



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

Confirming submission to Heliyon

1 pesan

Heliyon <em@editorialmanager.com>

13 Oktober 2020 pukul 22.53

Balas Ke: Heliyon <info@heliyon.com>

Kepada: Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

CC: "Noorlailie Soewarno" noorlailie-s@feb.unair.ac.id, "Febriani Mustikaningtyas" febriani.mustikaningtyas-2016@feb.unair.ac.id

This is an automated message.

Good corporate governance and corporate sustainability performance in Indonesia: A triple bottom line approach

Dear Professor Tjahjadi,

We have received the above referenced manuscript you submitted to the Business and Economics section of Heliyon. It has been assigned the manuscript number HELIYON-D-20-07607. To track the status of your manuscript, please log in as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/>, and navigate to the "Submissions Being Processed" folder.

Thank you for submitting your work to Heliyon, an open access journal that is part of the Cell Press family.

Kind regards,
Heliyon

More information and support

You will find information relevant for you as an author on Elsevier's Author Hub: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors>

FAQ: How can I reset a forgotten password?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28452/supporthub/publishing/

For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>

Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/7 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

Decision on submission HELIYON-D-20-07607 to Heliyon

2 pesan

Heliyon <em@editorialmanager.com>

5 Desember 2020 pukul 14.43

Balas Ke: Heliyon <info@heliyon.com>

Kepada: Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

Manuscript. Number.: HELIYON-D-20-07607

Title: Good corporate governance and corporate sustainability performance in Indonesia: A triple bottom line approach

Journal: Heliyon

Dear Professor Tjahjadi,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Heliyon.

We have completed the review of your manuscript and a summary is appended below. The reviewers recommend major revisions are required before publication can be considered.

If you are able to address all reviewer comments in full, I invite you to resubmit your manuscript. We ask that you respond to each reviewer comment by either outlining how the criticism was addressed in the revised manuscript or by providing a rebuttal to the criticism. This should be carried out in a point-by-point fashion as illustrated here:

<https://www.cell.com/heliyon/guide-for-authors#Revisions>

To allow the editors and reviewers to easily assess your revised manuscript, we also ask that you upload a version of your manuscript highlighting any revisions made. You may wish to use Microsoft Word's Track Changes tool or, for LaTeX files, the latexdiff Perl script (<https://ctan.org/pkg/latexdiff>).

To submit your revised manuscript, please log in as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/>, and navigate to the "Submissions Needing Revision" folder. Your revision due date is Jan 14, 2021.

We understand that the global COVID-19 situation may well be causing disruption for you and your colleagues. If that is the case for you and it has an impact on your ability to make revisions to address the concerns that came up in the review process, please let us know so we can discuss with you potential revision deadline extensions. Please also note that Heliyon focuses on technically correct science and so you are only expected to include revisions that are necessary to ensure that the content and the conclusions of the research are technically correct.

I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Kind regards,
Pavlos Delias
Section Editor
Heliyon

Editor and Reviewer comments:

Reviewer #1: Introduction:

A fair analysis has been done on the variables of interest. However, the following questions have not been given adequate attention.

What is the problem statement of this study?

What are the objectives of this study?

What are the contributions of this study?

Literature Review:

Theories:

There are three theories that have been explained. However, it is required to make sure whether all 3 theories together explained the relation of those variables something which has not been done. A separate section about theories should be added.

Sections

Board size and corporate sustainability performance; President of the commissioner's education and sustainability performance; CEO's education and sustainability performance are sections introduced without any explanation no how they came to be there...

Moreover, the hypotheses put under each section are too many and the literature discussed is inadequate to explain the development of these hypotheses. Under each hypothesis authors, should give literature that can be positive,

negative, neutral and also mixed, then from that literature inform whether that relationship can be diagnosed to be positive or negative. Currently, its difficult to confirm the hypotheses they have put as literature to support their argument is not there..

Methodology:

Multiple linear regression has seized to be an effective data analysis method owing to problems such as Selection Bias; Multicollinearity; Autocorrelation and Heteroskedasticity amongst others. Authors should use a more advanced analysis tool which manages these problems.

