

From: Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office <medicine.editorial.office@frontiersin.org>
To: Gatot Soegiarto <gatotsby@yahoo.com>
Sent: Wednesday, June 15, 2022 at 02:31:02 PM GMT+7
Subject: Action needed: Your new review assignment - 942686

Dear Dr Soegiarto,

Thank you for accepting to review the manuscript "Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART". In order to keep the review process timely, please aim to complete your review report by 22 Jun 2022 via this link <https://review.frontiersin.org/review/bootstrap/f235c924-2b78-4ae8-9220-5a1e6ff5b0c9>

You will be presented with an online structured questionnaire that will guide you through the review, focusing on objective criteria. Where appropriate, please provide detailed feedback to the authors on how they can improve the manuscript.

You can find full Review Guidelines here https://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/ReviewGuidelines.aspx?s=1762&name=infectious_diseases_-_surveillance,_prevention_and_treatment

Many thanks for taking the time to support the review process of this submission, and for providing the authors with expert feedback and valuable input.

Best regards,

Your Frontiers in Medicine team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team
www.frontiersin.org

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34,
1005 Lausanne, Switzerland

Office T 0041 215 18 91 64

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk (support@frontiersin.org) or visit our Frontiers Help Center (zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us)

-----MANUSCRIPT DETAILS-----

Manuscript title: Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART
Manuscript ID: 942686
Authors: Ketut Suryana, Hamong Suharsono, Luh Nyoman Wisma Ariani, Ni Putu Ayu Riska Yunita Sari and Agung Wiwiek Indrayani
Journal: Frontiers in Medicine, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment
Article type: Original Research
Submitted on: 12 May 2022
Edited by: Alberto Cagigi

-----FURTHER INFORMATION-----

What happens after I complete my review report? Once you have submitted your report, the handling editor will assess the level of revisions needed and will activate the Interactive Review Forum. There, the authors will receive and respond to your comments. During the Interactive Review, you can directly discuss with the authors their responses and the revisions needed. You can at any stage contact the handling editor or the Editorial Office if you need advice.

How can I make a final recommendation or withdraw from the process? You can finalize your involvement by choosing one of three options:

1. Endorse the manuscript for publication. After the authors have addressed your comments, you can choose to endorse publication of the manuscript. If you have no revisions request for the authors, you can endorse the manuscript already in the Independent Review stage. In this case your review will become finalized, and your reviewer tab will be closed. If the paper is accepted, your name will publicly appear on the article as confirmation that you validated this contribution as rigorous scholarly work. You should only endorse the manuscript if it has been sufficiently revised to address raised concerns, and the work is accurate as well as presented in an adequate language level.

2. Recommend rejection to the Editor. At any stage of the review process you may recommend rejection to the Editor, in which case you will remain anonymous to the authors. If you submitted a report and comments, they will remain visible but closed from further discussion. You should choose this option if the manuscript contains objective errors or ethical issues that cannot be rectified during revisions.

3. Withdraw from the review process. If you are unable to continue because of, for example, time constraints, you may withdraw at any stage of the review process and you will remain anonymous to the authors. Your report and comments will remain visible, but closed from further discussion.

What do I need to consider to ensure an ethical review?

1. If you detect a potential conflict of interest between you, the editors, the authors or their work, you should contact the Editorial Office immediately.

2. The manuscript should remain confidential during the review process. The contents of the discussions in the Review Forum are also confidential and may not be shared even after publication.

3. Reviewers are anonymous during the review process and we encourage you to preserve this anonymity until endorsement and acceptance.

You are receiving this email regarding ongoing activities you have with Frontiers. If you think this was wrongly sent to you, please contact our support team at support@frontiersin.org

From: Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office <medicine.editorial.office@frontiersin.org>
To: "gatotsby@yahoo.com" <gatotsby@yahoo.com>
Sent: Thursday, June 16, 2022 at 02:56:31 PM GMT+7
Subject: Frontiers: Thank you for submitting your Independent Review Report! - 942686

Dear Dr Soegiarto,

Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office has sent you a message. Please click 'Reply' to send a direct response

Thank you for submitting your independent review report for the manuscript "Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART". The handling editor has been notified, and you can find a copy of your report below.

