

CHAPTER II

LITERATURE REVIEW

In this chapter, the writer wants to explain the theory applied to analyze fans' work of fiction which contains Sungmin's character as female in Super Junior genderswitch fan fiction. The focus of this study is to find out how the fans describe Sungmin, who is male, into female character in genderswitch fan fiction and the trace of his masculinity in the female character. Thus, the writer uses three theories for the analysis. The first is Jenkins' theory of ten ways to rewrite television show as the method of data analysis. Second, the writer use Korean masculinity by Sun Jung in order to reveal the male characteristic of Sungmin. Last, the writer use Korean women theory by Elizabeth Choi and Marian Palley to reveal the female characteristic of Sungmin in genderswitch fan fiction.

2.1 Theoretical Framework

2.1.1 Henry Jenkins: Textual Poachers and Ten Ways to Rewrite Television Show

In his idea of practices of everyday life, de Certeau said that in the practices of everyday life, there are tactics deployed by consumers within the formal 'strategies' of powerful institution (Laughey, 2007 p. 173). The example of everyday tactics is the act of reading as poaching. It means that readers can read a text and free to make their own meaning from the text. It is like de Certeau said:

“Far from being writers...readers are travelers; they move across lands belonging to someone else, like nomads poaching their way across fields they did not write, despoiling the wealth of Egypt to enjoy it themselves.” (1984, cited in Jenkins, 1992)

In this case, then, readers who are making their own meaning of a text are called ‘nomads’ or traveler. They read some texts and make their own meaning from the text they have read.

Jenkins agrees with de Certeau that ‘readers are nomadic and freely move from one text to another without permanently become immersed by in any particular text.’ (Laughey, 2007 p. 177). It means that fans can construct the meaning of a text by themselves. The only difference between de Certeau and Jenkins’ perspective is about fans interaction towards each other. Jenkins said that fans interact to each other by some media, such as fanzines, social events, and even in annual conferences while de Certeau said the opposite, that fans are isolated from each other. In Jenkins’s opinion, fans are creative and productive (Laughey 2007, p. 177). They are not taking the text as how it is, nevertheless they have imagined to explore the text with their own version. In order to prove that fans, are also productive by producing something. One of them is fan fiction, then, Jenkins forms ten ways to rewrite a television show:

a. Recontextualization

This kind of stories is based on certain scenes from a show mixed with the fans’ own idea about the scene which mostly focuses on the off-screen actions that motivate on-screen behavior (Jenkins 1992, p. 65).

b. Expanding the Series Timeline

This is different from recontextualization because in this way, the fans, as an author, write the background of the character of a series. They expand the story timeline by adding a story about the characters' background based on their imagination (Jenkins 1992, p. 166-167).

c. Refocalization

Most fan fictions focus on the protagonist character of a series, yet in refocalization, the focus character is the character that has fewer scenes than the main character. In this way of rewriting TV show, refocalization tells a story about the secondary character, the one who has limited scene, and often the character is woman. (Jenkins 1992, p. 169)

d. Moral Realignment

In this way of writing, fans usually change the villains character into protagonist or change the point of view of the story become the villain's point of view. (Jenkins 1992, p. 171-172) For example in the Star Wars fan fiction, Darth Vader character describes as protagonist one. The story goes from Darth Vader's point of view. While in other fan fiction, Darth Vader character is still as the villain, yet the story is written from Darth Vader perspective. This kind of fan fiction, as the writer search in asianfanfics.com, is rarely found, especially when it comes to gender switch fan fiction.

e. Genre Shifting

Fan fiction usually tells different story from the original episodes. Jenkins says that ‘fan stories shift the balance between plot action and characterization, placing primary emphasis upon moments that define the character relationship rather than using such moments as background or motivation for the dominant plot.’ (p. 173)

Different from the previous ways which tells that fan fiction is written based on the story in the television show, in genre shifting, the focus is in the characters’ relationship rather than the plot. The story which is written in genre shifting way can create different story plot from the original plot because of the changing genre. This kind of fan fiction usually explores more about the romantic side between the main characters in the story. In the case of gender switch fan fiction, it is possible to write this kind of fan fiction because the author only puts the name of the characters from television show and explores the romantic side or the relationship between the characters based on their own idea.

