



Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

[JPSS] Validate Your Account

1 message

Sarayut Sakultantimetha via Thai Journals Online (ThaiJO) <admin@tci-thaijo.org>

25 August 2021 at 11:25

Reply-To: Sarayut Sakultantimetha <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>

To: Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

Dear Lilik Sugiharti,

You have created an account with Journal of Population and Social Studies [JPSS], but before you can start using it, you need to validate your email account. To do this, simply follow the link below:

https://so03.tci-thaijo.org/index.php/jpss/user/activateUser/lilik_sugiharti/HzccJj7K

Submission Confirmation - [EMID:66f9cd5deffc7140]

1 message

JPSS <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: JPSS <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>
To: Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

11 September 2021 at 09:12

Dear Lilik Sugiharti,

Your submission entitled "Poverty dynamics in Indonesia: A deeper focus on chronic poverty" has been received by journal Journal of Population and Social Studies

You will be able to check on the progress of your paper by logging on to Editorial Manager as an author. The URL is <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jpass/>.

Your manuscript will be given a reference number once an Editor has been assigned.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Editorial Team
Journal of Population and Social Studies

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jpass/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

[JPSS] Submission Acknowledgement

1 message

Sarayut Sakultantimetha via Thai Journals Online (ThaiJO) <admin@tci-thaijo.org>

27 August 2021 at 21:23

Reply-To: Sarayut Sakultantimetha <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>

To: Dr Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>, Rudi Purwono <rudipurwono@feb.unair.ac.id>, Ari <aridwijayanti00@gmail.com>

Dear Author,

I am writing to acknowledge receipt of your manuscript entitled: "Poverty dynamics in Indonesia: A deeper focus on chronic poverty", submitted to the Journal of Population and Social Studies (JPSS).

Please be informed that your manuscript will first go through editorial review and if it meets the journal's requirements with regard to content, scope, format, and quality of the language and writing style, it will be reviewed by two peer reviewers. Comments from the reviews will be sent to you for revision, if recommended, as soon as they are ready.

If you have any queries, please feel free to contact us at anytime.

Thank you very much for your submission to JPSS.

A manuscript number has been assigned to your submitted paper - [EMID:272375c1aea3eca6]

1 message

JPSS <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: JPSS <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>
To: Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

11 September 2021 at 09:14

Dear Lilik Sugiharti,

Your submission entitled "Poverty dynamics in Indonesia: A deeper focus on chronic poverty" has been assigned the following manuscript number: JPASS-D-21-00275.

You will be able to check on the progress of your paper by logging on to Editorial Manager as an author.
The URL is <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jpass/>.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Best regards,

Editorial Team
Journal of Population and Social Studies

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jpass/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Editor Decision - Revise - [EMID:37ef8e87a730af16]

3 messages

JPSS <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: JPSS <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>
To: Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

8 December 2021 at 16:04

Dear Dr. *Dr Lilik Sugiharti*,

Please be advised that we have now received comments from our reviewers on your paper titled, "**Poverty dynamics in Indonesia: A deeper focus on chronic poverty**".

For your guidance, reviewers' comments are appended below.

We would like to request you to revise and resubmit your paper. Please complete your revisions and re-submit by **2022-01-15 23:59:59**.

When revising your paper, please **use tracked change mode**, and please prepare a response to the comments table for all comments made by the reviewers. Kindly use page number and line number to indicate the changes which you have made. And for your response table, please explain your responses in details, we would like to know how you incorporate suggestions and critiques from reviewers.

To submit a revision, go to <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jpass/> and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item call Submission Needing Revision. You will find your submission record there.

We look forward to your revision soon.

Best Regards,

Editorial Team
Journal of Population and Social Studies

Comments from the Editor and Reviewers :

Reviewer 2: No additional comments

Reviewer's Responses to Questions

Significance of the paper and its contribution to the field of population and social studies (please indicate if there are major strengths and weaknesses)

Reviewer #1: The study is of definite interest to the field. The paper studies the prevalence and courses of chronic poverty in Indonesia using Equally Distributed Equivalent (EDE) poverty gap method. In general, the study is quite similar to Mai & Mahadevan (2016). But the current study includes more recent data from 2014 and it addresses the causes of chronic poverty through quantile regression.