You will be informed once the interactive review process is activated, to allow direct discussion with the authors. Until this next stage, you can still modify your report if you have any outstanding comments.

You can access your report and the manuscript online using the following link:

<http://www.frontiersin.org/Review/EnterReviewForum.aspx?activationno=aa2e8551-f9fa-4213-8f21-bf81a47b353a&retab=2>

To familiarize yourself further with the Frontiers review guidelines:

http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/ReviewGuidelines.aspx?s=1762&name=infectious_diseases_-_surveillance,_prevention_and_treatment

Best regards,

Your Frontiers in Medicine team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team
www.frontiersin.org

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34,
1005 Lausanne, Switzerland

Office T 0041 215 18 91 64

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk (support@frontiersin.org) or visit our Frontiers Help Center (zendsk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us)

Manuscript title: Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART
Manuscript ID: 942686
Authors: Ketut Suryana, Hamong Suharsono, Luh Nyoman Wisma Ariani, Ni Putu Ayu Riska Yunita Sari, Agung Wiwiek Indrayani
Journal: Frontiers in Medicine, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment
Article type: Original Research
Submitted on: 12 May 2022
Edited by: Alberto Cagigi

Independent Review Report, Reviewer: Gatot Soegiarto

EVALUATION

Please list your revision requests for the authors and provide your detailed comments, including

highlighting limitations and strengths of the study and evaluating the validity of the methods, results, and data interpretation. If you have additional comments based on Q2 and Q3 you can add them as well.

Overall, the manuscript was written in not a good English grammar. The scope of the research is not considered interesting, given the facts that hematologic assessment and monitoring (ESR, etc) is not considered a useful test in HIV patients.

In the background section of the abstract and the full text manuscript, the authors did not raise clearly the problem(s) that make this research worth to be done. CD4 cell count and viral load evaluation had been accepted as a valid parameter in HIV patient management and monitoring. Only in resources-limited countries that those parameters cannot be evaluated routinely in HIV patients, and Indonesia is not considered as such.

The authors also did not mention why the data from Wangaya hospital is of particular importance to be evaluated compared to other hospitals in Bali.

Data were presented, but it will be better to present the precise regimen of ARV used by the subjects, the duration of ARV usage, and their association with the successful viral load suppression achievement.

The authors performed bivariate analysis to determine the association(s) of variables with HIV viral load (Table 2). They did identify a significant correlation between HAART adverse effects with the viral load, but did not elaborate further about this findings in the results and discussion sections. Perhaps it would be proper to discuss that the presence of HAART adverse effect would lead to subject's low adherence to the drugs and eventually lead to a higher viral load (?). ESR could also caused by other conditions than merely the HIV infection or viral load (such as the presence of uncontrolled opportunistic infections, cardiac or endothelial or metabolic risk factors). Unfortunately the authors did not raise this possibility in the data that they presented nor in the discussion. I think it would be more interesting to look for whether elevated ESR could be an indication of the presence of opportunistic infection(s) in these patients that should alerted the attending physician. The authors also did not perform multivariate analysis to determine whether ESR or other variables independently associated with viral load suppression.

Check List

a. Is the quality of the figures and tables satisfactory?

No

b. Does the reference list cover the relevant literature adequately and in an unbiased manner?

Yes

c. Are the statistical methods valid and correctly applied? (e.g. sample size, choice of test)

Yes

d. Is a statistician required to evaluate this study?

Yes

e. Are the methods sufficiently documented to allow replication studies?

Yes

QUALITY ASSESSMENT:

Rigor

3

Quality of the writing

2

Overall quality of the content

2

Interest to a general audience

2

From: Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office <medicine.editorial.office@frontiersin.org>
To: Gatot Soegiarto <gatotsby@yahoo.com>
Sent: Saturday, July 2, 2022 at 12:23:49 PM GMT+7
Subject: New author comments in the Review Forum - 942686

Dear Dr Soegiarto,

New comments were just posted by author Ketut Suryana, for the manuscript "Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART".

