



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management - IJPPM-04-2020-0181

1 pesan

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management23 April 2020 pukul
21.29

<onbehalfof@manuscriptcentral.com>

Balas Ke: jeniwebster123@gmail.com

Kepada: bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id, noorlailie-s@feb.unair.ac.id, vivianinadyaningrum@gmail.com, aisyah.pns@gmail.com

23-Apr-2020

Dear Prof. Tjahjadi,

Your manuscript entitled "Human capital readiness and global market orientation in Indonesian MSMEs business performance" has been successfully submitted online and is presently being given full consideration for publication in the International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management.

Your manuscript ID is IJPPM-04-2020-0181.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence or when calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or e-mail address, please log in to ScholarOne Manuscripts at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijppm> and edit your user information as appropriate.

You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Centre after logging in to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijppm>.

Please note that Emerald requires you to clear permission to re-use any material not created by you. If there are permissions outstanding, please upload these when you submit your revision or send directly to Emerald if your paper is accepted immediately. Emerald is unable to publish your paper with permissions outstanding.

Open Access?

All of our subscription journals give you the option of publishing your article open access, following payment of an article processing charge (APC). To find the APC for your journal, please refer to the APC price list: http://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/openaccess/apc_price_list.pdf

Emerald has established partnerships with national consortium bodies to offer a number of APC vouchers for eligible regions and institutions. To check your eligibility please refer to the open access partnerships page: <http://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/openaccess/oapartnerships.htm>

If you would like to publish your article open access please contact openaccess@emeraldgroup.com

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management.

Yours sincerely,
Jennifer Webster
International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9781-729X>



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management - Author update

1 pesan

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management10 Mei 2020 pukul
19.43

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Balas Ke: jeniwebster123@gmail.com

Kepada: bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id, noorlailie-s@feb.unair.ac.id, vivianinadyaningrum@gmail.com, aisyah.pns@gmail.com

10-May-2020

Dear Author(s)

It is a pleasure to inform you that your manuscript titled Human capital readiness and global market orientation in Indonesian MSMEs business performance (IJPPM-04-2020-0181) has passed initial screening and is now awaiting reviewer selection. The manuscript was submitted by Prof. Bambang Tjahjadi with you listed as a co-author. As you are listed as a co-author please log in to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijppm> and check that your account details are complete and correct, these details will be used should the paper be accepted for publication.

Yours sincerely,

Jennifer Webster

Editorial Assistant, International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

jeniwebster123@gmail.com



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management - Decision on Manuscript ID IJPPM-04-2020-0181

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management3 Juli 2020 pukul
01.40

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Balas Ke: luisa.huatuco@york.ac.uk

Kepada: bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id

02-Jul-2020

Dear Prof. Tjahjadi,

Manuscript ID IJPPM-04-2020-0181 entitled "Human capital readiness and global market orientation in Indonesian MSMEs business performance" which you submitted to the International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management, has been reviewed. The comments of the reviewer(s) are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewer(s) have recommended publication, but also suggest some revisions to your manuscript. Therefore, I invite you to respond to the reviewer(s)' comments and revise your manuscript.

To revise your manuscript, log into <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijppm> and enter your Author Centre, where you will find your manuscript title listed under "Manuscripts with Decisions." Under "Actions," click on "Create a Revision." Your manuscript number has been appended to denote a revision.

You will be unable to make your revisions on the originally submitted version of the manuscript. Instead, revise your manuscript using a word processing program and save it on your computer. Please also highlight the changes to your manuscript within the document by using the track changes mode in MS Word or by using bold or coloured text. Once the revised manuscript is prepared, you can upload it and submit it through your Author Centre.

When submitting your revised manuscript, you will be able to respond to the comments made by the reviewer(s) in the space provided. You can use this space to document any changes you make to the original manuscript. In order to expedite the processing of the revised manuscript, please be as specific as possible in your response to the reviewer(s).

IMPORTANT: Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.

Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to the International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management, your revised manuscript should be uploaded as soon as possible. If it is not possible for you to submit your revision in a reasonable amount of time, we may have to consider your paper as a new submission.