f. Cross Over

“Cross-over” break down not only the boundaries between texts but also between genres, suggesting how familiar characters might function in radically different environment. (p. 175)

In cross-over, the story plot or setting is still the same as the original. Nevertheless, it is only the characters from two different stories are combined together in one story plot. The genre of the story is still the same, yet the characters of the story are combination

between the characters from the original story and other characters from other story.

g. Character Dislocation

This way of writing is also known as “alternative universe” fan fiction. This kind of fan fiction put the character from story A to the situation in story B. In other words, this kind of fan fiction usually has different story from the original. The original story is overhauled and creates different story line as the result. From all fan fiction that the writer used to read, mostly use this way to write a fan fiction, where the authors are free to explore their ideas and write the fan fiction either based on certain story plot from a television show or mixed with their original idea.

h. Personalization

This is also known as “self-insertion” fan fiction. In this kind of story, there is a fictional character which represents the author character and interacts with other character in the story. This kind of fan fiction mostly uses an original character or fictional character made by the author as the main character in the fan fiction, together with the idols. The characterization of this original or fictional character either reflection of the author’s self or a character made based on the author’s idea.

i. Emotional Intensification

One of the examples of this kind of fan fiction is “Hurt-Comfort” genre. In the story, the author will focus on the dramatic

situation where the character undergoes a difficult situation, and write the detail about how the character's feeling when he or she puts in that situation.

j. Eroticization

“Fan writers, freed of the restraint of network censors, often want to explore the erotic dimension of the characters' lives.” (Jenkins 1992, p. 180)

This way to rewrite television show allows the fans, as an author, to explore the sexuality things or sexual experimentation of the characters because of ambiguous relationship between two characters. Sexuality in fan stories is mostly as a way of resolving ongoing conflicts or makes the strong relationship between two characters become stronger. Nevertheless, fans, as an author, can 'play' by making different pair from the common pair in other fan fiction or the original story. The example of this kind of fan fiction is yaoi/slash fan fiction, a fiction story which explores more about the relationship between two main characters that have the same sex, male. The main point is that this kind of fan fiction usually explores more about erotic story between two characters both are male, such as the story of them as a lover.

From those ten ways, the writer tries to find out which way that usually genderswitch fan fiction is written and how the author constructs the gender of Lee Sungmin as a female, while in real life Sungmin is a male. Nevertheless, in this study, the writer is not going to use ten, but only two which is character dislocation and genre shifting. To distinguish the

character of Sungmin as male and female, the theory of Korean masculinity and Korean women used in this study as supporting theory.

2.1.2 Sun Jung: Korean Masculinity

The Korean masculinity, as Sun Jung in his book, *Korean Masculinities and Transcultural Consumption: Yonsama, Rain, Oldboy, K-Pop Idols*, he divides Korean masculinity into four: soft masculinity, global masculinity, postmodern masculinity, and manufactured versatile masculinity.

The first is “soft” masculinity which introduced by Bae Yong Joon (BYJ) from his character as Joon Sang in Korean drama, *Winter Sonata* (2004). There are three key aspects of BYJ’s bodily performance that reinforce his soft masculinity. They are “tender charisma”, purity, and politeness.

The tender charisma is shown by the way Joon Sang treats his lover, Yoo Jin, in the first place. As Sun Jung said, this is considered as well-mannered gentleman image. Moreover, Joon Sang is able to sacrifice his own welfare for Yoo Jin’s sake. This is showed in the episode where he encourages his lover, Yoo Jin, to visit Sang Hyeok in the hospital.

Afterwards, the second point of soft masculinity is about the purity. The purity refers to the portrayal of “first love” between Joon Sang and Yoo Jin. In the drama, there is no sexual scene such as sex scene. Therefore, it shows the pure and innocent love between them (p. 48). Another example of purity is the innocent and surprised look of Joon Sang when he received a kiss on the cheek from Yoo Jin. As Sun Jung said, the innocent look

performed by BYJ through his role as Joon Sang encodes the innocent purity of a high school boy's first kiss and reinforces the soft masculinity of BYJ (p. 49).