Overall the paper provides a thorough investigation into chronic poverty in Indonesia and the results are clearly presented. However, the data and methods employed need to be explained in more detailed.

Reviewer #2: The article is written on the current topic of chronic poverty and fits the journal's topics. In many ways, the article is consonant with previous studies, to which the authors abundantly refer. However, the strong point is the extensive knowledge and description of scientific articles, as well as the features of the applied methodology, in particular, the district level poverty lines and the use of quantile regression.

Accuracy and appropriateness of the title and abstract

Reviewer #1: The title could be more precise. In particular the second part "A deeper focus on chronic poverty", should be reformulated. A suggestion would be: Poverty dynamics in Indonesia: The prevalence and causes of chronic poverty.

The abstract is precise, summarizing the main methods and findings of the article.

Reviewer #2: The abstract reflects the article. However, it should be noted that the authors emphasize that in their study, in contrast to the previous ones, it was revealed that the largest component of poverty among Indonesian households (77%) was chronic. This is a very strong statement considering that the article itself contains references to earlier studies already showing similar results.

Clarity of the theme, purpose and rationale of the paper

Reviewer #1: The paper has two clear research questions. First, how many of the poor households in Indonesia are chronic poor. Second, what are the causes of chronic poverty?

Reviewer #2: Theme, purpose, and rationale of the paper are clear.

Relevance and sufficiency of the literature consulted (if possible, please suggest any additional literature that may be helpful)

Reviewer #1: The literature cited is sufficient and Table 1 summarizes the key findings from the literature. Therefore, I have nothing to add.

Reviewer #2: In general, the demonstrated knowledge and orientation in works on the research topic can be attributed to the strengths of the article. The only aspect that can be noted is that subsection 2.1, in the title of which "Chronic and Transient Poverty" are indicated, does not provide an analysis of works on transient poverty.

Appropriate use of theories or concepts to frame the study

Reviewer #1: One concept that is missing is poverty. The article needs to define poverty early on. In the Introduction I thought the article might be using the poverty line of \$1.90 from the World Bank, but then later it is stated that different poverty lines have been selected for different regions. How were those poverty lines selected? What is the conceptualization of poverty? How do these poverty lines differ compared to other studies. Because one reason why the current study finds more chronic poverty than other studies could be related to the poverty lines.

Reviewer #2: Concepts are used correctly and frame the study appropriately.

Appropriate use of the data and methods

Reviewer #1: The data and methods employed need to be explained more clearly.

Regarding the data, I am wondering why the study only included the last two rounds of the IFLS household survey. There are five rounds in total. So the study would benefit from including more years. At the moment chronic poverty is defined as households being poor in both 2007 and 2014. This is definitely a limitation, since a household could be poor in 2007 and 2014, but in-between the household was non-poor. If there were more years to back up chronic poverty that would surely be better. For example, Mai & Mahadevan (2016) uses all four waves of the IFLS study.

Another point relates to the sample size. This is very confusing. The IFLS survey consists of 12,779 households, but Table 3 states that 25,558 households are in chronic poverty. How can it be a larger number than the sample size of the survey? Also the vast majority of households in Indonesia live above the poverty line. Then in the quantile regression there are 2,873 households in each quantile, which sums up to 11,492 households in total?

Regarding the quantile regression analysis, what are the quantiles based on? If the whole sample is split into quantiles based on income, then only the lowest quantile would include poor households? Or are only the chronic poor households split by quantile, but what is then the comparison group? So I am not sure how the results can be interpreted. If education is significant in the 25% quantile, then households who have less education are more likely in chronic poverty compared to what? All households, compared to households in transient poverty?

Reviewer #2: The data and methods used are appropriate and well founded.

Clarity of tables and figures

Reviewer #1: In Table 3 and 7, what is the unit of the middle columns. In Table 7, are a and b percentages or absolute numbers? If they are percentages it would be better to write them in the same format as the last column for consistency.