To help support you on your publishing journey we have partnered with Editage, a leading global science communication platform, to offer expert editorial support including language editing and translation. If your article has been rejected or revisions have been requested, you may benefit from Editage's services. For a full list of services, visit: authorservices.emeraldpublishing.com/
Please note that there is no obligation to use Editage and using this service does not guarantee publication.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to the International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management and I look forward to receiving your revision.

Yours sincerely,
Dr. Luisa Huaccho Huatuco
Editor, International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management
luisa.huatuco@york.ac.uk

DEADLINE: 30-Sep-2020

Reviewer(s)' Comments to Author:
Reviewer: 1

Recommendation: Major Revision

Comments:

We recommend using proofread services to improve this paper.

Additional Questions:

1. **Originality:** Does the paper contain new and significant information adequate to justify publication?: Originality should be built from the relationship of theory and conditions in the field to build a new theory based on harmony between practice and its empirical. In this paper, the depiction of originality is already apparent, although the conditions presented seem to be still classic, especially the problems in Indonesia. Originality should be added to the solution offered in this paper.
2. **Relationship to Literature:** Does the paper demonstrate an adequate understanding of the relevant literature in the field and cite an appropriate range of literature sources? Is any significant work ignored?: The literature used in this paper is sufficient to be presented. Grand theories must be added which base relationships between variables. It also needs to add research results that are relevant to the condition of SME's in the East Java Province of Indonesia.
3. **Methodology:** Is the paper's argument built on an appropriate base of theory, concepts, or other ideas? Has the research or equivalent intellectual work on which the paper is based been well designed? Are the methods employed appropriate?: The method proposed is in accordance with the model presented. In PLS analysis, an inner & outer model and nonresponse bias must also be presented, to know the consistency of the analyzed data.
4. **Results:** Are results presented clearly and analysed appropriately? Do the conclusions adequately tie together the other elements of the paper?: It is better to distinguish between the results that explain the results of the analysis using the PLS tool and the discussion of the results of the analysis so that the originality of the results can be found compared with the research that has been done.
5. **Implications for research, practice and/or society:** Does the paper identify clearly any implications for research, practice and/or society? Does the paper bridge the gap between theory and practice? How can the research be used in practice (economic and commercial impact), in teaching, to influence public policy, in research (contributing to the body of knowledge)? What is the impact upon society (influencing public attitudes, affecting quality of life)? Are these implications consistent with the findings and conclusions of the paper?: This paper has not identified what kind of practice can be done for MSME, so it has not explained in detail the implementation of the results between theory and practice. Theoretical conclusions have been presented, but the implications for practice are not clear. The writer should be able to present specifically the impact of the results of this study.
6. **Quality of Communication:** Does the paper clearly express its case, measured against the technical language of the field and the expected knowledge of the journal's readership? Has attention been paid to the clarity of expression and readability, such as sentence structure, jargon use, acronyms, etc.: The expressions and use of grammar should be clarified, use proofread to improve the structure of the paper.

Reviewer: 2

Recommendation: Minor Revision

Comments:

In my opinion, the first hypothesis is obvious and its positive verification was not a surprise.

Additional Questions:

1. **Originality:** Does the paper contain new and significant information adequate to justify publication?: Certainly, this work is valuable and meets the requirements for this type of work. The authors made an effort to examine the relationship between three variables: human capital readiness; business performance and whether global market orientation. the results of their own research referred to the results published by other authors.
2. **Relationship to Literature:** Does the paper demonstrate an adequate understanding of the relevant literature in the field and cite an appropriate range of literature sources? Is any significant work ignored?: In my opinion, the authors carried out a thorough review of the literature and he paper demonstrate an adequate understanding of the relevant literature in the field
3. **Methodology:** Is the paper's argument built on an appropriate base of theory, concepts, or other ideas? Has the research or equivalent intellectual work on which the paper is based been well designed? Are the methods employed appropriate?: The research methodology is transparent, based on an appropriate literature database. Studies have been well designed.
4. **Results:** Are results presented clearly and analysed appropriately? Do the conclusions adequately tie together the other elements of the paper?: The results are clearly presented and properly analyzed. The authors placed appropriate comments on each of the hypotheses which were made at the beginning of the article. The applications combine the other elements of the document accordingly.
5. **Implications for research, practice and/or society:** Does the paper identify clearly any implications for research,

