

---

**Fwd: Submission Confirmation for JECE-D-20-04223R2**

2 messages

---

**Satya Sakti** <satya.c.w.sakti@gmail.com>  
To: Mochamad Fahmi <m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id>

Sat, May 6, 2023 at 5:54 AM

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <em@editorialmanager.com>  
**Date:** 5 December 2020 21.02.11 GMT+7  
**To:** Satya Candra Wibawa Sakti <satya.c.w.sakti@gmail.com>  
**Subject:** Submission Confirmation for JECE-D-20-04223R2  
**Reply-To:** Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <jece@elsevier.com>

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-20-04223R2  
Title: Magnetic Hollow Buoyant Alginate Beads Achieving Rapid Remediation of Oil Contamination on Water  
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering  
Research Paper

Dear Dr. Satya Candra Wibawa Sakti,

This message is to acknowledge that we have received your revised manuscript for reconsideration for publication in Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging into the Editorial Manager as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/>.

Thank you for submitting your work to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Kind regards,

Editorial Manager  
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

\*\*\*\*\*

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EM via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

---

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

---

**Satya Sakti** <satya.c.w.sakti@gmail.com>  
To: Mochamad Fahmi <m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id>

Sat, May 6, 2023 at 5:54 AM

[Quoted text hidden]

**Your Submission - JECE-D-20-04223**

1 message

**Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering** <em@editorialmanager.com>

Wed, Oct 28, 2020 at 8:36 PM

Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering &lt;jece@elsevier.com&gt;

To: Satya Candra Wibawa Sakti &lt;satya.sakti@fst.unair.ac.id&gt;

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-20-04223

Title: Magnetic Hollow Buoyant Alginate Beads Achieving Rapid Remediation of Oil Contamination on Water

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Dear Dr. Sakti,

Thank you for submitting the above paper to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering. Your manuscript needs major revisions.

The reviewers comments are included below for your attention. Please carefully address the issues raised in the comments. I invite you to submit your revised manuscript.

The due date for submitting your revised manuscript is Nov 27, 2020

NOTE: Upon submitting your revised manuscript, please upload the source files for your article. We cannot accommodate PDF manuscript files for production purposes. We also ask that when submitting your revision, you follow the journal formatting guidelines. For additional details regarding acceptable file formats, please refer to the Guide for Authors at: <http://www.elsevier.com/journals/<slugified journal title>/<issn>/guide-for-authors>

If you are submitting a revised manuscript, please also:

a) outline each change made (point by point) as raised in the reviewer comments

AND

b) provide a suitable rebuttal to each reviewer comment not addressed

In order to facilitate the check of your manuscript, all the changes made during revision should appear in a different color. That is, the font color should be changed from black to red or blue (directly in the text) rather than using the track changes in Microsoft Word. A response letter for the revised manuscript should be sent to the editor along with your responses to the reviewer comments. These two steps are mandatory for the further review of the manuscript.

To submit your revision, please do the following:

1. Go to: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/>

2. Enter your login details

3. Click [Author Login]

This takes you to the Author Main Menu.

4. Click [Submissions Needing Revision]

PDFs are not acceptable revised manuscript files. Please prepare your manuscript text (with author details), tables, figure legends and any acknowledgements as a single Word file. Please prepare your Figures in an approved format (TIFF, EPS or MS Office files) with the correct resolution. Prepare any supporting information such as 'Response to Reviewers' as a separate Word file.

NOTE: Upon submitting your revised manuscript, please upload the source files for your article. For additional details regarding acceptable file formats, please refer to the Guide for Authors at: <http://www.elsevier.com/journals/journal-of-environmental-chemical-engineering/2213-3437/guide-for-authors>

When submitting your revised paper, we ask that you include the following items:

Manuscript and Figure Source Files (mandatory)

We cannot accommodate PDF manuscript files for production purposes. We also ask that when submitting your revision you follow the journal formatting guidelines. Figures and tables may be embedded within the source file for the submission as long as they are of sufficient visual quality. For any figure that cannot be embedded within the source file (such as \*.PSD Photoshop files), the original figure needs to be uploaded separately. Refer to the Guide for Authors for additional information.

Highlights (optional)

Highlights consist of a short collection of bullet points that convey the core findings of the article and should be submitted in a separate file in the online submission system. Please use 'Highlights' in the file name and include 3 to 5 bullet points (maximum 85 characters, including spaces, per bullet point). See the following website for more information

<http://www.elsevier.com/highlights>

Graphical Abstract (optional)

Graphical Abstracts should summarize the contents of the article in a concise, pictorial form designed to capture the attention of a wide readership online. Refer to the following website for more information: <http://www.elsevier.com/graphicalabstracts>Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering features the Interactive Plot Viewer, see: <http://www.elsevier.com/interactiveplots>. Interactive Plots provide easy access to the data behind plots. To include one with your article, please prepare a .csv file with your plot data and test it online at <http://authortools.elsevier.com/interactiveplots/verification> before submission as supplementary material.

