

heliyon

46 of many

Reviewer #2: Review report on "Analysis of Twin Deficits Hypothesis in Indonesia and Its Impact on Financial Crisis":

The paper analyzes the twin deficits hypothesis (association between current account deficit and budget deficit) and its impact in the context of the debt crisis in Indonesia. The paper is well written, organized and systematic. It provides the required theoretical background. The literature review is also very nicely thematically arranged in the introduction section.

The following are some minor suggestions which can lead to further improvement in the paper:

First, the research question and objective of the paper should be clearly stated rather than mixing it on different paragraphs. One small paragraph can be added in the Introduction section.

Second, more tests of structural breaks can be done. Though cusum and cusum square give nice visual representation of structural change in a series but the significance level is not available. Though in this paper cusum test is used to check stability of the model still some other tests like Chow test can be carried out to get more accurate result on non existence of structural change.

Third, the readers would like to know the justification for time period used in the analysis. The data used for the twin deficits hypothesis is 2004q1-2017q4 whereas the debt crisis is 1981-2017. Is it because of lack of availability of data for a longer period for the twin deficit? In that case it is better to use the data of debt crisis for the same span of time as the objective of the paper is to examine the twin deficit hypothesis in the context of financial crisis in Indonesia.

Have questions or need assistance?
 For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/q/9435/>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/5 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/>)

mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/heliyon

Iranian Economic R... Lihat Presensi | SIM... Login WebApp Seoul journal of ec... SSO UGM 2016 Universitas Airlang... Indicators | Data Manufacturing, valu...

heliyon

From Any time Has attachment To Is unread Advanced search

1-50 of many

<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Heliyon	Inbox PDF for submission to Heliyon requires approval - com/heliyon/. * Click on the folder 'Submissions Waiting for Author's ...	01/10/2019
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Heliyon	Inbox Confirming handling editor for submission to Heliyon - Number: HELIYON-D-19-01049R1 ANALYSIS OF TWIN DEFICITS ...	13/09/2019
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Heliyon	Inbox Confirming handling editor for submission to Heliyon - Number: HELIYON-D-19-01049R1 ANALYSIS OF TWIN DEFICITS ...	12/09/2019
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Heliyon	Inbox Confirming submission to Heliyon - Number: HELIYON-D-19-01049R1 ANALYSIS OF TWIN DEFICITS HYPOTHESIS IN IND...	11/09/2019
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Heliyon 4	Inbox PDF for submission to Heliyon requires approval - com/heliyon/. * Click on the folder 'Submissions Waiting for Author's ...	11/09/2019
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Heliyon, me 3	Your Submission HELIYON-D-19-01049 to Heliyon - publish in Heliyon Journal. Thanks. On Sun, 25 Aug 2019 at 10:31, Heliyon wr... <input type="button" value="Comments to A..."/> <input type="button" value="Comments to E..."/>	31/08/2019
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Heliyon	Inbox Decision on your submission HELIYON-D-19-01018 to Heliyon - [EMID:8d864216ba918eb0] - Number: HELIYON-D-19-...	23/08/2019
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	me, Mail 2	Inbox Ask about our journal - Dear Heliyon I want to ask about our paper First Manuscript Number: HELIYON-D-19-01018 To...	10/08/2019
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Heliyon 2	Inbox Confirming handling editor for submission to Heliyon - Number: HELIYON-D-19-01049 ANALYSIS OF TWIN DEFICITS H...	06/08/2019
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Heliyon	Inbox Confirming submission to Heliyon - submitted to Heliyon. To track the status of your manuscript, please log in as an aut...	31/07/2019

10.68 GB of 15 GB (71%) used

Terms - Privacy - Programme Policies

Last account activity: 1 minute ago

Your Submission HELIYON-D-19-01049 to Heliyon



Heliyon <em@editorialmanager.com>
to me

Sun, 25 Aug 2019, 10:31 ☆ ↶ ⋮

Manuscript Number: HELIYON-D-19-01049
Title: ANALYSIS OF TWIN DEFICITS HYPOTHESIS IN INDONESIA AND ITS IMPACT ON FINANCIAL CRISIS
Journal: Heliyon

Dear Mr Handoyo,

We have now received all of the reviewers' comments on your submission to Heliyon.

The reviewers have advised that the level of English throughout your manuscript must be improved; and that further revisions are required before publication can be considered. Their detailed comments are appended below.

For help with English language usage and quality, we strongly recommend you consult a professional language editing service. Please visit our Customer Service Site for more information about Elsevier's language editing services: <http://websites.elsevier.com/languageservices>.

If you are able to improve the standard of writing and address all other the reviewers' comments, I would like to invite you to revise and resubmit your manuscript. We ask that you respond to each reviewer comment by either outlining how the criticism was addressed in the revised manuscript or by providing a rebuttal to the criticism. To allow easy sharing of your response with the editor and reviewers, we ask that you submit it a separate word document alongside with your submission.