Discussion:

Second part is explanation from The link between the results and the 3 theories presented. this part more easy if you had completed the description of your theoretical framework. This explanation in this part have to supported your part 2 (Theoretical framework) and vice versa

Reviewer #2: Review HELIYON-D-20-07607: Good corporate governance and corporate sustainability performance in Indonesia: A triple bottom line approach

This paper examines the relationship between corporate governance measures and corporate sustainability performance. Board of commissioner's characteristics seem to have an effect on economic, social and environmental sustainability performance. Multiple relationships are tested following the relevant literature. I believe that the paper deals with an important research question in an interesting institutional setting that despite its size is not yet well documented especially with respect to the relationship between CSR and corporate governance. The paper has a fairly clear structure even though adjustments can be made as indicated later. The paper contributes to some extent to the ongoing literature but provides very few if any implications. While I can see merit in the study, there are some issues the authors should carefully address. My thoughts/comments are as follows.

1. Contribution

While I can acknowledge the importance of the results, it's not clear how market participants benefit from the derived findings. Is it simply highlighting the need for the relationships between corporate governance and? Is that enough? How can your findings prove useful for fund of fund managers, retail investors, policy makers, financial advisors or senior executives in the fund management industry?

2. Structure

The introductory section together with section 2 referring to the Indonesian market attempt to summarize the vast literature. I would expect probably even further background information on the CSR and corporate governance market in Indonesia, which represents obviously an interesting institutional setting. A small section offering an up-to-date description of the regulatory framework and the CSR regulations applying today and/or during the examined period in Indonesia would also enable a more profound interpretation of the estimated results.

3. Concluding Remarks

The length of this section doesn't do justice to the paper. I would expect you to elaborate on your findings linking them to some policy recommendation opportunities. Moreover, I suggest the authors to highlight the managerial implications of their findings. Some effort has been made towards this end but I would suggest you more explicitly suggest how the results can prove useful for investors, policy makers and public companies alike. Overall, conclusions seem not to keep up with the importance of the paper and the preceding analysis.

Data in Brief (optional):

We invite you to convert your supplementary data (or a part of it) into an additional journal publication in Data in Brief, a multi-disciplinary open access journal. Data in Brief articles are a fantastic way to describe supplementary data and associated metadata, or full raw datasets deposited in an external repository, which are otherwise unnoticed. A Data in Brief article (which will be reviewed, formatted, indexed, and given a DOI) will make your data easier to find, reproduce, and cite.

You can submit to Data in Brief when you upload your revised manuscript. To do so, complete the template and follow the co-submission instructions found here: www.elsevier.com/dib-template. If your manuscript is accepted, your Data in Brief submission will automatically be transferred to Data in Brief for editorial review and publication.

Please note: an open access Article Publication Charge (APC) is payable by the author or research funder to cover the costs associated with publication in Data in Brief and ensure your data article is immediately and permanently free to access by all. For the current APC see: www.elsevier.com/journals/data-in-brief/2352-3409/open-access-journal

Please contact the Data in Brief editorial office at dib-me@elsevier.com or visit the Data in Brief homepage (www.journals.elsevier.com/data-in-brief/) if you have questions or need further information.

More information and support

FAQ: How do I revise my submission in Editorial Manager?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28463/supporthub/publishing/

You will find information relevant for you as an author on Elsevier's Author Hub: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors>

FAQ: How can I reset a forgotten password?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28452/supporthub/publishing/

For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>

Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/7 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Article 1 Review (17 NOV 2020).docx

14K

Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>
Kepada: Heliyon <info@heliyon.com>

18 Januari 2021 pukul 08.26

Dear Heliyon,

I have difficulties in uploading my revision. I can download my attachment however, I couldn't attach my new file because there isn't a button to do us.
Please help.

Best regards,
Bambang Tjahjadi

The screenshot shows the Editorial Manager interface for a user named Bambang Tjahjadi. The main content area displays a table of files associated with the submission. The table has columns for Item, Description, File Name, Size, Last Modified, Include in Revision, and Actions. A single file is listed: 'FINAL SUBMIT_HELIYON.docx' with a size of 194.5 KB and a last modified date of Oct 13, 2020. The 'Include in Revision' checkbox is unchecked, and there is a 'Download' link in the 'Actions' column. To the left of the table, there are instructions regarding file uploads and revisions. At the bottom of the interface, there are 'Back' and 'Proceed' buttons.

Item	Description	File Name	Size	Last Modified	Include in Revision	Actions
Manuscript File	Manuscript File	FINAL SUBMIT_HELIYON.docx	194.5 KB	Oct 13, 2020	<input type="checkbox"/>	Download

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

[URGENT] HLY 6453 - table 4 required in editable format

3 pesan

Paree, Rachel Vinitha V. (ELS-CHN) <r.pareenargunam@elsevier.com>
Kepada: "bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id" <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

6 Maret 2021 pukul 00.50

Dear Dr. Tjahjadi,

I am writing to you regarding the accepted manuscript titled: Good corporate governance and corporate sustainability performance in Indonesia: A triple bottom line approach. Please be informed that we have received the table 4 in image format. I request you to provide the table 4 in editable format to proceed with production process.