Please visit the discussion forum to review these comments within the next few days:

<https://review.frontiersin.org/review/bootstrap/a154874e-60e6-40f6-a476-f0df124522f6>

You should then take one of the following actions:

1. Endorse publication: the authors satisfactorily addressed your comments, and you agree to be listed as a reviewer on the manuscript, if published.
2. Post comments: you have further concerns you would like the authors to address. Use the comment boxes under each review question to communicate these, and "Submit all Comments" at the end.
3. Recommend rejection: the authors are unable or unwilling to address your comments, or you have found the manuscript to contain objective errors or ethical issues that cannot be resolved. Your recommendation will be sent to the handling editor while you will remain anonymous to the authors and will not be asked to participate any further in the review process. Your report will remain available in the review forum.

When reviewing the authors' responses, bear in mind that your mandate is to evaluate the accuracy and validity of the manuscript, not its potential impact.

Many thanks for your time participating in the collaborative review process of this manuscript. You can contact us should you have any questions.

Best regards,

Your Frontiers in Medicine team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team
www.frontiersin.org

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34,
1005 Lausanne, Switzerland

Office T 0041 215 18 91 64

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk (support@frontiersin.org) or visit our Frontiers Help Center (zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us)

Manuscript title: Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART

Manuscript ID: 942686

Authors: Ketut Suryana, Hamong Suharsono, Luh Nyoman Wisma Ariani, Ni Putu Ayu Riska Yunita Sari and Agung Wiwiek Indrayani

Journal: Frontiers in Medicine, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment

Article type: Original Research

Submitted on: 12 May 2022

Edited by: Alberto Cagigi

Frontiers Review Guidelines

To ensure an efficient review process, please familiarize yourself with the Frontiers review guidelines (link below). The Frontiers review process has unique features, including an interactive review stage, and a focus on objective criteria. Reviewers are named on publications they endorse to acknowledge their contribution.

<https://www.frontiersin.org/about/review-system>

You are receiving this email regarding ongoing activities you have with Frontiers. If you think this was wrongly sent to you, please contact our support team at support@frontiersin.org

From: Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office <medicine.editorial.office@frontiersin.org>
To: Gatot Soegiarto <gatotsby@yahoo.com>
Sent: Saturday, July 2, 2022 at 12:30:00 PM GMT+7
Subject: Updated Manuscript Submitted in the Interactive Review Forum - 942686

Dear Dr Soegiarto,

The author Ketut Suryana submitted a revised manuscript in the interactive review forum of the manuscript "Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART" (942686).

Please verify the latest manuscript and replies from the authors in the interactive review forum as soon as possible:

<https://review.frontiersin.org/review/bootstrap/81cc003a-1c91-44df-bb49-a0c7deab8dfb>

If you think the revised manuscript addresses your feedback to your satisfaction, you can proceed to "Finalize My Review". This action will notify the associate editor that your review is completed and that the authors addressed all issues you raised. If you feel that your comments were not sufficiently addressed, please let the authors know by posting further comments.

You can contact us by replying to this email should you have any questions.

Best regards,

Your Frontiers in Medicine team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team
www.frontiersin.org

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34,
1005 Lausanne, Switzerland

Office T 0041 215 18 91 64

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk (support@frontiersin.org) or visit our Frontiers Help Center (zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us)

Manuscript title: Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART
Manuscript ID: 942686
Journal: Frontiers in Medicine, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment
Article type: Original Research
Authors: Ketut Suryana, Hamong Suharsono, Luh Nyoman Wisma Ariani, Ni Putu Ayu Riska Yunita Sari and Agung Wiwiek Indrayani
Submitted on: 12 May 2022
Edited by: Alberto Cagigi

Frontiers Review Guidelines

To ensure an efficient review process, please familiarize yourself with the Frontiers review guidelines. The Frontiers review process has unique features, including an interactive review stage, and a focus on objective criteria.

