Mochamad Zakki <m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id>

Acknowledgement of your transferred manuscript submission to RSC Advances - RA-ART-10-2017-011247

1 message

RSC Advances <onbehalfof+advances+rsc.org@manuscriptcentral.com> Thu, Oct 12, 2017 at 3:24 PM
Reply-To: advances@rsc.org
To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id, zakkifahmi@gmail.com
Cc: niyyah7@gmail.com, miratul-k@fst.unair.ac.id, sitiwafiroh@fst.unair.ac.id, abdulloh@fst.unair.ac.id, m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id, zakkifahmi@gmail.com

12-Oct-2017

Dear Mr Fahmi:

TITLE: Incorporation of Graphene Oxide on Polyethersulfone Mixed Matrix Membrane to Enhance Hemodialysis Membrane Performance

Thank you for transferring your manuscript to RSC Advances, published by the Royal Society of Chemistry. This is an automatic acknowledgement that you have uploaded your files to our online submission system. Your manuscript ID is: RA-ART-10-2017-011247

Your manuscript will be passed to an editor for initial assessment as soon as possible. If there are any problems with your submission we will contact you.

RSC Advances became a gold open access journal from Issue 1, 2017. If accepted, your manuscript will be published open access and the appropriate article processing charge (APC) will apply. Discounts on APC waivers are available to some authors - for more details please see: http://www.rsc.org/journals-books-databases/about-journals/rsc-advances

Please note that RSC Advances no longer publishes 'Just Accepted' manuscripts; the time between acceptance and final publication is typically less than 10 days and therefore we no longer feel this provides a significant benefit to our authors. Instead, articles are published following editing and proofing and once the final, paginated PDF is ready for publication.

Please note that RSC Advances now only publishes Paper and Review type articles. If your transferred submission is a Communication type article, this will be changed to a Paper type article if accepted for publication.

Please indicate the above manuscript ID when you contact us about this submission. You can check the status of your manuscript by logging into your Author Centre (https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/rscadv).

Do you have an ORCID iD? ORCID (Open Researcher and Contributor iD) is a unique researcher identifier that allows you to link your research output and other professional activities in a single record. We therefore encourage each researcher to sign up for their own ORCID account. Please edit your user account to link your ORCID iD or create a new one, ensuring that you have not linked your account to another researcher's ORCID iD. If your article is accepted, you may choose to have your ORCID record updated automatically with details of the publication.

We already have the following information for authors of this manuscript: Wathoniyyah, Murobbiyatul - No ORCID iD Available, Khasanah, Miratul - No ORCID iD Available, Wafiroh, Siti - No ORCID iD Available, Abdulloh, Abdulloh - No ORCID iD Available, Fahmi, Mochamad Zakki - http://orcid.org/0000-0001-5430-9992

Please contact us if we can be of any assistance.

Yours sincerely,
RSC Advances Editorial Office
advances@rsc.org
****

Decision Letter (RA-ART-10-2017-011247)

From: advances@rsc.org

To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id, zakkifahmi@gmail.com

CC:

Subject: Decision on submission to RSC Advances - RA-ART-10-2017-011247

Body: 13-Nov-2017

Dear Mr Fahmi:

Manuscript ID: RA-ART-10-2017-011247
TITLE: Incorporation of Graphene Oxide on Polyethersulfone Mixed Matrix Membrane to Enhance Hemodialysis Membrane Performance

Thank you for your submission to RSC Advances, published by the Royal Society of Chemistry. I sent your manuscript to reviewers and I have now received their reports which are copied below.

I have carefully evaluated your manuscript and the reviewers' reports, and the reports indicate that major revisions are necessary.

Please submit a revised manuscript which addresses all of the reviewers' comments. Further peer review of your revised manuscript may be needed. When you submit your revised manuscript please include a point by point response to the reviewers' comments and highlight the changes you have made. Full details of the files you need to submit are listed at the end of this email.

Please submit your revised manuscript as soon as possible using this link:

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. ***

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/rscadv?URL_MASK=3c1a64ea7447442bad9f1de1cf6d131d

(This link goes straight to your account, without the need to log on to the system. For your account security you should not share this link with others.)

