted after the embargo period.

You may not post the Final Published PDF on any unembargoed websites or repository without permission from SAGE.

Finally, SAGE offers a range of support options for authors, including access to writing tools and help with publishing. If you have any questions or require assistance, please contact us at authorsupport@sagepub.com.
Response to Reviewer

Reviewer 1
Reviewer 1 comments
This paper spread over 36 pages (double space) does address to the issue of domestic violence in Indonesia which is no different from the rest of the countries, developed or developing. It tends to look at the power relations between husbands and wives often referred to as ‘men and women’ in the two major arenas of a household, namely the socio-economic and the division of labour. The study concludes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Reviewer comments</th>
<th>Author response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>This proposition shows that men and women who have equal or higher socioeconomic status than their partners tend to experience violence. In other words, one with increased (sic) economic status and income is more vulnerable to experiencing domestic violence. This not only applies to women but also to men. In other words, violence is not only experienced by people who have lower status and income than their partner. Violence also does not look at (sic) certain sexes.</td>
<td>Studies conducted in dual-career families in which the husband or wife are victims of domestic violence show a unique power relationship. In a dual-career family, when a woman or man who is a victim of domestic violence increases her/his position in the workplace and her/his income increases, it actually makes her/his partner feel even more insecure. The perpetrator who feels insecure wants to show her/his power by committing violence against her/his partner. The perpetrator feels insecure because she/he is afraid that her/his partner will leave her/him and she/he is afraid of losing her/his “power” in the family.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>There is no novelty on these findings except that the highlighted statement is not substantiated from the data based on 44 subject informants. How those with higher ‘economic status and income’ are more vulnerable than those with lower status? Greater vulnerability seems doubtful. It could be so equally makes sense. Such conclusions are better drawn from the larger sample than the case studies.</td>
<td>In this context, when the victim of violence increases in income and has a better career, the victim will be more independent and no longer dependent on her/his partner. In addition, the independence and success of the victim in the job creates jealousy of the perpetrator so that the perpetrator of violence feels insecure and commits violence as an effort to &quot;discipline the victim&quot; and in order to &quot;control&quot; her/his partner. Conclusions from this study has been revised (page 21).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>References to Foucault and Connell are absolutely out of place and hardly bear any connection with the findings. Foucault is a big name in power theory but simply outlining his basic writings do not connect with the findings. If all material on these thinkers, predominantly Foucault since Connell is mentioned in a small paragraph</td>
<td>This study removed Foucault’s theory and uses Connell’s theory on power and gender. Connell (1987) argues that power enters through norms. In families, particularly, power enters through norms shaped from interactions between the family members. Parents teach their children on becoming good men and women through socialization based on the</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
only, is deleted it would make no difference to the text and the conclusions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>only, is deleted it would make no difference to the text and the conclusions.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>norms of the society. This norms-imbued socialization practices later become a discourse. Such discourse shapes the power relations between men and women, to a point that man-to-woman violence is justified and considered legal. Men commit violence against women to strengthen their power. The society, then, reinforces such practices by requiring men and women to perform their roles according to the socialized norms. (Page 18-20).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author has revised conclusions in this paper. This study reveals the power relation between husbands and wives in dual-career families – families with both husband and wife having professional careers – in which domestic violence occurs. This study finds three (3) types of power relation between the husbands and the wives in dual-career families who experience domestic violence. First is the male-dominated family: a family dominated by men, where men are the perpetrators of violence and women are the victims. Second is the female-dominated family, which, as the name suggests, is dominated by women. In this type of family, women are the perpetrators of violence and men become the victims. Women commit violence against men as an effort to gain power so that they can “control” the men. Third is the alternating family. It is a family where the roles of husband and wife shift and alternate. In this type of family, the dominant position alternates from men to women, and vice versa. This alternating family originates from continuous domestic violence against women which gets worse over time. Violence that recurs in various forms, namely verbal/psychological, physical, economic, and sexual eventually raises women's awareness that they are victims and, in the end, fosters resistance. The alternating family, which resulted from women's resistance, is able to change the structure of the family. It creates a new structure where there is no hierarchy of positions between women and men. The structural change will create an equal and ideal family. (Page 21).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Moreover, Foucauldian method would like to look into the power relations between husbands and wives as discursive formations. The discourse of power relations emerging from patriarchy and pre-modern structures need be worked out and subtle linkages between them have to be brought forth to make visible the application of Foucault’s method and approach. That is why two sections on Foucault and the findings are lying separately. The discourse of patriarchy has been affected by the discourse of different shades of feminism and gender equality in democracy. Such connections need to be worked out to make sense of the application of Foucault’s power theory. Moreover, gender relations in a family are more complex that concern not only some domains only as projected by the author. How diffused power manifests at different levels in different ways in social situations has to be delineated to understand the power relations between husbands and wives in Foucault’s terms. I feel the paper would make better sense if references to Foucault are deleted. The author misconceivingly claims to further the power theory of Foucault through this research. Author agrees with the reviewer’s suggestion to remove Foucault. The writer uses the gender and power theory proposed by Connell.