The third point is politeness. The politeness in this case showed through well-mannered and thoughtful character. In his role as Joon Sang, the way he cares about Yoo Jin shows his well-mannered and thoughtful character (p. 51). The well-mannered and thoughtful character shows in Joon Sang that he usually puts his lover, Yoo Jin, first. In the page 47 of his book, he quoted transcription of the dialogue between Joon Sang and Yoo Jin when they visit Sang Hyeok in hospital. Joon Sang sacrifice his own happiness, he lets Yoo Jin goes to Sang Hyeok who is longing for Yoo Jin who had separated from Sang Hyeok to be with him. He encourages Yoo Jin to see Sang Hyeok.

In addition, the soft masculinity is also influenced by Japanese *shoujo manga* (*sunjeong manhwa* in Korean term) character which usually appears in Japanese comics. The Korean term of pretty boy is *kkonminam*, which generally refers to men who are pretty looking, who have smooth fair skin, silky hair, and a feminine manner. The pretty boy character of *shoujo manga* and *sunjeong manhwa* shares the same features, such as a boy with tall and long legs, have slim feminine face, long and/or wavy hair, and sweet smile (p.54).

Thus, other masculinity in Korea called global masculinity. This masculinity represented by Rain. Brian Walsh (cited in Jung 2011, p. 73) stated that Rain is a performer with an angelic face, killer bod, and Justin

Timberlake-like dance moves and he is the one who has ridden the crest of *Hallyu* (Korean Wave), the Asia-wide obsession from that country's pop culture.

In his article, Walsh (2006, cited in Jung 2011 p. 74) describes three levels of transculturation to Rain as the face of pop globalism. First is through the glocalization process. In this process, Rain is a popular South Korean cultural product which is influenced by Western (American) pop culture. The second level of transculturation is regionalization. Rain is a regional star in Asia who becomes popular by the new technology turn-out. The third is globalization. In his article, Walsh describes how Rain, a popular culture star from the "rest" or the non-Western, entered the center or the West. Sun Jung concludes, from the transculturations above, those 'have enabled to become culturally hybridized, to move freely across the borders, and to become a popular regional icon throughout Asia.

The third masculinity named postmodern masculinity. This masculinity represented by a character, Oh Dae Soo, from a South Korean action thriller movie, *Oldboy*. Dae Soo character in this movie described as totally savage but cool (Jung 2011, p. 120). Sun Jung also states that this movie was popular because in IMDb.com, this movie ranked 118 of top 250 films. It is considered as high ranking because IMDb.com is a website which users are from English-speaking countries or he called Westerners (p. 119). Among the Western fans of this movie, Dae Soo character brings new image of Korean male character. The fans are attracted to the savage but cool character of Dae Soo. He argues that this Western affection towards

Dae Soo character, particularly about the response to Dae Soo's savageness, can be considered as commodification of Otherness which explained by bell hooks in *Black Looks*. Hooks (1992, cited in Jung 2011, p. 120) argues that the consumption of Otherness offers intense enjoyment that mainstream white cultures often taboo, as the following:

Cultural taboos around sexuality and desire are transgressed and made explicit as the media bombards folks with a message of difference no longer based on the white supremacist assumption that "blondes have more fun." The "real fun" is to be had by bringing to the surface all those "nasty" unconscious fantasies and longing about contact with the Other embedded in the secret (not so secret) deep structure of white supremacy. (1992, cited in Jung 2011, p. 120)

It means that Dae Soo's savageness is considered as primitive Other in Orientalist notions. The West's "nasty" unconscious fantasies are the evidence that they are longing for primitive Otherness. While the cool character of Dae Soo identified by youthful rule breaking. That is as Susan Fraiman states (2003, cited in Jung 2011, p. 121) that "the cool subject identifies with an emergent, precarious masculinity produced in large part by youthful rule breaking." Further, Fraiman defines the "male coolness" as the modern adolescent boy's alienation from the maternal, the presence of maternal love implies rigid domesticity and considered as "uncool."

