

---

**SACI Journal System sajc-001943 Status Notification**

1 message

---

**no-reply@saci.co.za** <no-reply@saci.co.za>

Fri, Mar 20, 2020 at 8:10 PM

To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id

Dear Prof. Mochamad Zakki Fahmi Mochamad Zakki

The status of your submission: sajc-001943 titled: Carbon and Graphene Nanodots Derived from Natural Products has been updated to: In Progress

From: Prof. Patricia Forbes

Please login at: <http://saci.co.za/journal>

Sent From SACI Journal System

Please do not reply to this message; it was sent from an unmonitored email address.  
If you wish to reply please login to the system and make use of the email utility

**SACI Journal System Notification sajc-001943**

5 messages

**no-reply@saci.co.za** <no-reply@saci.co.za>  
To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id

Thu, May 28, 2020 at 12:41 AM

Dear Prof. Mochamad Zakki Fahmi Mochamad Zakki

The following message has been sent from SACI Journal System regarding  
Submission: sajc-001943  
Titled: Carbon and Graphene Nanodots Derived from Natural Products

Recommendation: After major changes (will require re-examination by referee)  
Message:

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the South African Journal of Chemistry. After reviewing your manuscript and receiving a report from a referee, I would be pleased to accept the manuscript after major revision as suggested by the referee. The recommended corrections are appended below and attached.

I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Your sincerely  
Prof Nosipho Moloto  
Associate editor, SAJC  
School of Chemistry  
University of the Witwatersrand  
Johannesburg 2000, RSA

\*\*\*\*\*

Referee 1

The current paper is a review on the synthesis, properties and applications of carbon dots (CDs), in particular, carbon nanodots (CNDs) and graphene nanodots (GNDs) derived from natural product. Although there is evidence of thorough literature review in most parts of the paper, some parts such as the introduction can be improved.

My main concern about the paper is that the authors introduce CNDs and GNDs as two separate materials, which is correct, however, they continue to focus on CNDs only throughout the paper and nothing is mentioned for GNDs until one get to conclusions. Does this imply that CNDs and GNDs have same synthesis, properties and applications? Authors have options to:

1. Focus the paper only on CNDs, which completely changes the title and introduction
2. Refer to both types of dots as CDs (which is the case), and use CDs throughout the paper instead of CNDs.
3. Clearly differentiate between the two materials in the paper.

It is crucially important for the authors to note that CNDs and GNDs are 2 different materials.

**Abstract**

It is not necessary to give acronyms in the abstract as they were not used throughout the remainder of the abstract.

**Introduction**

In the introduction, the authors refer to carbon nanodots and carbon quantum dots as CNDs, but went on to use the acronym CQDs throughout the section, this must be corrected. It is to be noted that CNDs are defined by their structure and sizes, it is normally their sizes which gives them the quantum confinement effect, as such, CQDs and CNDs can be referring to one material. The authors have to explain to the reader what do they mean by "man-made" carbon dots/graphene dots??

The line "...one of the most notable..." sounds as if the author is referring to the CNDs obtained from natural products, the truth is that if the material is defined as CNDs, then it has a tunable fluorescence.

Authors state one of the interesting property of CNDs as being "non toxic", but continue to say CNDs can be fuctionalised in order for the dots to be "non toxic", this line has t be rephrased.

Authors keep re-defining acronyms, for example in line 6 of the introduction (pg. 2) and line 1 and 7 on pg. 3, the acronym GNDs is redefined ma times, same goes for CDs. Authors have to correct this throughout the paper as there is a repetition in the entire manuscript.

The acronym GQDs appears without any definition, if the authors refers to GQDs and GNDs, it should be stated in the text that GNDs can also be referred to as GQDs, however the with the size range that the authors gave for GNDs, this means it refers to 2 different materials.

Apart from the sizes, authors did not give any distinct properties/difference between the CNDs and the GNDs.

"...because they have graphene lattice inside the dots ", please elaborate.

Pg. 4 of introduction: The authors gives a great overview of work done by other researchers on the synthesis of CNDs and GNDs, however, they did not make any deductions out of the studies, for a review paper this is important to do before they give the reader what the focus of the review is.

Encapsulation is mentioned but not expanded in the introduction.

Figure 1: This figure is not mentioned anywhere in the text, the figure referred to under "synthetic methods" (pg. 4) is actually figure 2 which shows the top-down and the bottom-up approaches.

In my view, the introduction is still scattered and not interconnected, this can be improved.

Also, introduction and synthetic methods are captured as point (1), this is not in line with the table of contents and has to be corrected.

## 2. Synthetic methods

It is worth mentioning that "top-down" approach does not always start from a natural product, example is using carbon nanotubes or fibers.