Reviewer #2: Tables and figures are clear. The question arose regarding the description of the IFLS dataset that represents only 83% of the population in Indonesia.

Appropriate interpretation of the findings including soundness and internal consistency of reasoning and arguments advanced

Reviewer #1: Overall, the interpretations of the findings are sound and consistent. The only thing I disagree with is the variable gender. I don't think there is enough evidence to support the claim that female-headed households are more likely to fall into chronic poverty than male-headed households. The authors should include the numbers for female-headed households in Table 3. Then the emerging picture would become clearer. At the moment, we only know that they are different but not by how much they are different. Moreover, in Table 7 the variable gender is only significant for the 75% quantile at a significance level of 10%. In all other cases it is insignificant. Hence, we cannot deduct that gender matters across all chronic poor households.

Reviewer #2: There are several comments.

First. The authors state (lines 13-15 on page 11) "that households led by women or individuals above or below productive age are more exposed to chronic poverty, which should be prioritized in the poverty alleviation agenda". While data presented in lines 8-10 shows that the majority of chronically poor households are headed by men, which means that although measures for women are important, measures aimed at households headed by men may reduce chronic poverty to a greater extent.

Second. Lines 34-37 on page 11 show that chronic poverty and transient poverty make up more than 100%.

Third. Often the difference between groups is 3%, which raises questions about the significance of the differences found. For example, the authors state (lines 10-13 on page 14) "According to gender, female HHs have an average poverty of 0.097 (80% classified as chronic poverty). Meanwhile, male HHs have a total poverty of 0.058, with 77% chronically poor households". This raises the question: to what extent is the difference between these variables statistically significant? It might be appropriate to include in the paper the significance level.

Fourth. A statement "Gaps in educational attainment may provide higher welfare gains for those with higher attainment than those receiving minimal education" (lines 35-37 on page 19) requires clarification.

Clarity of the paper's organization and structure

Reviewer #1: More attention should be given to the formatting of the paper. For example, some headings are numbered while others are not.

Reviewer #2: The structure of the article is logically built and includes sections related to the introduction, literature review, the conceptual foundations of the research, the methodology and research results with discussion, and bibliography. However, It is not clear why there are question marks at the end of the section titles 2.2 and 2.3.

Clarity and conciseness of writing (please indicate if the language and writing style are of a publishable standard and if the paper requires language editing)

Reviewer #1: Overall, the paper is well written. However, there are a lot of spelling and grammar mistakes. Therefore, I would recommend getting the paper edited by a native speaker.

Reviewer #2: The language and writing style are of a publishable standard. I note one typo in the last paragraph on page 2 in a word "deprAvation".

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. ([Remove my information/details](#)). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

To: Miguel Angel <miguel@feb.unair.ac.id>

19 December 2021 at 08:52

Hi.. I have received this email last week but I am just opening right now, so sorry.. 🙄🙄🙄

Lilik Sugiharti

Department of Economics

Faculty of Economics and Business

Universitas Airlangga

Airlangga 4-6, Surabaya-Indonesia, 60286

[Quoted text hidden]

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>
To: JPSS <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>

19 December 2021 at 08:54

Dear the Editorial Team,

I have received the email, thank you so much for reviewing the paper.

regards,

Lilik Sugiharti

Department of Economics

Faculty of Economics and Business

Universitas Airlangga

Airlangga 4-6, Surabaya-Indonesia, 60286

[Quoted text hidden]

Submission Confirmation for JPASS-D-21-00275R1 - [EMID:993f13b40f7de1fc]

1 message

JPSS <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: JPSS <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>
To: Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

3 January 2022 at 17:37

Dear Dr Lilik Sugiharti,

Journal of Population and Social Studies has received your revised submission.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging onto Editorial Manager at (<https://www.editorialmanager.com/jpass/>).