practice and/or society? Does the paper bridge the gap between theory and practice? How can the research be used in practice (economic and commercial impact), in teaching, to influence public policy, in research (contributing to the body of knowledge)? What is the impact upon society (influencing public attitudes, affecting quality of life)? Are these implications consistent with the findings and conclusions of the paper?: The paper identify clearly implications for theory, practice and society. The article through theory and implemented conclusions certainly combines theory with practice. In my opinion, it is possible to use the conducted research in practice, but for now as advice for entrepreneurs to put more emphasis on using human capital's readiness for business results in the context of global market orientation. Creating a set of "good practices" on how to use the readiness of human capital would be an added value in this article. The authors presented the impact on society in the conclusions and I agree with their opinion. I think the implications are in line with the findings and conclusions of the letter.

6. Quality of Communication: Does the paper clearly express its case, measured against the technical language of the field and the expected knowledge of the journal's readership? Has attention been paid to the clarity of expression and readability, such as sentence structure, jargon use, acronyms, etc.: The paper clearly expressed its case, measured against the expected knowledge of the journal's readership. The article structure is correct, the attention has been paid to the clarity of expression and readability.

Reviewer: 3

Recommendation: Reject

Comments:

Please rewrite the whole piece taking into account the need for this study for the MSMEs in Indonesia who stand much to gain if a proper research piece is produced.

Additional Questions:

1. Originality: Does the paper contain new and significant information adequate to justify publication?: No. The Paper relies too much on Kaplan and Norton (2004) . Three out of four hypotheses are reproduced from there. it has been referred to 17 times in the paper. there is a real question about the novelty of this paper itself!

Sung and Choi referred to 9 times. Chaha; et. al 2016. ONkelinx 9 times, Jogatnam 2017 11 times. The authors seem to have been casual about this. they have four poorly worded hypotheses out of which three are not their original hypotheses.

2. Relationship to Literature: Does the paper demonstrate an adequate understanding of the relevant literature in the field and cite an appropriate range of literature sources? Is any significant work ignored?: very weak. They have interchangeably used human capital, human capital readiness and human capital readiness status misleading the interpretation of literature at places to suit their arguments. While the title talks of MSME , significant part of the literature cited needs to be checked for SMEs or MSMEs wherein the checks are missing. Also as mentioned above they have been casual about relying too much on a few articles.

at many places they have made the claim that literature for studying the link of human capital readiness with business performance is rare but at other place they mention "many scholars " have studied the same... The literature review is weak and needs significant upgrade.

3. Methodology: Is the paper's argument built on an appropriate base of theory, concepts, or other ideas? Has the research or equivalent intellectual work on which the paper is based been well designed? Are the methods employed appropriate?: the methodology is weak. The construct Global market orientation has three dimensions and one of them is measured by a single variable in the model. This variable gets dropped when check for validity and the second round is conducted assuming we are still measuring GMO, which has now reduced to only two dimensions out of three, actually what has been measured is a new construct and not GMO anymore. Also the validity has not been checked based on the theory assumed, which signifies a weak theoretical argument. They hypothese is testing for association leading to a faulty null hypotheses that gets tested.

4. Results: Are results presented clearly and analysed appropriately? Do the conclusions adequately tie together the other elements of the paper?: the results are presented based on weak theory and poorly designed hypotheses and as such they are not fit to be termed results. Also the interpretation presented in discussion is flawed based on faulty model testing and improper construct identification in the models using data for testing especially in the measurement model. As the constructs fail validity, there is no point discussing results especially the role of GMO, which was the only original proposal made by the authors.

5. Implications for research, practice and/or society: Does the paper identify clearly any implications for research, practice and/or society? Does the paper bridge the gap between theory and practice? How can the research be used in practice (economic and commercial impact), in teaching, to influence public policy, in research (contributing to the body of knowledge)? What is the impact upon society (influencing public attitudes, affecting quality of life)? Are these implications consistent with the findings and conclusions of the paper?: No. Due to improper construct identification in the measurement model the paper fails to bridge the gap between theory and practice. It fails theory and is far removed from practice. It has a very weak argument on impact on society based on the use of human capital as a construct which different from human capital readiness.