https://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/ReviewGuidelines.aspx?s=1762&name=infectious_diseases_-_surveillance,_prevention_and_treatment

You are receiving this email regarding ongoing activities you have with Frontiers. If you think this was wrongly sent to you, please contact our support team at support@frontiersin.org

From: Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office <medicine.editorial.office@frontiersin.org>
To: "gatotsby@yahoo.com" <gatotsby@yahoo.com>
Sent: Sunday, July 3, 2022 at 12:24:10 PM GMT+7
Subject: Frontiers: Authors have replied to you: action needed

Dear Dr Soegiarto,

Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office has sent you a message. Please click 'Reply' to send a direct response

The authors of the manuscript you are currently reviewing, "Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART", responded to you in the review forum, accessible at: <http://www.frontiersin.org/Review/EnterReviewForum.aspx?activationno=28c8e9e0-3291-401a-a850-c28347155bcf>

After reviewing the authors' responses, please take one of the following actions in the next three days:

1. Endorse publication: the authors satisfactorily addressed your comments, and you agree to be listed as a reviewer on the manuscript, if published.
2. Post comments: you have further concerns you would like the authors to address. Use the comment boxes under each review question to communicate these, and "Submit all Comments" at the end.
3. Recommend rejection: the authors are unwilling or unable to address your comments, or you have found the manuscript to contain objective errors or ethical issues. Your recommendation will be sent to the handling editor while you will remain anonymous to the authors and will not be asked to participate any further in the review process. Your comments will remain available in the Review Forum.
4. Withdraw: you have become unavailable and are no longer able to participate. You will remain anonymous to the authors and your comments will remain available in the Review Forum.
5. Request extension: you are not able to take action today and would like to be given more time to perform your review.

When reviewing the authors' responses, bear in mind that your mandate is to evaluate the accuracy and validity of the manuscript, not its potential impact. This will be determined post-publication on our Article and Authors Impact Metrics platform. Read more at <https://www.frontiersin.org/about/review-system>.

Many thanks for your time participating in the collaborative review process of this submission.

Best regards,

Your Frontiers in Medicine team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team
www.frontiersin.org

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34,
1005 Lausanne, Switzerland

Office T 0041 215 18 91 64

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk (support@frontiersin.org) or visit our Frontiers Help Center (zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us)

-----MANUSCRIPT DETAILS-----

Journal: Frontiers in Medicine, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment

Article type: Original Research

Manuscript title: Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART

Manuscript ID: 942686

Authors: Ketut Suryana, Hamong Suharsono, Luh Nyoman Wisma Ariani, Ni Putu Ayu Riska Yunita
Sari, Agung Wiwiek Indrayani

From: Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office <medicine.editorial.office@frontiersin.org>
To: "gatotsby@yahoo.com" <gatotsby@yahoo.com>
Sent: Wednesday, July 6, 2022 at 12:24:16 PM GMT+7
Subject: Frontiers: Authors have replied to you: action needed

Dear Dr Soegiarto,

Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office has sent you a message. Please click 'Reply' to send a direct response

We would like to follow-up on our previous email, as the authors of the manuscript "Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART" have recently responded in the review forum. If you think that the authors' replies have addressed your comments and concerns satisfactorily, please click on "Endorse publication".

If you think that your concerns were not sufficiently addressed, please let the authors know by posting further comments. Alternatively, should you not think that the manuscript can be adequately revised or do not wish to take further part in the discussion, please click on "Withdraw from review/Recommend rejection".

Please take action in the discussion forum in the next three days. The forum is designed to allow more than one round of comments and replies, where appropriate, and comments are visible to all participants.

To view the manuscript and respond to the authors, please click on the following link:
<http://www.frontiersin.org/Review/EnterReviewForum.aspx?activationno=76ebfd1f-d731-4069-97d9-d5e55e089df8>

Should you require more time to submit your feedback, please do let us know by clicking on "Request Extension" on the review forum.

Thank you very much for your expert contribution to the review of this manuscript. Please contact us if you need additional time to address the authors' responses.