It means that the coolness of a man can be shown if the man isolated from home and family which are identified as "the mother." In other word, male coolness is anti-maternal. It is related to the savage character. The savage people are isolated or far from their home and family that make them look lonely and they also show transgression because they live like they have no rule (p. 121). Related to Dae Soo's character, in this movie he is imprisoned for fifteen years and during the isolation he becomes the vicious

fighting machine and a “cool” man. However, the concept of postmodern masculinity which represented by Dae Soo is “totally savage but cool” man.

The last is manufactured versatile masculinity represented by 2PM. In his book, Sun Jung also said that in Korean boy band masculinity, before 2PM, the masculinity is not categorized as manufactured versatile masculinity because those boy bands, such as Super Junior and TVXQ still have the pretty boy image for at least one member in the group.

‘Unlike the pre-existing Korean idol boy bands — e.g., SS501, TVXQ, SHINee, Super Junior — who practically emphasize their pretty boy (*kkonminam*) features, 2PM, from beginning, claims to be a tough, manly, and beast-like idol group.’ (Jung 2011, p. 164)

Basically, manufactured versatile masculinity portrayed by 2PM is masculinity where the man looks strong, powerful, with their well-built body. In the case of 2PM, they are not only able to show their masculine side on their stage performances, but also they can show their feminine side through covering the cute dance of a girl band and do *aegyo* (cute act).

From the review above, it is clear that according to Sun Jung, Super Junior is not categorized as manufactured versatile masculinity. Concluding from his explanation about manufactured versatile masculinity, this kind of masculinity shows the strong masculine image to the idol. Nevertheless, the masculine look is their main image as an idol. Because as it said on Sun Jung’s book, 2PM also do cross-dress and perform cute dances of girl group (165). That activity is built up or manufactured for showing their hybrid masculinity, that they can show their soft masculinity either. In addition, because of their manufactured skill in performing cross-dress and cute

dances of girl bands, that is why it is called manufactured versatile masculinity.

2.1.3 Korean Women

The female character of Sungmin in Super Junior genderswitch fan fiction identified by Korean women representation which formed by Elizabeth Choi in her essay, *Status of The Family and Motherhood for Korean Women* in a book *Women in Japan and Korea: Continuity and Change* edited by Gelb and Palley. Elizabeth (1994, p. 191) states that China's cultural heritage has strong influence to Korean women's lives. Confucian philosophy, which is from Chinese, divided human relationship based on age, sex, and inherited social status. In this situation, women used to be exploited and deprived.

That men are superior in all aspects is naturally known by Korean people (p. 191). It means that the traditional value still exists. In the traditional era, women territory is inside the house, while the outside world belongs to men. She states that ideal woman is passive, quiet, and chaste (p. 191). This ideal woman is expected to be an obedient daughter-in-law, devoted wife, and dedicated mother (p. 191). This image of ideal women is still strongly believed in Korean society. Even in the post 1945, the situation is still the same. It means, even though men and women have equal opportunities in employment matter, women still have to work at home and work. The tradition remains strong (p. 193). Elizabeth's opinion is supported by Marian Lief Palley. In her essay she states that:

‘...Confucian moral code that assumes primary role for women in maintaining family relationship is very strong. ... Inasmuch as the social mores deny women an equal role with men in the workplace, it has been difficult to change people’s expectations regarding women working outside of the home.’ (Gelb & Palley 1994, p. 292)

Thus, women position is still submissive. Men have the dominant role in society than women, even though they have equality in employment part. Palley’s statement above shows that no matter how modern Korea can be, the Confucian tradition remains strong among Korean society. Afterwards, looking from this portrayal, Sungmin’s female character in Super Junior genderswitch fan fiction can be identified in order to support Jenkins’s theory of ten ways rewrite television show.

2.2 Review of Related Studies

Many studies about fan fiction have done, but the writer have not found a study about genderswitch fan fiction. The writer found three studies of fan fiction, first is Angela Thomas journal article, *Fan Fiction Online: Engagement, Critical Response and Affective Play through Writing*. In her study, she focuses on fan fiction created in online spaces especially on the social and discursive literary practices in which young people are immersed. Her research conducted with one online community, *Middle Earth Insanity*. She finds out that fan fiction is ‘... a way of responding to the text they love, and a way of exploring alternative possibilities for their favorite fictional characters. (Thomas 2006, p. 230) She also finds several ways to

write fan fiction. There are from fictional role-playing and collaborative writing, critical responses to the text, and identity play.