Looking forward to your response.

Warm Regards,

Rachel

Rachel Vinitha

Journal Manager

ELSEVIER | Research Content Operations

+91 44 42994788 office

r.pareenargunam@elsevier.com

www.elsevier.com

Line Manager: Ms. Lavanya - L.Ashwin@elsevier.com

International Tech Park | Crest -12th Floor

Taramani Road | [Taramani](#)

Chennai 600 113 | [India](#)

For assistance, please visit our Customer Support site,

where you can search for solutions on a range of topics and find answers to frequently asked questions.

Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>
Kepada: "Paree, Rachel Vinitha V. (ELS-CHN)" <r.pareenargunam@elsevier.com>

6 Maret 2021 pukul 07.25

Dear **Rachel Vinitha**

Journal Manager

I apologize for the inconvenience. Please find the editable version of table 4 attached to this email in word format.

Best regards,

Bambang Tjahjadi
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

 **Table 4 editable.docx**
16K

Paree, Rachel Vinitha V. (ELS-CHN) <r.pareenargunam@elsevier.com>
Kepada: Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

7 Maret 2021 pukul 23.11

Dear Dr. Tjahjadi,

Thank you for your e-mail.

We will proceed further with the article.

Warm Regards,

Rachel

Rachel Vinitha

Journal Manager

ELSEVIER | Research Content Operations

+91 44 42994788 office

r.pareenargunam@elsevier.com

www.elsevier.com

Line Manager: Ms. Lavanya - L.Ashwin@elsevier.com

International Tech Park | Crest -12th Floor

Taramani Road | [Taramani](#)

Chennai 600 113 | [India](#)

For assistance, please visit our Customer Support site,

where you can search for solutions on a range of topics and find answers to frequently asked questions.

From: Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>
Sent: Saturday, March 6, 2021 5:56 AM
To: Paree, Rachel Vinitha V. (ELS-CHN) <r.pareenargunam@elsevier.com>
Subject: Re: [URGENT] HLY 6453 - table 4 required in editable format

***** External email: use caution *****

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

Production has begun on your article [HLY_6453] in Heliyon

1 pesan

r.pareenargunam@elsevier.com <r.pareenargunam@elsevier.com>
Kepada: bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id

5 Maret 2021 pukul 13.16

Our reference: HLY e06453
Article reference: HLY_HELIYON-D-20-07607
Article title: Good corporate governance and corporate sustainability performance in Indonesia: A triple bottom line approach
To be published in: Heliyon

Dear Prof. Tjahjadi,

Thank you for choosing to publish in Heliyon. Please read this e-mail carefully as it contains important information.

FINALIZE PUBLISHING YOUR ARTICLE:

We work hard to publish our authors' articles online as quickly and efficiently as possible, therefore processing of your accepted manuscript for publication has already begun. To ensure that we publish your article in accordance with your wishes, please now complete the forms found here:

<http://authors.elsevier.com/authorforms/HLY6453/eed88ae83fc5c7f83abb153fbe88717f>

If this link does not work, please copy the entire URL (noting that it may run on to a second line in this message) into your browser. You should log in with your Elsevier Profile credentials, which you may have already created when submitting your article.

CHECK YOUR CONTACT DETAILS:

Please check that your details listed below are correct so we can contact you if needed:

Prof. Bambang Tjahjadi
Airlangga University
Faculty of Economics and Business
surabaya, East Java 60286
Indonesia
Phone: not available
Fax: not available
E-mail: bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id

YOUR REFERENCE NUMBER:

Lastly, to help us provide you with the best service, please make a note of your article's reference number HLY e06453 and quote it in all of your messages to us.

Thank you for your cooperation.

Kind regards,

Rachel V. Parea Nargunam

Elsevier
E-Mail: r.pareenargunam@elsevier.com

HAVE QUESTIONS OR NEED ASSISTANCE?

For further assistance, please visit our Customer Support site, where you can search for solutions on a range of topics, such as Open Access or payment queries, and find answers to frequently asked questions. You can also talk to our customer support team by phone 24 hours a day from Monday-Friday and 24/7 by live chat and email.

Get started here: <http://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing>

Copyright © 2015 Elsevier B.V. | Privacy Policy <http://www.elsevier.com/privacypolicy>
Elsevier Limited, The Boulevard, Langford Lane, Kidlington, Oxford, OX5 1GB, United Kingdom, Registration No. 1982084