6. Quality of Communication: Does the paper clearly express its case, measured against the technical language of the field and the expected knowledge of the journal's readership? Has attention been paid to the clarity of expression and readability, such as sentence structure, jargon use, acronyms, etc.: The paper fails to meet the expectations of the journal or any scientific writing of academic nature. it lacks the proper theoretical structure and research framework to be tested and put forth as hypotheses.

The grammar used is weak and communicaiton and language needs to be improved significantly.



*** How-to-submit-a-revision.doc**

33K



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management - IJPPM-04-2020-0181.R1

1 pesan

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management22 Agustus 2020 pukul
23.06

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Balas Ke: jeniwebster123@gmail.com

Kepada: bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id, noorlailie-s@feb.unair.ac.id, vivianinadyaningrum@gmail.com, aisyah.pns@gmail.com

22-Aug-2020

Dear Prof. Tjahjadi,

Your revised manuscript entitled "Human capital readiness and global market orientation in Indonesian MSMEs business performance" has been successfully submitted online and is presently being given full consideration for publication in the International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management.

Your manuscript ID is IJPPM-04-2020-0181.R1.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence or when calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or e-mail address, please log in to ScholarOne Manuscripts at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijppm> and edit your user information as appropriate.

You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Centre after logging in to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijppm>

Please note that Emerald requires you to clear permission to re-use any material not created by you. If there are permissions outstanding, please upload these when you submit your revision or send directly to Emerald if your paper is accepted immediately. Emerald is unable to publish your paper with permissions outstanding.

Open Access?

All of our subscription journals give you the option of publishing your article open access, following payment of an article processing charge (APC). To find the APC for your journal, please refer to the APC price list: http://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/openaccess/apc_price_list.pdf

Emerald has established partnerships with national consortium bodies to offer a number of APC vouchers for eligible regions and institutions. To check your eligibility please refer to the open access partnerships page: <http://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/openaccess/oapartnerships.htm>

If you would like to publish your article open access please contact openaccess@emeraldgroup.com

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management.

Yours sincerely,
Jennifer Webster
International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9781-729X>



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management - Decision on Manuscript ID IJPPM-04-2020-0181.R1

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management4 Oktober 2020 pukul
03.26

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Balas Ke: luisa.huatuco@york.ac.uk

Kepada: bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id, noorlailie-s@feb.unair.ac.id, vivianinadyaningrum@gmail.com, aisyah.pns@gmail.com

03-Oct-2020

Dear Tjahjadi, Bambang; Soewarno, Noorlailie; Nadyaningrum, Viviani; Aminy, Aisyah

It is a pleasure to accept your manuscript IJPPM-04-2020-0181.R1, entitled "Human capital readiness and global market orientation in Indonesian MSMEs business performance" in its current form for publication in International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management. Please note, no further changes can be made to your manuscript.

Please go to your Author Centre at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijppm> (Manuscripts with Decisions for the submitting author or Manuscripts I have co-authored for all listed co-authors) to complete the Copyright Transfer Agreement form (CTA). We cannot publish your paper without this.

All authors are requested to complete the form and to input their full contact details. If any of the contact information is incorrect you can update it by clicking on your name at the top right of the screen. Please note that this must be done prior to you submitting your CTA.

If you have an ORCID please check your account details to ensure that your ORCID is validated.

By publishing in this journal your work will benefit from Emerald EarlyCite. As soon as your CTA is completed your manuscript will pass to Emerald's Content Management department and be processed for EarlyCite publication. EarlyCite is the author proofed, typeset version of record, fully citable by DOI. The EarlyCite article sits outside of a journal issue and is paginated in isolation. The EarlyCite article will be collated into a journal issue according to the journals' publication schedule.