Best Regards,
Editorial Team

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jpass/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Editor Decision - Accept - [EMID:0f993456a6af7177]

15 messages

JPSS <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: JPSS <jpss.ipr@gmail.com>
To: Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

21 January 2022 at 16:38

Ref.: Ms. No. JPASS-D-21-00275R1
Poverty dynamics in Indonesia: The Prevalence and causes of on chronic poverty
Journal of Population and Social Studies

Dear Dr Lilik Sugiharti,

The editor of Journal of Population and Social Studies (JPSS) has now reviewed the revised version of your paper. We are satisfied that you have successfully responded to the reviewers' comments, and are pleased to tell you that your paper is accepted for publication in our current volume.

Your paper must be edited for grammatical, typographical, and overall readability of the manuscript, as well as systematic reference checking and reference formatting in line with APA 7th Edition to meet the requirement of JPSS before publication.

As you are aware, effective January 2020, the authors of accepted papers for publication with JPSS are required to seek their own language editing service. If you recall, the Journal can provide language editing service upon request from you for a flat rate of 10,000 Thai Baht. If you choose to utilize the language editing service offered by JPSS, you would need to submit the full fee at this time, before the manuscript editing can begin. Once the paper is finalized, it will be formatted and then sent to you for final proofreading.

Thank you again for your interest in publishing in JPSS.

Best Regards

Editorial Team
Journal of Population and Social Studies

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jpass/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

 **00275 for editing by author.docx**
213K

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>
To: Miguel Angel <miguel@feb.unair.ac.id>

21 January 2022 at 17:19

Dear Miguel,

Here, I am forwarding the email from JPSS. Does it need any response? Thank you.

Lilik Sugiharti
Department of Economics
Faculty of Economics and Business
Universitas Airlangga
Airlangga 4-6, Surabaya-Indonesia, 60286

[Quoted text hidden]

 **00275 for editing by author.docx**
213K

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>
To: JPSS <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>

24 January 2022 at 22:19

Dear editorial team, we appreciate very much the help in the review process. Thanks for the opportunity given to us to publish our research in th JPSS journal.

Please find attached our final version of the manuscript. We did the following: 1) We had send the manuscript to a professional proofreader, and 2) we revised APA citation across the text and the list of references as well to make sure we meet the APA 7th edition rules.

Once again, thank you for the support during this process.

Lilik Sugiharti
Department of Economics
Faculty of Economics and Business
Universitas Airlangga
Airlangga 4-6, Surabaya-Indonesia, 60286

[Quoted text hidden]

 **Revised_Final_00275 for editing by author-2.docx**
216K

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>
To: JPSS <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>

16 February 2022 at 09:03


Dear the Editorial Team,

Thank you so much for your quick response.

Here, I try to resend the email I have sent before. Hopefully, it will work properly, and in case you do not see anything I would like to hear from you soon. Thank you, and have a nice day.

Lilik Sugiharti
Department of Economics
Faculty of Economics and Business
Universitas Airlangga
Airlangga 4-6, Surabaya-Indonesia, 60286

[Quoted text hidden]

 **Revised_Final_00275 for editing by author-2.docx**
216K

JPSS IPSR <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>
To: Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

16 February 2022 at 10:51

Dear Dr. Lilik Sugiharti,

Thank you very much.
We will get back to you shortly.
Best Regards,

Editorial Team
Journal of Population and Social Studies
Email: jpss.ipsr@gmail.com
Web: www.jpss.mahidol.ac.th
FB: Journal of Population and Social Studies - jpss
[Quoted text hidden]

JPSS IPSR <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>
To: Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

18 February 2022 at 10:32

Dear Dr. Lilik Sugiharti,

Please find the attached proofread paper.
There are some minor adjustments and some revision is required.

Please use track change mode when revising the paper and please provide your response underneath each of the comments.