Best regards,

Your Frontiers in Medicine team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team
www.frontiersin.org

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34,
1005 Lausanne, Switzerland

Office T 0041 215 18 91 64

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk (support@frontiersin.org) or visit our Frontiers Help Center (zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us)

Manuscript title: Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART
Manuscript ID: 942686
Journal: Frontiers in Medicine, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment
Article type: Original Research
Authors: Ketut Suryana, Hamong Suharsono, Luh Nyoman Wisma Ariani, Ni Putu Ayu Riska Yunita Sari, Agung Wiwiek Indrayani

From: Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office <medicine.editorial.office@frontiersin.org>
To: "gatotsby@yahoo.com" <gatotsby@yahoo.com>
Sent: Saturday, July 9, 2022 at 04:54:25 PM GMT+7
Subject: Frontiers: Authors have replied to you: action needed

Dear Dr Soegiarto,

Frontiers in Medicine Editorial Office has sent you a message. Please click 'Reply' to send a direct response

We would like to follow-up on our previous email, as the authors of the manuscript "Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART" have recently responded in the review forum. If you think that the authors' replies have addressed your comments and concerns satisfactorily, please click on "Endorse publication".

If you think that your concerns were not sufficiently addressed, please let the authors know by posting further comments. Alternatively, should you not think that the manuscript can be adequately revised or do not wish to take further part in the discussion, please click on "Withdraw from review/Recommend rejection".

Please take action in the discussion forum in the next three days. The forum is designed to allow more than one round of comments and replies, where appropriate, and comments are visible to all participants.

To view the manuscript and respond to the authors, please click on the following link:
<http://www.frontiersin.org/Review/EnterReviewForum.aspx?activationno=e8e16386-9e2a-4956-9115-d2e98120cc58>

Should you require more time to submit your feedback, please do let us know by clicking on "Request Extension" on the review forum.

Thank you very much for your expert contribution to the review of this manuscript. Please contact us if you need additional time to address the authors' responses.

Best regards,

Your Frontiers in Medicine team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team
www.frontiersin.org

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34,
1005 Lausanne, Switzerland

Office T 0041 215 18 91 64

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk (support@frontiersin.org) or visit our Frontiers Help Center (zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us)

Manuscript title: Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART
Manuscript ID: 942686
Journal: Frontiers in Medicine, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment
Article type: Original Research
Authors: Ketut Suryana, Hamong Suharsono, Luh Nyoman Wisma Ariani, Ni Putu Ayu Riska Yunita Sari, Agung Wiwiek Indrayani

Marc Struelens (Via FrontiersIn)

To: gatotsby@yahoo.com

Dear Dr Soegiarto,

This is to notify you that the following manuscript you were reviewing could not be accepted for publication. Thank you very much for your time and effort invested. Note that your identity will not be revealed to the authors.

Manuscript title: Association of viral load suppression with neutrophil to lymphocyte ratio, erythrocyte sedimentation rate levels, CD4+ T cell count and other factors in people with HIV on HAART

Manuscript ID: 942686

Journal: Frontiers in Medicine, section Infectious Diseases – Surveillance, Prevention and Treatment

Article type: Original Research

Authors: Ketut Suryana, Hamong Suharsono, Luh Nyoman Wisma Ariani, Ni Putu Ayu Riska Yunita Sari, Agung Wiwiek Indrayani

Edited by: Alberto Cagigi

You can access the review forum with the manuscript and comments using the following link:

<http://www.frontiersin.org/Review/EnterReviewForum.aspx?activationno=3f7bd98a-7c89-474d-b412-bea6ee559788>

With best regards,

Marc Struelens

Specialty Chief Editor,

www.frontiersin.org

We want to hear about your experience with Frontiers.

We are constantly striving to improve our peer review process, please complete our short 3-minute survey to tell us about your experience, your opinion is important and will guide future development.

https://frontiersin.qualtrics.com/jfe/form/SV_9sfHMjCrBqCCUYe?survey=reviewerrej&Decision=Rejected&ArticleId=942686&UserId=1867049

Thank you very much for taking the time to share your comments.