FOR OPEN ACCESS AUTHORS: Please note if you have indicated that you would like to publish your article as Open Access via Emerald's Gold Open Access route, you are required to complete a Creative Commons Attribution Licence - CCBY 4.0 (in place of the standard copyright assignment form referenced above). You will receive a follow up email within the next 30 days with a link to the CCBY licence and information regarding payment of the Article Processing Charge. If you have indicated that you might be eligible for a prepaid APC voucher, you will also be informed at this point if a voucher is available to you (for more information on APC vouchers please see <http://www.emeraldpublishing.com/oapartnerships>)

Thank you for your contribution. On behalf of the Editors of International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management, we look forward to your continued contributions to the Journal.

Yours sincerely,

Dr. Luisa Huaccho Huatuco

Editor, International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

luisa.huatuco@york.ac.uk



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

Copyright Form Reminder: International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

1 pesan

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

5 Oktober 2020 pukul
18.16

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Balas Ke: jeniwebster123@gmail.com

Kepada: bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id

05-Oct-2020

Dear Prof. Tjahjadi,

Recently, your manuscript entitled 'Human capital readiness and global market orientation in Indonesian MSMEs business performance' (IJPPM-04-2020-0181.R1) was accepted for publication in International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management. This e-mail is a reminder that you have not yet completed a copyright form. We are unable to publish your paper without it.

When completing this form please take the opportunity to check that your contact details are correct. If your details need to be updated, please access your account details by clicking on your name at the top right of the screen. Please note that this must be done prior to you submitting your copyright form.

You can access the form by clicking on the following link:

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijppm?URL_MASK=e07a9deb190148cfa87dab01528074a3

If you have any questions, please let me know.

Yours sincerely,

Jennifer Webster

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management, Editorial Office

jeniwebster123@gmail.com

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

4 pesan

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management7 Oktober 2020 pukul
20.23

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Balas Ke: Sharon.Emerald@cenveo.com

Kepada: bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id

07-Oct-2020

IJPPM-04-2020-0181.R1 - Human capital readiness and global market orientation in Indonesian MSMEs business performance

Dear Prof. Tjahjadi,

On regular checks we noticed that in Table word file Table 1 is in non editable format. Please provide editable format for table 1 rest all tables are fine.

Please provide your response at earliest inconvenience.

Yours sincerely,

Sharon Kanappally

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

9 Oktober 2020 pukul 23.27

Kepada: Inar <asha.j.vet@gmail.com>

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

10 Oktober 2020 pukul 09.34

Kepada: Sharon.Emerald@cenveo.com

Dear Sharon Kanappally,

International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

I apologize for the inconvenience caused to you. Through this email, I will attach the editable form of Table 1. Thank you for your hard work and cooperation.

Best Regards,

Bambang Tjahjadi

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

**Table 1 IJPPM.docx**

16K

Emerald, Sharon <Sharon.Emerald@cenveo.com>

22 Oktober 2020 pukul 00.26

Kepada: Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

Dear Prof. Tjahjadi,

Thank you for your response. We shall now proceed further

Regards,

Sharon

From: Bambang Tjahjadi [mailto:bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id]
Sent: Saturday, October 10, 2020 8:05 AM
To: Emerald, Sharon <Sharon.Emerald@cenveo.com>
Subject: Re: International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

--> External email-verify any links or attachments are safe and trusted <--

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Bambang Tjahjadi <bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id>

IJPPM - Human capital readiness and global market orientation in Indonesian Micro-, Small- and-Medium-sized Enterprises business performance, is now published online.

adminTrackit@emeraldpublishing.com <adminTrackit@emeraldpublishing.com>

1 November 2020 pukul
00.47

Kepada: bambang.tjahjadi@feb.unair.ac.id

31-Oct-2020

IJPPM - International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management

Emerald Insight Date: 31-Oct-2020

I am pleased to inform you that Human capital readiness and global market orientation in Indonesian Micro-, Small- and-Medium-sized Enterprises business performance of *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management* has been published on Emerald Insight.

Should you have any queries please do not hesitate to contact the Production Department.

Best Wishes,

S.Arounkumar

Emerald Production Department

Emerald Group Limited, Registered Office: Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley, BD16 1WA United Kingdom. Registered in England No. 3080506, VAT No. GB 665 3593 06