In Javanese society, patriarchal culture has regulated power relations between men and women and has become the dominant discourse which is socialized from an early age through various social institutions in society. The independence of women cannot be separated from their roles as mothers and wives, women are considered to be complete social and cultural creatures if they have played that role properly.

The gender ideology that exists in Javanese society has undergone redefinition. Even though it has undergone a transformation, the essence of some of the values contained in this ideology still exists in Javanese society until now. The ideology of familialism or ibuism covers social, economic, political and cultural life. This ideology positions women as beings who are full of love and always make sacrifices for the sake of their family.

The imbalance of gender relations between men and women is also influenced by religious interpretations that place the inequality between men and women as a “nature” that must be accepted.

What and how the roles of men and women and the power relations between them have been regulated and influenced by the patriarchal discourse.

The concept of power in a patriarchal culture places men as parties who are superior to women. Men reflect this power to women, in the context of the family, namely husband to wife. Whatever the husband does is considered normal, and is considered as an attempt to discipline his wife even though by means of violence.

What and how the roles of men and women and the power relations between them have been regulated and influenced by the patriarchal discourse. The concept of power in a patriarchal culture places men as parties who are superior to women. Men reflect this power to women, in the context of the family, namely husband to wife. Whatever the husband does is considered normal, and is considered as an
attempt to discipline his wife even though by means of violence. Even though women have high education and have good careers, the patriarchal ideology is still strong and affects the power relations of husband and wife in the family. In the workplace, wives get equality in terms of position in work, but when they return home, women still have to obey to the “ruler”, namely men.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>There is lot of repetition in the paper which enhances its length for nothing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The language too is loose, and gulabi (Chopy) I would say. Much is to be done in this regard.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 7 | Connell is referred to as another thinker along with Foucault but any reference to it is missing. | Reference of Raewyn Connell has been added to the text and references. Connell, R.W. (1987). *Gender & Power. Society, the Person and Sexual Politics*. Great Britain by Page Bros (Norwich) Ltd. Polity Press. 

Connell argues that power enters through norms. In the family, power enters through the norms of the interactions that occur between family members. Parents socialize to children how to be good men and women based on the norms that develop in society. Discourse in society has shaped power relations between men and women. Violence is considered as something legal. Men commit violence against women to strengthen their power. Society requires men and women to carry out roles as socialized norms. 