MethodsX file (optional)

If you have customized (a) research method(s) for the project presented in your Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering article, you are invited to submit this part of your work as MethodsX article alongside your revised research article. MethodsX is an independent journal that publishes the work you have done to develop research methods to your specific needs or setting. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you may have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work.

How does it work?

- 1) Fill in the MethodsX article template: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>
- 2) Place all MethodsX files (including graphical abstract, figures and other relevant files) into a .zip file and upload this as a 'Method Details (MethodsX)' item alongside your revised Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering manuscript. Please ensure all of your relevant MethodsX documents are zipped into a single file.
- 3) If your Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering research article is accepted, your MethodsX article will automatically be transferred to MethodsX, where it will be reviewed and published as a separate article upon acceptance. MethodsX is a fully Open Access journal, the publication fee is only 520 US\$.

Questions? Please contact the MethodsX team at [methodsx@elsevier.com](mailto:methodsx@elsevier.com). Example MethodsX articles can be found here: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/22150161>

Include interactive data visualizations in your publication and let your readers interact and engage more closely with your research. Follow the instructions here: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors/author-services/data-visualization> to find out about available data visualization options and how to include them with your article.

MethodsX file (optional)

We invite you to submit a method article alongside your research article. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work. If your research article is accepted, your method article will be automatically transferred over to the open access journal, MethodsX, where it will be editorially reviewed and published as a separate method article upon acceptance. Both articles will be linked on ScienceDirect. Please use the MethodsX template available here when preparing your article: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>. Open access fees apply.

I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Yours sincerely,

Guilherme Luiz Dotto, Ph.D  
Editor  
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering  
\*\*\*\*\*

Data in Brief (optional):

We invite you to convert your supplementary data (or a part of it) into an additional journal publication in Data in Brief, a multi-disciplinary open access journal. Data in Brief articles are a fantastic way to describe supplementary data and associated metadata, or full raw datasets deposited in an external repository, which are otherwise unnoticed. A Data in Brief article (which will be reviewed, formatted, indexed, and given a DOI) will make your data easier to find, reproduce, and cite.

You can submit to Data in Brief when you upload your revised manuscript. To do so, complete the template and follow the co-submission instructions found here: [www.elsevier.com/dib-template](http://www.elsevier.com/dib-template). If your manuscript is accepted, your Data in Brief submission will automatically be transferred to Data in Brief for editorial review and publication.

Please note: an open access Article Publication Charge (APC) is payable by the author or research funder to cover the costs associated with publication in Data in Brief and ensure your data article is immediately and permanently free to access by all. For the current APC see: [www.elsevier.com/journals/data-in-brief/2352-3409/open-access-journal](http://www.elsevier.com/journals/data-in-brief/2352-3409/open-access-journal)

Please contact the Data in Brief editorial office at [dib-me@elsevier.com](mailto:dib-me@elsevier.com) or visit the Data in Brief homepage ([www.journals.elsevier.com/data-in-brief/](http://www.journals.elsevier.com/data-in-brief/)) if you have questions or need further information.

\*\*\*\*\*

MethodsX (optional)

We invite you to submit a method article alongside your research article. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work. If your research article is accepted, we will contact you with instructions on the submission process for your method article to MethodsX. On receipt at MethodsX it will be editorially reviewed and, upon acceptance, published as a separate method article. Your articles will be linked on ScienceDirect.

Please prepare your paper using the MethodsX Guide for Authors: <https://www.elsevier.com/journals/methodsx/2215-0161/guide-for-authors> (and template available here: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>) Open access fees apply.

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #3: Manuscript "Magnetic Hollow Buoyant Alginate Beads Achieving Rapid Remediation of Oil Contamination on Water" it is well structured and has interesting findings. However, it need careful revision prior to the publication.

The graphical abstract is made engaging.

The language of the manuscript should be more improved so that it is easy to read for readers of Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering. You need to correct the grammar. Please go through the entire manuscript and shorten and correct some sentences.

Abstract: Include your recommendations and future prospects. It is necessary to extend the abstract with the most significant results.

Please be sure that your manuscript thoroughly establishes how this work is fundamentally novel. Specific comparisons should be made to previously published materials that have a similar purpose. Please present a strong case for how this work is a major advance. This needs to be done in the manuscript itself, not just in the response to review comments.

Please be sure that your abstract and your Conclusions section not only summarize the key findings of your work but also explain the specific ways in which this work fundamentally advances the field relative to prior literature

The significance of this study should be more emphasize in the introduction.