Pg. 4, second last line: "Top-down approach allows preparation of green CNDs from such sources", this was elaborated in the previous sentence already, delete.

Authors must decide whether to use "bottom-up" or "down-top", this is in reference to Fig. 2.

In explaining the 2 main approaches of the carbon based dots, only CNDs are considered, how about GNDs? If it is identical for both, then use CDs and not CNDs as CDs refers to both GNDs and CNDs defined in the text.

### 2.1. Pyrolysis

What temperature is a "very high temperature" referred to in the text?

### 2.2. Extraction

The authors reference only one extraction-based study, because this is a review paper, I would suggest more reviewed work on extraction, same goes for molecular aggregation (Sec. 2.6).

### 2.3. Hydrothermal treatment

Pg. 7; "in the common procedure...", rephrase "carbohydrates were dissolved"...

## 3. Properties

### 3.1. Physical properties

Para. 1, Line 1; "Carbon nanodots ...C, H, N & O", the authors should stress here that this is highly dependent on the precursor and synthetic route.

"Typically, organic produces-based CNDs are 2-10 nm size", this is true for all carbon nanoparticles with the properties of CNDs as defined by the authors.

"Electronic properties play an important role in solar cells, ...& solar cell application...", there is a repetition of solar cell application, rephrase.

Under physical properties, paragraph 2, the authors introduced heteroatom doping of CNDs, which is excellent, however, this is not well presented and lacks depth, the authors have to re-capture the entire paragraph to give it a meaning and flow.

### 3.2 Optical properties

Line 1; "Since ...due to be a new class of materials". I refuse to believe that materials receive much attention imply because it's new, but it is rather the material's properties which drive it for a particular application that catches the interest of researchers.

Rephrase.

Same paragraph, in line 2 and 4, PL is already defined twice. This occurs many times in the paper with other acronyms, the authors have to carefully read the manuscript and correct this.

Wang et al; your et al. is in italics whereas it is not the case in the entire manuscript.

Explain to the reader what "ordinary CNDs" are.

## 4. Applications

P.22, last paragraph; define NCNDs

4.4 Change the 2 in TiO<sub>2</sub> to subscript.

It is not necessary to take the reader through a detailed experimental procedure of what other researchers did, a reference to the procedure is enough, authors should be giving reported applications in solar cells and what the findings were.

From: Prof. Nosipho Moloto

Please login at: <http://saci.co.za/journal>

Sent From SACI Journal System

Please do not reply to this message; it was sent from an unmonitored email address.

If you wish to reply please login to the system and make use of the email utility

---

**Mochamad Zakki Fahmi** <m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id>

Thu, May 28, 2020 at 6:37 AM

To: kwee khan lawng <s.khanlawng@gmail.com>, alfinda novi kristanti <alfinda-n-k@fst.unair.ac.id>

Kwee, here is reviewer comments for your 1st review paper. Please respond to each reviewer comment and do modification following the comment

**Best Regards,**

-----  
**Mochamad Zakki Fahmi, Ph.D** (張家其)

**Assistant Professor, Department of Chemistry**

**Universitas Airlangga**

**Phone : +62-838-32901697**

**Email : [m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id](mailto:m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id)**



---

## SACI Journal System Notification sajc-001943

3 messages

---

**no-reply@saci.co.za** <no-reply@saci.co.za>  
To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id

Fri, Jul 10, 2020 at 7:39 AM

Dear Prof. Mochamad Zakki Fahmi Mochamad Zakki

The following message has been sent from SACI Journal System regarding  
Submission: sajc-001943  
Titled: Carbon and Graphene Nanodots Derived from Natural Products

Message:

Can you please submit a Response to the Reviewer letter detailing how you have addressed the reviewer's queries.

Prof Nosipho Moloto

From: Prof. Nosipho Moloto  
Please login at: <http://saci.co.za/journal>  
Sent From SACI Journal System

Please do not reply to this message; it was sent from an unmonitored email address.  
If you wish to reply please login to the system and make use of the email utility

---

**no-reply@saci.co.za** <no-reply@saci.co.za>  
To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id

Fri, Jul 10, 2020 at 9:07 AM

Dear Prof. Mochamad Zakki Fahmi Mochamad Zakki

This is a confirmation email. The below message has been sent to: Nosipho

Message:

The following message has been sent from SACI Journal System regarding  
Submission: sajc-001943  
Titled: Carbon and Graphene Nanodots Derived from Natural Products

Message:

Dear Editor,  
we are sorry for missing file (response to reviewer file) on the previous revised submission. Please find the attached file for it. thank  
you

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Mochamad Zakki Fahmi** <m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id>  
To: no-reply@saci.co.za