Alternatively, you can log in to your account (https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/rscadv) where you will need your case-sensitive user ID and password details.

You should submit your revised manuscript as soon as possible; please note you will receive a series of automatic reminders. If your revisions will take a significant length of time, please contact me.

The Royal Society of Chemistry requires the submitting author to provide their ORCID iD when they submit a revised manuscript. This is quick and easy to do as part of the revised manuscript submission process. We will publish this information with the article, and you may choose to have your ORCID record updated automatically with details of the publication.

Please also encourage your co-authors to sign up for their own ORCID account and associate it with their account on our manuscript submission system. Please note that we are unable to do this on behalf of your co-authors. For further information see: http://www.rsc.org/journals-books-databases/journal-authors-reviewers/processes-policies/#attribution-id.

I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Yours sincerely,
Dr Prasanta Kumar Mohapatra
Associate Editor, RSC Advances

****
REVIEWER REPORT(S):
Referee: 1

Recommendation: Major revisions

Comments:
In this manuscript, the authors prepared Graphene Oxide (GO) and further conjugated with Polyethersulfone (PES) to obtain mixed matrix membrane, which was utilized as creatinine candidate for creatinine filtering on hemodialysis process.
The experimental scheme was not elaborate, the Results and Discussion part was not clear enough. There are still some details need to pay attention and some problems need to be solved. This article was not suitable for publication in RSC Advances in its current form.
The questions have been listed as following:
1. In page 4, "Preparation of GO", tartaric acid was heated at varied temperature (270 °C, 300 °C, 350 °C, and 400

°C) for 3 hours. The heating rate was missing.
2. In page 4, "Fabrication of PES/GO membrane", the authors prepared different kind of GO (obtained under different temperatures), which one was used for the preparation of membranes? All kinds of the prepared GO should be involved to prepare different kinds of membranes. The effect of GO amount should also be invested. Furthermore, the authors declared that the added amount of PES was 17 mg, the amount of PES at this level was too low, which could not form membrane by phase inversion method.
3. In page 7, the authors declared that the GO was not observed in Figure 5. The magnification of the SEM image was 2.0k, which was too low to observe GO. The magnification should be further improved to observe GO sheets.
4. In page 7, "Water contact angle of PES and PES/GO membranes was started with 82.09° and 64.71°, respectively." The description was not coincident with the result of Figure 6.
5. In page 7, "Dialysis performance of PES and PES/GO membranes", the authors gave the solute flux of PES/GO membrane, the detailed test method of solute flux should be given, or whether it was water flux? And the authors declared that "Meanwhile, creatinine clearance value of PES/GO membranes shows higher creatinine removal than PES membranes", but the data of Table 3 showed different results.
6. The data of Table 1 were missing, and the figure numbers were disordered.
7. The evaluation of hemocompatibility was missing, which was essential for blood contacting materials.

Additional Questions:
Does the work significantly advance the understanding or development in this field?: Yes

Are the conclusions of the work convincing and sufficiently supported by experimental evidence?: No

Is the experimental section sufficiently detailed to allow others to reproduce the work?: No

Are the reported claims adequately discussed in the context of the literature?: No

Are the number of tables and figures in the manuscript appropriate and clear?: Yes

Do you want to get credit for reviewing this manuscript on Publons? [what's this?]
By selecting "Yes" you are opting in to the Publons service and data about this review (including your name and the review itself) will be transferred to Publons. Your review data are not publicly displayed and your reviewer anonymity is maintained. You may opt-out of the service at any time.: Yes