This important papers must be pointed out in the introduction.

Line 76: Clay section <https://www.mdpi.com/2075-163X/10/2/128>

Line 103: Fe ions section <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0304389420316149>

Line 106: Polymer section <https://www.mdpi.com/2075-163X/10/2/128>

Line 144: I recommend adding X-ray pattern of magnetite, I would like to know how clean it is. Discuss this in the results and discussion section.

Line 147: Crude oil (:0.7973 and : 0.88 cP) and deionized water (freshwater). This sentence alone has no meaning in this way. Missing verb. What were they used for?

Line 186: „Instrumentation and material characterization,, change to „Methods,,

Line 187: The term structural analysis is incorrect. This is not a structural analysis because you can do it with multiple also for example FTIR methods (structural functional groups). Change the „Structural analysis,, to X-ray diffraction analysis.

Line 198: It is important to emphasize at what resolution the infrared spectra were measured. I assume 4 cm<sup>-1</sup>. Add this comment to the text in the manuscript.

Line 210: Use the correct notation and explanation of the equations in the whole text of manuscript. Also use the correct SI unit designations throughout the text.

Line 261: There is one extra parenthesis and O change to O<sub>2</sub> - oxygen.

Line 263: If you mean oxygen, change O to O<sub>2</sub> in throughout text. Or name it oxygen.

Line 324: „FTIR spectra,, change to „FTIR spectroscopy,,

Line 328-342: See this very important paper and add it as a reference. This paper will help you significantly improve the quality of your section on FTIR results. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0169131719301413>

Line 346: There is one extra parenthesis and also missing degree of C.

Line 366: Missing degree of C.

Extend the conclusions with all your most important findings. Add your recommendations for future research.

Make sure the references are added correctly according to the journal's instructions.

Page 34: Check section - Captions for Tables, Schemes, and Figures

Figure 1 b and c should be modified. It is of low quality. I also recommend splitting Figure 1 into two images to discuss them in the manuscript. To make it more clearly to readers.

The quality of Figure 2 needs to be significantly improved.

Divide Figure 3 into two and discuss in the manuscript

The graphs in Figure 6 are small and difficult to identify. You need to improve the quality of this image.

Add Tables 4 and 5 to the supporting information.

Reviewer #4: Overall comment:

This paper reports a study on the adsorption of oil pollution in water by a magnetic hollow buoyant alginate bead which is easy to recycle. Although this paper contains a lot of experimental data, the mechanism of their adsorption was still not clear, and some necessary data and explanations still need to be added. Some comments for improving the manuscript are given as below.

- 1) L231-237: When evaluating the reusability of MAGB, MAGB-MA and GO-MAGB-MA, the adsorbent should be saturated in each adsorption cycle. It can be seen from Figure 5 that when the adsorbent reaches adsorption saturation, the initial oil concentration should be greater than 40g/L. The author is requested to conduct relevant experiments again.
- 2) In Figure 3a, the positions of the characteristic peaks of Fe<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>, GO, MAGB, MAGB-MA and GO-MAGB-MA should be clearly marked.
- 3) In Figure 3b, The author should re-discuss the mass loss occurred in three stages of MAGB, MAGB-MA, GO-MAGB and GO-MAGB-MA with DTG.
- 4) The shape of the symbol on the line in Figure 4 is too large, so that the error bar is difficult to see clearly, please re-draw it.
- 5) The resolution of Figure 5 is too low to be seen clearly. Please modify it again.
- 6) "The decrease in the adsorption capacity of all the adsorbent beads with increase in temperature" in L546 is not consistent with the discussion in L544, please discuss again.
- 7) The BET test results of MAGB, MAGB-MA, GO-MAGB and GO-MAGB-MA should be added, including specific surface area, total pore volume and average pore diameter.
- 8) The adsorption mechanism cannot be judged only by fitting data. XPS should be added to prove the adsorption mechanism.
- 9) The manuscript is too long, please put the formula introduction, synthesis method introduction, etc. into the supplementary materials.
- 10) The following references may be helpful to the author and it is recommended to add them into the research papers.

[1] <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2020.123143>

[2] <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2019.123711>

\*\*\*\*\*

Please note that the editorial process varies considerably from journal to journal. To view the submission-to-publication lifecycle, click here:

[http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/p/7923/a\\_id/160](http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/p/7923/a_id/160)

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EM via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

---

**Fwd: Submission Confirmation for JECE-D-20-04223R2**

2 messages

---

**Satya Sakti** <satya.c.w.sakti@gmail.com>  
To: Mochamad Fahmi <m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id>

Sat, May 6, 2023 at 5:54 AM

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <em@editorialmanager.com>  
**Date:** 5 December 2020 21.02.11 GMT+7  
**To:** Satya Candra Wibawa Sakti <satya.c.w.sakti@gmail.com>  
**Subject:** Submission Confirmation for JECE-D-20-04223R2  
**Reply-To:** Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <jece@elsevier.com>

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-20-04223R2  
Title: Magnetic Hollow Buoyant Alginate Beads Achieving Rapid Remediation of Oil Contamination on Water  
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering  
Research Paper

Dear Dr. Satya Candra Wibawa Sakti,

This message is to acknowledge that we have received your revised manuscript for reconsideration for publication in Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging into the Editorial Manager as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/>.