To submit your revised manuscript, please log in as an author here: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/> where you will see a menu item called 'Submission Needing Revision'.

I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Kind regards.

820

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Reviewer #1: This paper is well written and organized, with a thorough literature review that provides the reader with sufficient background info. This paper aims to analyze the relationship between the current account deficit and the budget deficit (twin deficits hypothesis) and measures the performance of the current account deficit and other macroeconomic indicators in predicting the debt crisis in Indonesia.

52

The data used for the twin deficits hypothesis is 2004q1-2017q4 and the debt crisis is 1981-2017. The method used for the twin deficits hypothesis is ARDL, while the measurement of indicators performance uses the Early Warning System (EWS) method. The results of short-term studies mention a negative relationship between the current account deficit and the budget deficit (twin divergence). Twin divergence can occur when a country has a high savings rate. The results also show that the current account deficit has a low performance in predicting the debt crisis in Indonesia. Macroeconomic indicators which are leading indicators, namely short-term debt-foreign exchange reserves, short-term debt-total external debt, M2-foreign exchange reserves, inflation, IMF credit-GDP, and domestic credit-GDP.

+

Reviewer #2: Review report on "Analysis of Twin Deficits Hypothesis in Indonesia and Its Impact on Financial Crisis":

The paper analyzes the twin deficits hypothesis (association between current account deficit and budget deficit) and its impact in the context of the debt crisis in Indonesia. The paper is well written, organized and systematic. It provides the required theoretical background. The literature review is also very nicely thematically arranged in the introduction section.

The following are some minor suggestions which can lead to further improvement in the paper:

First, the research question and objective of the paper should be clearly stated rather than mixing it on different paragraphs. One small paragraph can be added in the Introduction section.

	From	Any time	Has attachment	To	Is unread	Advanced search
820	me, Seenuvasan 2					
	Inbox					
	HLY e03248 HLY_HELIYON-D-19-01049 - in: Heliyon					Sorry for the late reply. About your commen...
						20/01/2020
						HLY e03248 RE...
	Elsevier - Article .					
	Inbox					Track your article [HLY_e03248] accepted in Heliyon - title: Heliyon Article Number: e03248 Corresponding author: Mr ...
52						15/01/2020
	Heliyon					
	Inbox					Decision on submission to Heliyon - Number: HELIYON-D-19-01049R2 Title: ANALYSIS OF TWIN DEFICITS HYPOTHESIS...
						14/01/2020
	Heliyon 2					
	Inbox					Re: Revision for date extension for HELIYON-D-19-01049R2 [191214-012212] - revised paper HELIYON-D-19-01049R2 ...
						14/12/2019
+	Heliyon					
	Inbox					Confirming submission to Heliyon - Number: HELIYON-D-19-01049R2 ANALYSIS OF TWIN DEFICITS HYPOTHESIS IN IN...
						13/11/2019
	Heliyon					
	Inbox					PDF for submission to Heliyon requires approval - com/heliyon/. * Click on the folder 'Submissions Waiting for Author's ...
						13/11/2019
	Heliyon					
	Inbox					Decision on submission HELIYON-D-19-01049R1 to Heliyon - : HELIYON-D-19-01049R1 Title: ANALYSIS OF TWIN DEFICL...
						08/10/2019
	Rudra, me, Rudra 17					
	Inbox					Query on your submission: HELIYON-D-19-01049R1 - submission: HELIYON-D-19-01049R1 Dear Dr.Rudra How about o...
						04/10/2019
						image001.png image002.png HELIYON-D-19-... +6
	Heliyon					
	Inbox					Confirming submission to Heliyon - submitted to Heliyon. To track the status of your manuscript, please log in as an aut...
						01/10/2019
	Heliyon					
	Inbox					Submission to Heliyon - manuscript number - Number: HELIYON-D-19-02084 ANALYSIS OF TWIN DEFICITS HYPOTHE...
						01/10/2019
	Heliyon					
	Inbox					PDF for submission to Heliyon requires approval - com/heliyon/. * Click on the folder 'Submissions Waiting for Author's ...
						01/10/2019

	corrections.esch					
	Inbox					Proofs of [HLY_5235] - publishing with HELIYON. We are pleased to inform you that the proof for your upcoming p...
						13/10/2020
	OAElsevierInvoicesN.					
	Inbox					Your Elsevier invoice OAD0000074009 - Dear Sir/Madam, Please find your invoice OAD0000074009 attached to t...
						09/10/2020
						Invoice_OAD00...
	Elsevier - Author F.					
	Inbox					Publishing Agreement completed for your article [HLY_e05235] - Elsevier cover Dear Mr. Erlando, Thank you for c...
						09/10/2020
						HLY5235.html
	Elsevier - Author F.					
	Inbox					Rights and Access form completed for your article [HLY_e05235] - Elsevier cover Dear Mr. Erlando, Thank you for ...
						09/10/2020
						Order Confirma... Terms and Con...