Referee: 2

Recommendation: Major revisions

Comments:
This paper is about the preparation of graphene oxide filled mixed matrix membranes for use in dialysis. GO has been a very popular material in the recent years, and the membrane application is interesting for membrane researchers and critical for public so that it is worth investigating. On the other hand, paper reports some results but does not discuss the results sufficiently. Therefore I would like to recommend this paper for publication after major revision.
1. What is the composition of coagulation bath? Water in coagulation bath results in formation of large finger-like pores, whereas some solvents like alcohols usually result in sponge-like structure. Why do they desire sponge-like pores as it may cause lower fluxes. If they use solvents in the coagulation bath, is it an advantage or disadvantage? Is there any dry phase inversion step as a skin layer formed? The membrane preparation procedure should be reported in more detail.
2. Based on Figure 5, the skin layer of PES is more porous than PES/GO, why does the flux through PES/GO is higher than PES?
3. The separation data is not sufficient to decide whether the GO containing membranes is succesful. The major contribution of GO is likely to reduce the membrane fouling as stated by the authors in the Introduction. The paper should report the fouling performance of the membranes. Beside the membrane performance (flux, selectivity and fouling) should be compared with similar membranes reported in the literature and with commercial membranes. Otherwise it is not possible to assess the contribution of GO to currently available polymeric membranes.
4. What does creatinine show in Scheme I?

Additional Questions:
Does the work significantly advance the understanding or development in this field?: No

Are the conclusions of the work convincing and sufficiently supported by experimental evidence?: No

Is the experimental section sufficiently detailed to allow others to reproduce the work?: No

Are the reported claims adequately discussed in the context of the literature?: Yes

Are the number of tables and figures in the manuscript appropriate and clear?: Yes

Do you want to get credit for reviewing this manuscript on Publons? [what's this?]
By selecting "Yes" you are opting in to the Publons service and data about this review (including your name and the review itself) will be transferred to Publons. Your review data are not publicly displayed and your reviewer anonymity is maintained. You may opt-out of the service at any time.: No

****
FILES TO PROVIDE WITH YOUR REVISED MANUSCRIPT:
IMPORTANT: Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission. Please carefully check the spelling and format of all author names, affiliations and funding information. If your paper is accepted for publication, it is important this information is

accurate to ensure your article is correctly indexed, which may affect citations and future funding evaluation.
• A point-by-point response to the comments made by the reviewer(s)
• Your revised manuscript with any changes clearly marked (.doc(x) or.pdf file)
• Your revised manuscript as a .doc(x) file including figures, without highlighting, track changes, etc. (If providing in TeX format instead, please also provide a final PDF version including figures). Please note that we cannot proceed with publication using a .pdf file only.
High quality figures
EITHER
embedded in a doc(x) file
OR
as numbered figures in separate files in .tif, or .eps format, with a resolution of 600 dpi or greater and structures preferably as ChemDraw files. Chemwindow files (.cwg/.cw2), ISIS/Draw exported in sketch format (.skc) and ChemSketch exported in ChemDraw format (.cdx) may also be supplied.

AND

• A table of contents entry: graphic maximum size 8 cm x 4 cm and one sentence of text, maximum 20 words, highlighting the novelty of the work
• Your revised Electronic Supplementary Information (if any)
• Your revised CheckCIF reports (if any). Please ensure that any revised cif files have been deposited with the Cambridge Crystallographic Data Centre (CCDC) via https://deposit.ccdc.cam.ac.uk/ before you submit your revised manuscript.

For Feature Articles/Review-type articles only:
• A photograph and biography of yourself and your co-authors. Separate photographs of each author may be supplied or if you prefer, a group photograph, saved as a .tif, .pdf or .jpeg file. The resolution of the photographs should be 600 dpi or higher. The dimensions of the photograph in the printed journal will be 4 cm wide x 5 cm high (individual photograph) or 8.3 cm wide x 5 cm high (group photograph). Individual photographs should be accompanied by a maximum of 100 words; a group photograph by a maximum of 200 words. There can be a maximum of 6 individual biographies per article.
• Copies of permissions required from other publishers to reproduce figures. Please ensure that necessary permissions are acknowledged in the figure captions in accordance with the publishers' instruction. Information on how to obtain permissions and rights that we require are given on our website at http://www.rsc.org/journals-books-databases/journal-authors-reviewers/licences-copyright-permissions/

****
****

Date Sent: 13-Nov-2017

Close Window

Decision Letter (RA-ART-10-2017-011247.R1)

From: advances@rsc.org

To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id, zakkifahmi@gmail.com

CC:

Subject: Decision on submission to RSC Advances - RA-ART-10-2017-011247.R1

Body: 08-Dec-2017

Dear Mr Fahmi:

Manuscript ID: RA-ART-10-2017-011247.R1
TITLE: Incorporation of Graphene Oxide on Polyethersulfone Mixed Matrix Membrane to Enhance Hemodialysis Membrane Performance

Thank you for submitting your revised manuscript to RSC Advances. After considering the changes you have made, I am pleased to accept your manuscript for publication in its current form. I have copied any final comments from the reviewer(s) below.