Thank you for submitting your work to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Kind regards,

Editorial Manager  
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

\*\*\*\*\*

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EM via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

---

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

---

**Satya Sakti** <satya.c.w.sakti@gmail.com>  
To: Mochamad Fahmi <m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id>

Sat, May 6, 2023 at 5:54 AM

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Your PDF has been built and requires approval**

1 message

**Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering** <em@editorialmanager.com>

Sat, Dec 5, 2020 at 8:56 PM

Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering &lt;jece@elsevier.com&gt;

To: Satya Candra Wibawa Sakti &lt;satya.sakti@fst.unair.ac.id&gt;

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Title: Magnetic Hollow Buoyant Alginate Beads Achieving Rapid Remediation of Oil Contamination on Water

Authors: Satya Candra Wibawa Sakti, Ph.D; Rizki Ainuna Wijaya; Nindayu Indrasari; Mochamad Zakki Fahmi, Dr.; Alfa Akustia Widati, Dr.; Abdulloh Abdulloh, Dr.; Nuryono Nuryono, Professor; Chun-Hu Chen, Professor

Dear Dr. Satya Candra Wibawa Sakti,

The PDF for your submission, "Magnetic Hollow Buoyant Alginate Beads Achieving Rapid Remediation of Oil Contamination on Water" has now been built and is ready for your approval. Please view the submission before approving it, to be certain that it is free of any errors. If you have already approved the PDF of your submission, this e-mail can be ignored.

To approve the PDF please login to the Editorial Manager as an Author:

<https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/>Your username is: [satya.c.w.sakti@gmail.com](mailto:satya.c.w.sakti@gmail.com)

Then click on the folder 'Submissions Waiting for Author's Approval' to view and approve the PDF of your submission. You may need to click on 'Action Links' to expand your Action Links menu.

You will also need to confirm that you have read and agree with the Elsevier Ethics in Publishing statement before the submission process can be completed. Once all of the above steps are done, you will receive an e-mail confirming receipt of your submission from the Editorial Office. For further information or if you have trouble completing these steps please go to: [http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a\\_id/88/p/7923](http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/88/p/7923).

Please note that you are required to ensure everything appears appropriately in PDF and no change can be made after approving a submission. If you have any trouble with the generated PDF or completing these steps please go to: [http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a\\_id/88/p/7923](http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/88/p/7923).

Your submission will be given a reference number once an Editor has been assigned to handle it.

Thank you for your time and patience.

Kind regards,

Editorial Office

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

\*\*\*\*\*

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EM via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

---

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

---

**Your Submission - JECE-D-20-04223R2**

2 messages

---

**Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering** <em@editorialmanager.com>  
Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <jece@elsevier.com>  
To: Satya Candra Wibawa Sakti <satya.sakti@fst.unair.ac.id>

Wed, Dec 9, 2020 at 8:55 PM

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-20-04223R2  
Title: Magnetic Hollow Buoyant Alginate Beads Achieving Rapid Remediation of Oil Contamination on Water  
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Dear Dr. Sakti,

I am pleased to inform you that your manuscript "Magnetic Hollow Buoyant Alginate Beads Achieving Rapid Remediation of Oil Contamination on Water" has been accepted for publication in Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Below are comments from the editor and reviewers.

Once your paper is entered in our Production system, we aim to provide you with a typeset proof within 24 hours.

Thank you for submitting your work to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Your accepted manuscript will now be transferred to our production department and work will begin on creation of the proof. If we need any additional information to create the proof, we will let you know. If not, you will be contacted again in the next few days with a request to approve the proof and to complete a number of online forms that are required for publication.

Yours sincerely,

Guilherme Luiz Dotto, Ph.D  
Editor  
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Comments from the editors and reviewers:

\*\*\*\*\*

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EM via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

---

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

---

**SATYA CANDRA** <satya.sakti@fst.unair.ac.id>  
Draft

Wed, Dec 9, 2020 at 9:38 PM

Satya Candra Wibawa Sakti, Ph.D  
Department of Chemistry  
Faculty of Science and Technology  
Universitas Airlangga

Begin forwarded message:

[Quoted text hidden]