Fri, Jul 10, 2020 at 9:11 AM

Dear Prof. Moloto,

thank you for your email and I just resend the response to reviewer comments by SACI online journal system. while you can not find it, I also attached the file at this email. Thank you

## Manuscript Material

Date Uploaded	From	To	Detail	Public/Private	Action
2020-06-29 00:31:41	Author - Prof. Mochamad Zakki Fahmi Mochamad Zakki	Editor - Prof. Nosipho Moloto	Revised manuscript	Public Document	<a href="#">Download File</a>
2020-02-28 17:31:11	Editor - Dr. Thashree Marimuthu	Chief Editor - Prof. Patricia Forbes	Revised manuscript	Public Document	<a href="#">Download File</a>
2020-02-17 06:33:51	Prof. Mochamad Zakki Fahmi Mochamad Zakki		Original manuscript	Public Document	<a href="#">Download File</a>

## Supplementary Material

Date Uploaded	From	To	Detail	Public/Private	Action
2020-07-10 04:07:00	Author - Prof. Mochamad Zakki Fahmi Mochamad Zakki	Editor - Prof. Nosipho Moloto	Response to Reviewers	Public Document	<a href="#">Download File</a>
2020-06-29 00:37:13	Author - Prof. Mochamad Zakki Fahmi Mochamad Zakki	Editor - Prof. Nosipho Moloto	Response to Reviewers	Public Document	<a href="#">Download File</a>

Best Regards,

-----  
**Mochamad Zakki Fahmi, Ph.D (張家其)**  
**Assistant Professor, Departement of Chemistry**  
**Universitas Airlangga**  
**Phone : +62-838-32901697**  
**Email : [m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id](mailto:m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id)**



[Quoted text hidden]

---

 **Responses to reviewers.docx**  
26K

---

**SACI Journal System Notification sajc-001943**

1 message

---

**no-reply@saci.co.za** <no-reply@saci.co.za>

Wed, Aug 19, 2020 at 6:12 PM

To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id

Cc: patricia.forbes@up.ac.za

Dear Prof. Mochamad Zakki Fahmi Mochamad Zakki

The following message has been sent from SACI Journal System regarding

Submission: sajc-001943

Titled: Carbon and Graphene Nanodots Derived from Natural Products

**Message:**

Thank you for submitting your revised manuscript to the South African Journal of Chemistry. After considering the changes you have made, I am pleased to accept your manuscript for publication in its current form.

Regards

Prof N Moloto  
Subject Editor: Nanotechnology  
University of the Witwatersrand  
1 Jan Smuts Avenue  
Braamfontein  
2000  
South Africa

From: Prof. Nosipho Moloto  
Please login at: <http://saci.co.za/journal>  
Sent From SACI Journal System

Please do not reply to this message; it was sent from an unmonitored email address.  
If you wish to reply please login to the system and make use of the email utility

---

## SACI Journal System Notification sajc-001943

2 messages

---

**no-reply@saci.co.za** <no-reply@saci.co.za>

Tue, Feb 16, 2021 at 1:51 PM

To: m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id

Cc: patricia.forbes@up.ac.za

Dear Prof. Mochamad Mochamad

The following message has been sent from SACI Journal System regarding

Submission: sajc-001943

Titled: Carbon and Graphene Nanodots Derived from Natural Products

Message:

Dear Prof. Zakki Fahmi

A set of revised proofs of your paper for inclusion in volume 75 (2021) of South African Journal of Chemistry is now available on the SACI journal web site. Please log in and download them.

Please ignore all bright blue highlighting at end of lines --- these will not appear in the e-version on the Web.

Your the paper will be paginated just before it is posted to the Web, and a unique QR code and DOI string will be generated then, as well as hard links to e-mail, web and ORCID addresses.

Soon after correction according to your instructions, your paper will be available at <https://journals.sabinet.co.za/sajchem/>

Nico J. Dippenaar

E-mail: [nicod@pixie.co.za](mailto:nicod@pixie.co.za)

From: Mr. Nico Dippenaar

Please login at: <http://saci.co.za/journal>

Sent From SACI Journal System

Please do not reply to this message; it was sent from an unmonitored email address.

If you wish to reply please login to the system and make use of the email utility

---

**Mochamad Zakki Fahmi** <m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id>

Tue, Feb 16, 2021 at 3:27 PM

To: NICO DIPPENAAR <nicod@pixie.co.za>

Dear Editor,

Thank you and we proofed it

**Best Regards,**

-----

**Mochamad Zakki Fahmi, Ph.D** (張家其)

**Associate Professor, Department of Chemistry**

**Universitas Airlangga**

**Phone : +62-838-32901697**

**Email : [m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id](mailto:m.zakki.fahmi@fst.unair.ac.id)**



[Quoted text hidden]