In the 'role-playing game' section of the forum, members group together to play various story threads. Some are turned into a final piece of fan fiction, which is then submitted to fanfiction.net for further review, but many stay simply in their role-playing format. (230)

It is clear that fans can write fan fiction based on their role-playing with other fans then continue the story plot of their own into a final piece called fan fiction and upload it to site for fan fiction like fanfiction.net. This piece of work is considered as collaborative writing because involving other fans to make the fan fiction.

Other way to write fan fiction, according to her, is from the critical responses to the text. The fan fiction, in this case, contains certain issue that the author of fan fiction wants to argue or criticize about. She states that fan fiction allows the author to explore certain issue they curious about. (236)

'...young people are critically responding to the texts which story their lives through weaving these stories and ways of dealing with the complications in them, into their fan fiction characters and plots.' (236)

In this case, fans put their life experience into their fan fiction. This is also called affective play (p. 236). What they experience and feel applied in their fan fiction through their fiction characters and plots.

This study can be a useful reference to acknowledge how fans write fan fiction in online spaces. The difference between this study and the writer's study is that this study more focuses on producing process, while the writer's study focuses on how an idol character rewritten in different way in fan fiction. The difference between this study and the writer's study

is that Thomas explained how fans produce the fan fiction from asking to the fan fiction's authors by interview while the writer's study is to reveal how fans describe a character which is, in fact a male, to female. Thomas' study about online fan fiction is analyzed the fan fiction writing in general, no specific genre such as in the writer's study.

Second previous study is done by Besty Gooch entitled *The Communication of Fan Culture: The Impact of New Media on Science Fiction and Fantasy Fandom*. He explained how media can have some impacts to fans and fandom, and how the fan fiction writer communicate with their readers through sharing fan fiction they wrote and read the feedback. This study shows that media, especially cyberspace, have influenced and make people in one fandom can communicate and giving feedback to each other's fan fiction. From his study, the writer knows that many people who are fans of an idol usually use cyberspace as the media to share their writing and communicate through the feedback. This study can support the writer's study since it shows the relation between fans, fandom, fan fiction and media.

The third studies is done by Vedarari Sustenti entitled *Female Fans Readers Interest of Homosexual Theme in Dong Bang Shin Ki Fanfiction*. In this study, she wanted to know what are the readers' reason to like Yunjae fan fiction. Yunjae is abbreviation from Yunho and Jaejoong, who are the member of Korean boy band, Dong Bang Shin Ki which is also known as TVXQ.

In her study, she found out that there are four reasons why those female readers prefer to read Yunjae *yaoi* fan fiction. The reasons are, first, she agrees with Jenkins that homosexual story or slash fic is a female pornography. Female readers like to read some soft smut scene which contains a foreplay rather than penetration scene, so that she said that female readers prefer the soft smut scene because they do not want to only satisfy their desire but more about emotionally. The second reason is that Yunjae fan fiction is androgynous romance which can make the readers find the mutuality and equality in a relationship. Then the third reason is Yunjae fanfiction as fantasy identifications. By the shifting point of view, the readers can feel the sense of belonging toward Yunho and Jaejoong even the feeling of being one of the character. The last reason is homosocial desire. In this reason, she explained that those female readers are likely to found a kind of sweet relationship between Yunho and Jaejoong, such as holding hands and hugging which they cannot found in male friendship. Her study help the writer to understand that there is a possessive feeling of a fan towards the idol which can lead them to imagine such story based on their own thoughts.

Based on those three studies of fan fiction and fandom, the writer put her study to complete these previous studies in discussing genderswitch fan fiction. Because *yaoi* and genderswitch fan fiction actually interrelated. It is because they have the same pairing in the story, yet in gender switch fan fiction, the *uke* or the 'bottom' character is represented as female instead of male like in *yaoi* fanfiction. Her study is focused on the female reader

interest in reading homosexual fan fiction and since *yaoi* and genderswitch is interrelated, the writer can use this study to gain information about *yaoi* fan fictions and the fans respond to this kind of fan fiction.