RSC Advances became a gold open access journal from Issue 1, 2017. Your manuscript will be published open access and the appropriate article processing charge (APC) will apply. Discounts on APC waivers are available to some authors - for more details please see: http://www.rsc.org/journals-books-databases/about-journals/rsc-advances

Please note that RSC Advances no longer publishes 'Just Accepted' manuscripts; the time between acceptance and final publication is typically less than 10 days and therefore we no longer feel this provides a significant benefit to our authors. Instead, articles are published following editing and proofing and once the final, paginated PDF is ready for publication.

We will email you information on how to access your RSC Advances article proofs shortly.

As an author you are entitled to a 25% discount on books published by the Royal Society of Chemistry. To receive this discount, enter the promotional code JLTH25 when purchasing from our online bookshop (pubs.rsc.org/bookshop). Please contact booksales@rsc.org if you have any problems.

Discover more Royal Society of Chemistry author services and benefits here:

http://www.rsc.org/Publishing/whyPublish.asp

Thank you for publishing with RSC Advances, a journal published by the Royal Society of Chemistry – the world's leading chemistry community, advancing excellence in the chemical sciences.

With best wishes,

Dr Prasanta Kumar Mohapatra
Associate Editor, RSC Advances

******
REVIEWER REPORT(S):
Referee: 1

Recommendation: Accept

Comments:
The manuscript now can be accepted.

Additional Questions:
Does the work significantly advance the understanding or development in this field?: Yes

Are the conclusions of the work convincing and sufficiently supported by experimental evidence?: Yes

Is the experimental section sufficiently detailed to allow others to reproduce the work?: Yes

Are the reported claims adequately discussed in the context of the literature?: Yes

Are the number of tables and figures in the manuscript appropriate and clear?: Yes

Do you want to get credit for reviewing this manuscript on Publons? [what's this?]
By selecting "Yes" you are opting in to the Publons service and data about this review (including your name and the review itself) will be transferred to Publons. Your review data are not publicly displayed and your reviewer anonymity is maintained. You may opt-out of the service at any time.: Yes

******

****

DISCLAIMER:

Date Sent: 08-Dec-2017

Close Window

Decision Letter (RA-ART-10-2017-011247.R1)

From: advances@rsc.org

To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id, zakkifahmi@gmail.com

CC:

Subject: Decision on submission to RSC Advances - RA-ART-10-2017-011247.R1

Body: 08-Dec-2017

Dear Mr Fahmi:

Manuscript ID: RA-ART-10-2017-011247.R1
TITLE: Incorporation of Graphene Oxide on Polyethersulfone Mixed Matrix Membrane to Enhance Hemodialysis Membrane Performance

Thank you for submitting your revised manuscript to RSC Advances. After considering the changes you have made, I am pleased to accept your manuscript for publication in its current form. I have copied any final comments from the reviewer(s) below.

RSC Advances became a gold open access journal from Issue 1, 2017. Your manuscript will be published open access and the appropriate article processing charge (APC) will apply. Discounts on APC waivers are available to some authors - for more details please see: http://www.rsc.org/journals-books-databases/about-journals/rsc-advances

Please note that RSC Advances no longer publishes 'Just Accepted' manuscripts; the time between acceptance and final publication is typically less than 10 days and therefore we no longer feel this provides a significant benefit to our authors. Instead, articles are published following editing and proofing and once the final, paginated PDF is ready for publication.

We will email you information on how to access your RSC Advances article proofs shortly.

As an author you are entitled to a 25% discount on books published by the Royal Society of Chemistry. To receive this discount, enter the promotional code JLTH25 when purchasing from our online bookshop (pubs.rsc.org/bookshop). Please contact booksales@rsc.org if you have any problems.