At the present time, women have been given the same opportunities as men in the fields of education and work. However, society's perception of women has not changed significantly. Women are still seen as the second sex. At home, women are still "oppressed". This view does not only exist in ordinary people, but also among intellectuals. Sometimes, women who are victims of domestic violence actually blame themselves for the occurrence of domestic violence. Women consider themselves guilty of not being able to be good wives and mothers. |
Reviewer 2
I have gone through the typed script of the paper thoroughly, as a review exercise for the Sage journal Millennial Asia. Let me first take an analytical view of the article. As the title indicates the paper is based on two empirical variables, such as, Power Relations of husbands and wives and Domestic Violence.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Reviewer comments</th>
<th>Author response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The paper is conceived on the assumed correlation between the two variables. And although not explicitly stated, but it is understood from the analytical framework of the paper that Power relations of spouses is determined / shaped by the Domestic violence they experience.</td>
<td>This study reveals the power relationship between husband and wife in a dual-career family, a family where both husband and wife work and have professional careers who experience domestic violence. This study finds three (3) types of power relations between husbands and wives in dual career families who experience domestic violence, namely: 1. Male-dominated family, is a family dominated by men, in which men are the perpetrators of violence. 2. Female-dominated family, is a family dominated by women, where women are the perpetrators of violence and men are victims. 3. Alternating Family, a family where the roles of husband and wife can change. In this type of family, men and women become perpetrators and victims of domestic violence alternately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>However, the Power relations (three types) as the dependent variable (effects) is assumed to be resultant of Domestic Violence, the independent variable (cause). But if the phenomenon of Power Relations is studied and articulated based on the empirical data (study), no empirical study and no articulation is made about the Domestic violence. Apparently, no data have been collected on Domestic violence. Hence no data are presented, and no articulations are made about Domestic violence among spouses. Thus, there is no variable based causal analysis (which could be either Qualitative or Quantitative). So no causality could be attributed to the effect. However, if it assumed to be an ex-post facto study where</td>
<td>Author has added primary data about Domestic Violence among Dual Career Families in the manuscript on table 1 (page 7). Data obtained in Table 1 show that no victim has experienced a single violence. Victims of domestic violence experience more than one form of violence. Forms of violence in a dual career family, namely: physical, psychological, economic and sexual violence. Secondary data from The National Commisions on Violence Against Women of The Republic of Indonesia 2019 as shown on Diagram 1 and Diagram 2 (below on this file). Author has remove Foucault’s theory and uses Connell’s theory as shown on page 18-20.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Further the paper seems to be plagued by both theoretical and methodological problems. Hence it becomes very essential to examine the paper both theoretically and methodologically.</td>
<td>This study uses qualitative research methods. Data were collected from victims and perpetrators of domestic violence, both men and women who have professional careers. Data obtained through in-depth interviews with informants. Data from subject informants was also supported by data triangulation. The data obtained were categorized, then abstracted, analyzed, and discussed, supported by theory and relevant previous studies. The research method has been revised (page 5-6). This study uses Raewyn Connell's theory of gender and power. The data findings in this study were analyzed and discussed with previous studies and Connell's theory of gender and power (page 18-20).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The author claims that the paper is based on M Foucault’s theory of Power Relations but did not explicate the theory to contextualize the same. It is neither clearly defined in the paper nor it is shown as to how it is contextualized. And strangely the author admits that Foucault did not use Power relations theory in the context of family (p.27). However, it is assumed that the author has deployed the Power relations theory to this study through an inference and has articulated the three types of power relations, i.e, male dominated family, female dominated family and Alternating family.</td>
<td>The author revises the theory used and uses Connell's (1987) theory of gender and power. Connell argues that power enters through norms. In the family, power enters through the norms of the interactions that occur between family members. Parents socialize to children how to be good men and women based on the norms that develop in society which then becomes a discourse. Discourse in society has shaped power relations between men and women (page 18-20).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>But sadly the author does not produce any empirical data to back up these formulations. Even the qualitative data are not shown to back up these formulations (at least in terms of frequencies). Further the indicators of three types of formulations have not been spelled out clearly. As explicated in in Table 1 and Table 2,(p.15 and p.16) these often overlap instead of being exclusive types. Of the three types of</td>
<td>This study was conducted using qualitative methods. Qualitative studies place more emphasis on the richness, depth, and uniqueness of data. The author does not make indicators that are generally used in research using quantitative methods. However, data variation is something that is of importance in qualitative studies. In this study, the data presented is data from in-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
formulated families, it is the Female-dominated type which is better operationalized with clear indicators. The other two remain somewhat vague/unclear with unclear/overlapping indicators. The depth interviews with informants that have been obtained from the field. The collected data is then processed, categorized and analyzed, discussed as a qualitative research method. Data is abstracted in sociological concepts to show novelty and scholarship in the study of family sociology. The data presented is data obtained from the field based on the results of in-depth interviews with informants. The data that has been obtained are then categorized according to three categories, namely Male-Dominated Family (MDF), Female-Dominated Family (FDF) and Alternating Family (AF). Data variations in each category are variations obtained from the field. This study is a family sociology study, so that the categorized data are abstracted based on sociological concepts. In the male-dominated family (MDF) and alternating family (AF) categories, there is no overlap. Alternating family is a type of family that originated from the MDF, where the repeated violence experienced by women over time raises awareness and ultimately fosters resistance from victims, so that the dominant role of husband and wife in the family changes.

| 6 | That apart a contradiction emerges out of this is that: how in an Islamic society (of dual career families) a female-dominated family type has emerged and sustained? Even if it emerged, it is not said, which sex is the perpetrator of the violence and which sex is the victim there. Further it does not provide any data to show, what kind of violence it is (physical or emotional/mental) and what is the frequency/magnitude of this violence? |

In a female-dominated family, where families are dominated by women and men are victims of domestic violence, the patriarchal ideology that has been socialized to individuals through various social institutions in society places men as the main sex and women as the second sex.

In FDF, when a man becomes a victim of domestic violence, he does not dare to leave the cycle of violence. Men prefer to survive and tend to hide the violence they experience. He did not want his wife's domestic violence to be known to others. If the domestic violence he experienced was discovered by others, he would be ashamed and would show his weakness as a man. In Javanese and Muslim societies, men are considered as family leaders who must be...
obeyed and respected. Masculinity requires men to behave masculine. Men must be able to be good family leaders. When a man becomes a victim of domestic violence, it will be so embarrassing for him that he chooses to remain silent. Violence experienced by men actually shows their inability to lead the family. In addition, men chose to stay in marriage because they were "shackled" by the discourse that developed in Javanese society where marriage had to be maintained no matter what. Divorce is considered a disgrace and will affect the reputation of the extended family.

In Javanese society, marriage does not only concern two individuals but also two large families, so the decision to divorce is sometimes not just an individual decision, but a family decision.