Your Submission HELIYON-D-19-01049 to Heliyon

Heliyon <em@editorialmanager.com>
to me

Sun, 25 Aug 2019, 10:31

Manuscript Number: HELIYON-D-19-01049
Title: ANALYSIS OF TWIN DEFICITS HYPOTHESIS IN INDONESIA AND ITS IMPACT ON FINANCIAL CRISIS
Journal: Heliyon

Dear Mr Handoyo,

We have now received all of the reviewers' comments on your submission to Heliyon.

The reviewers have advised that the level of English throughout your manuscript must be improved; and that further revisions are required before publication can be considered. Their detailed comments are appended below.

For help with English language usage and quality, we strongly recommend you consult a professional language editing service. Please visit our Customer Service Site for more information about Elsevier's language editing services: <http://websites.elsevier.com/languageservices>.

If you are able to improve the standard of writing and address all other the reviewers' comments, I would like to invite you to revise and resubmit your manuscript. We ask that you respond to each reviewer comment by either outlining how the criticism was addressed in the revised manuscript or by providing a rebuttal to the criticism. To allow easy sharing of your response with the editor and reviewers, we ask that you submit it a separate word document alongside with your submission.

To submit your revised manuscript, please log in as an author here: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/> where you will see a menu item called 'Submission Needing Revision'.

I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Kind regards.

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

820

Reviewer #1: This paper is well written and organized, with a thorough literature review that provides the reader with sufficient background info. This paper aims to analyze the relationship between the current account deficit and the budget deficit (twin deficits hypothesis) and measures the performance of the current account deficit and other macroeconomic indicators in predicting the debt crisis in Indonesia.

52

The data used for the twin deficits hypothesis is 2004q1-2017q4 and the debt crisis is 1981-2017. The method used for the twin deficits hypothesis is ARDL, while the measurement of indicators performance uses the Early Warning System (EWS) method. The results of short-term studies mention a negative relationship between the current account deficit and the budget deficit (twin divergence). Twin divergence can occur when a country has a high savings rate. The results also show that the current account deficit has a low performance in predicting the debt crisis in Indonesia. Macroeconomic indicators which are leading indicators, namely short-term debt-foreign exchange reserves, short-term debt-total external debt, M2-foreign exchange reserves, inflation, IMF credit-GDP, and domestic credit-GDP.

+

Reviewer #2: Review report on "Analysis of Twin Deficits Hypothesis in Indonesia and Its Impact on Financial Crisis":

The paper analyzes the twin deficits hypothesis (association between current account deficit and budget deficit) and its impact in the context of the debt crisis in Indonesia. The paper is well written, organized and systematic. It provides the required theoretical background. The literature review is also very nicely thematically arranged in the introduction section.

The following are some minor suggestions which can lead to further improvement in the paper:

First, the research question and objective of the paper should be clearly stated rather than mixing it on different paragraphs. One small paragraph can be added in the Introduction section.

Review report on “Analysis of Twin Deficits Hypothesis in Indonesia and Its Impact on Financial Crisis”:

The paper analyzes the twin deficits hypothesis (association between current account deficit and budget deficit) and its impact in the context of the debt crisis in Indonesia. The paper is well written, organized and systematic. It provides the required theoretical background. The literature review is also very nicely thematically arranged in the introduction section.

The following are some minor suggestions which can lead to further improvement in the paper:

First, the research question and objective of the paper should be clearly stated rather than mixing it on different paragraphs. One small paragraph can be added in the Introduction section.

Second, more tests of structural breaks can be done. Though cusum and cusum square give nice visual representation of structural change in a series but the significance level is not available. Though in this paper cusum test is used to check stability of the model still some other tests like Chow test can be carried out to get more accurate result on non existence of structural change.

Third, the readers would like to know the justification for time period used in the analysis. The data used for the twin deficits hypothesis is 2004q1-2017q4 whereas the debt crisis is 1981-2017. Is it because of lack of availability of data for a longer period for the twin deficit? In that case it is better to use the data of debt crisis for the same span of time as the objective of the paper is to examine the twin deficit hypothesis in the context of financial crisis in Indonesia.

The paper “Analysis of Twin Deficits Hypothesis in Indonesia and Its Impact on Financial Crisis” examines the relationship between current account deficit and budget deficit (the twin deficits hypothesis) and its impact in the context of the debt crisis in Indonesia. The paper is well written, organized and systematic and adopts appropriate time series techniques to address the research issue. The paper can be accepted for publication after incorporating the minor suggestions provided in the report to author.