Discover more Royal Society of Chemistry author services and benefits here:

http://www.rsc.org/Publishing/whyPublish.asp

Thank you for publishing with RSC Advances, a journal published by the Royal Society of Chemistry – the world's leading chemistry community, advancing excellence in the chemical sciences.

With best wishes,

Dr Prasanta Kumar Mohapatra
Associate Editor, RSC Advances

******
REVIEWER REPORT(S):
Referee: 1

Recommendation: Accept

Comments:
The manuscript now can be accepted.

Additional Questions:
Does the work significantly advance the understanding or development in this field?: Yes

Are the conclusions of the work convincing and sufficiently supported by experimental evidence?: Yes

Is the experimental section sufficiently detailed to allow others to reproduce the work?: Yes

Are the reported claims adequately discussed in the context of the literature?: Yes

Are the number of tables and figures in the manuscript appropriate and clear?: Yes

Do you want to get credit for reviewing this manuscript on Publons? [what's this?]
By selecting "Yes" you are opting in to the Publons service and data about this review (including your name and the review itself) will be transferred to Publons. Your review data are not publicly displayed and your reviewer anonymity is maintained. You may opt-out of the service at any time.: Yes

******

****

Date Sent: 08-Dec-2017

Decision Letter (RA-ART-10-2017-011247.R1)

From: advances@rsc.org

To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id, zakkifahmi@gmail.com

CC:

Subject: Decision on submission to RSC Advances - RA-ART-10-2017-011247.R1

Body: 08-Dec-2017

Dear Mr Fahmi:

Manuscript ID: RA-ART-10-2017-011247.R1
TITLE: Incorporation of Graphene Oxide on Polyethersulfone Mixed Matrix Membrane to Enhance Hemodialysis Membrane Performance

Thank you for submitting your revised manuscript to RSC Advances. After considering the changes you have made, I am pleased to accept your manuscript for publication in its current form. I have copied any final comments from the reviewer(s) below.

RSC Advances became a gold open access journal from Issue 1, 2017. Your manuscript will be published open access and the appropriate article processing charge (APC) will apply. Discounts on APC waivers are available to some authors - for more details please see: http://www.rsc.org/journals-books-databases/about-journals/rsc-advances

Please note that RSC Advances no longer publishes 'Just Accepted' manuscripts; the time between acceptance and final publication is typically less than 10 days and therefore we no longer feel this provides a significant benefit to our authors. Instead, articles are published following editing and proofing and once the final, paginated PDF is ready for publication.

We will email you information on how to access your RSC Advances article proofs shortly.

As an author you are entitled to a 25% discount on books published by the Royal Society of Chemistry. To receive this discount, enter the promotional code JLTH25 when purchasing from our online bookshop (pubs.rsc.org/bookshop). Please contact booksales@rsc.org if you have any problems.

Discover more Royal Society of Chemistry author services and benefits here:

http://www.rsc.org/Publishing/whyPublish.asp

Thank you for publishing with RSC Advances, a journal published by the Royal Society of Chemistry – the world's leading chemistry community, advancing excellence in the chemical sciences.

With best wishes,

Dr Prasanta Kumar Mohapatra
Associate Editor, RSC Advances

******
REVIEWER REPORT(S):
Referee: 1

Recommendation: Accept

Comments:
The manuscript now can be accepted.

Additional Questions:
Does the work significantly advance the understanding or development in this field?: Yes

Are the conclusions of the work convincing and sufficiently supported by experimental evidence?: Yes

Is the experimental section sufficiently detailed to allow others to reproduce the work?: Yes

Are the reported claims adequately discussed in the context of the literature?: Yes

Are the number of tables and figures in the manuscript appropriate and clear?: Yes

Do you want to get credit for reviewing this manuscript on Publons? [what's this?]
By selecting "Yes" you are opting in to the Publons service and data about this review (including your name and the review itself) will be transferred to Publons. Your review data are not publicly displayed and your reviewer anonymity is maintained. You may opt-out of the service at any time.: Yes

******

****

DISCLAIMER:

Date Sent: 08-Dec-2017

Close Window