In a female-dominated family, women who become perpetrators of domestic violence because they feel insecure and are afraid of being abandoned by their partners because their husbands have a higher level of education and income than them, women try to tie their husbands firmly so that they are “not out of their grasp”. Women want to be the dominant party to gain power in the family so that they are not abandoned by their husbands. Men tend to tolerate violence they experience because in fact they are also depressed by the patriarchy which requires them to always win over women.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7</th>
<th>Similarly, in the first category; Male-dominated-family type, based on a cultural stereotype that the wife-woman is subjugated and invariably the husband/man is the perpetrator of violence. No data are being provided as to what is the frequency/magnitude of the violence and what is the kind of violence practiced (physical/emotional or psychological).</th>
<th>Author has added primary data of domestic violence among dual career family on table 1 (page 7). Data obtained in Table 1 show that no victim has experienced a single violence. Victims of domestic violence experience more than one form of violence. Forms of violence in a dual career family, namely: physical, psychological, economic and sexual violence.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Similar is the case of the third category, Alternating families (should have been Alternating gender dominating families). It seems that Foucault’s theory is applicable only to the first and third category families;</td>
<td>Author has revised the theory, removed Foucault’s theory. This study uses Connell’s theory on gender and power to reveal power relations between husbands and wives in dual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
because to Foucault (p.29), ‘power is dynamic and there are times when role dominations change….power mechanism is exercised, practiced, accepted and then legitimized’ (p.7), because power relations appear in every interaction including interactions between husbands and wives….’. The second category remains out of bound of Foucault’s theory. Thus the findings have a limited a theoretical basis although claimed to be comprehensive and sans backup data.

| 9 | The methodological issues that plague this paper are mainly two: (i) Non-display of data. In the tables 1 and 2, the author gives only formulations that are claimed to be data based and are not data themselves. Surprisingly data are driven underground. On both the variables like, Power relations and Domestic violence no frequency/measured data are presented. (ii) The other methodological issue involves the use of Triangulation method, which is not used in the right sense. |
| 10 | Besides the paper has a serious language issue. Its English requires standardization. And it has an unusually lengthy reference section spread over seven /07 pages |

Research method in this paper has been revised. Primary data of domestic violence among dual-career family has been added on page 7. Triangulation of data, from supporting informant: family member, neighbour, friend/colleague, is shown on the page 17-18. Secondary data about perpetrators and victims of domestic violence in Indonesia as stated on diagram 1 and diagram 2 (below this file).
Table 1. Domestic Violence among Dual-Career Families

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Violence</th>
<th>Male-Dominated Family (N=16)</th>
<th>Female-Dominated Family (N=16)</th>
<th>Alternating Family (N=12)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ya</td>
<td>Tidak</td>
<td>Ya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Violence</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(56,25%)</td>
<td>(43,75%)</td>
<td>(12,5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological violence</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(100%)</td>
<td>(0%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economical Violence</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(100%)</td>
<td>(0%)</td>
<td>(93,75%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual Violence</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(12,5%)</td>
<td>(87,5%)</td>
<td>(25%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Jumlah

Source: Primary Data

Secondary Data on Domestic Violence

Diagram 1. Education of Victims and Perpetrators Based on Direct Complaints to The National Commisions on Violence Against Women of The Republic of Indonesia
Data from The National Commisions on Violence Against Women of The Republic of Indonesia shows that the perpetrators and victims of violence come from various levels of education. Based on direct complaints to National Commisions on Violence Against Women of Republic Indonesia, education for the perpetrators and victims of violence identified were mostly high school graduates, secondly from universities. There are many perpetrators and victims whose education is not identified because they do not report the details of the education of both perpetrators and victims. These data show that violence is not only committed or experienced by those with low education. Many of those who have higher education are also perpetrators and victims.

Diagram 2. Profession of Victims and Perpetrators Based on Direct Complaints to The National Commisions on Violence Against Women of The Republic of Indonesia

Source: The National Commisions on Violence Against Women of Republic of Indonesia 2019

Data from National Commisions on Violence Against Women of The Republic of Indonesia shows that the identified perpetrators of domestic violence include: private employees, entrepreneurs, unemployed, TNI/Polri, farmers, civil servants, teachers and others. Judging from their work, victims of domestic violence include housewives, students, entrepreneurs, private employees, civil servants, teachers, TNI/Polri. This data shows that domestic violence can occur in various sectors of work and education.

This reality shows that there is a paradox between discourse (both that develops in society and that which is carried out by the state through law) and what is happening in reality, where not all families are as idealized. In a family that is ideally a safe and comfortable place for its members, domestic violence occurs, including in dual career families which are considered to be ideal families by society. This is a very interesting matter to reveal, because it turns out that in dual career families there is also violence.