Best Regards,

Editorial Team

Journal of Population and Social Studies

Email: jpss.ipsr@gmail.com

Web: www.jpss.mahidol.ac.th

FB: Journal of Population and Social Studies - jpss

[Quoted text hidden]



00275 edited by author (Proofreading Round 1).docx

222K

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

18 February 2022 at 10:40

To: Miguel Angel <miguel@feb.unair.ac.id>

I am forwarding the email from JPSS ya, thank you.. 🙏

[Quoted text hidden]

--

[Quoted text hidden]



00275 edited by author (Proofreading Round 1).docx

222K

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

18 February 2022 at 10:51

To: JPSS IPSR <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>

Dear the Editorial Team,

Thank you so much for the quick response.

regards,

[Quoted text hidden]

--

[Quoted text hidden]

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

19 February 2022 at 11:22

To: JPSS IPSR <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>

Dear editorial team,

Hopefully, this email finds you well.

Please find attached the revised manuscript.

We Accept the proposed changes, we change orientation of the page containing Table 1 as requested, and we added one hyperlink which was missing (as requested).

We would like to appreciate your kind assistance. We apologize for the missing editing details you encounter in the manuscript.

Thank you so much.

Warm regards

Lilik Sugiharti

Department of Economics

Faculty of Economics and Business

Universitas Airlangga

Airlangga 4-6, Surabaya-Indonesia, 60286

[Quoted text hidden]



00275 edited by author (Proofreading Round 1).docx

222K

JPSS IPSR <jpss.ipss@gmail.com>

20 February 2022 at 15:12

To: Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Lilik Sugiharti,

Please find the attached formatted version.

Please check the spelling of authors' names and affiliations, and proofread the paper one last time.

If you wish to make any minor changes, please use track change mode and provide your justification as well.

Best Regards,

Editorial Team

Journal of Population and Social Studies

Email: jpss.ipss@gmail.com

Web: www.jpss.mahidol.ac.th

FB: Journal of Population and Social Studies - jpss

[Quoted text hidden]



00275 - for proofread (final).docx

220K

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

20 February 2022 at 15:13

To: JPSS IPSR <jpss.ipss@gmail.com>

Thank you very much.

[Quoted text hidden]

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>
To: Miguel Angel <miguel@feb.unair.ac.id>

20 February 2022 at 15:15

Hi..

I am forwarding the email from JPSS, thank you.. 🙏

[Quoted text hidden]

 **00275 - for proofread (final).docx**
220K

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>
To: JPSS IPSR <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>

21 February 2022 at 20:03

Dear Editorial Team, thanks for the file.

We have revised the document and all spelling and names are correct. If possible we would like to propose:

- 1) Change Affiliation to the english name (correct) Airlangga University
- 2) We propose repositioning of tables so the manuscript looks a bit more near. In case the editorial team thinks it is ok. We are fine with any decision on the order, so please feel free to accept our proposed changes or keep the previous one.

Thanks for the help. We are ok with the current manuscript. Appreciate very much your help.

regards,

Lilik Sugiharti
Department of Economics
Faculty of Economics and Business
Universitas Airlangga
Airlangga 4-6, Surabaya-Indonesia, 60286

[Quoted text hidden]

 **00275 - for proofread (final).docx**
227K

JPSS IPSR <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>
To: Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

23 February 2022 at 15:26

Dear Dr. Lilik Sugiharti,

Please find the attached final version of the paper.

It will be published shortly.

Thank you very much for your patience and important contribution toward publishing your work with us.

Best Regards,

Editorial Team

Journal of Population and Social Studies

Email: jpss.ipsr@gmail.com

Web: www.jpss.mahidol.ac.th

FB: Journal of Population and Social Studies - jpss

[Quoted text hidden]

2 attachments



00275 JPSSv302022.025 Poverty Dynamics in Indonesia.docx

226K



00275 JPSSv302022.025 Poverty Dynamics in Indonesia.pdf

708K

Lilik Sugiharti <sugiharti.lilik@feb.unair.ac.id>

To: JPSS IPSR <jpss.ipsr@gmail.com>

23 February 2022 at 19:52

Dear the Editorial Team,

Greetings from Surabaya-Indonesia.

I have read and checked, and I think it is possible to continue the publication process.

I am so thankful for the quick responses.

warm regards,

Lilik Sugiharti

Department of Economics

Faculty of Economics and Business

Universitas Airlangga

Airlangga 4-6, Surabaya-Indonesia, 60286

[Quoted text hidden]