



lukman hakim &lt;lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id&gt;

---

**Journal of Endourology - Manuscript ID END-2021-0761-RA**

---

**Journal of Endourology** <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>  
Reply-To: debra@endourologysociety.com  
To: lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id

Sat, Oct 2, 2021 at 5:12 PM

02-Oct-2021

Dear Dr. Hakim:

Your manuscript entitled "Endoscopic Combined Intrarenal Surgery (ECIRS) Versus Percutaneous Nephrolithotomy (PCNL) for Large and Complex Renal Stone: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis" has been successfully submitted online and is presently being given full consideration for publication in the Journal of Endourology.

Your manuscript ID is END-2021-0761-RA.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence or when calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or e-mail address, please log in to Scholarone Manuscripts at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/endourology> and edit your user information as appropriate.

You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Center after logging in to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/endourology>.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to the Journal of Endourology.

Sincerely,  
Journal of Endourology Editorial Office

Ensure you stay informed. Register to receive email alerts for the Journal(s) that are critical to advancing your work: [www.liebertpub.com/liebertconnect](http://www.liebertpub.com/liebertconnect) (copy/paste the link into your browser).



lukman hakim &lt;lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id&gt;

---

**Journal of Endourology - Decision on Manuscript ID END-2021-0761-RA**

---

**Journal of Endourology** <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Wed, Dec 8, 2021 at 11:00 PM

Reply-To: landmanj@uci.edu

To: lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id

08-Dec-2021

Dear Dr. Hakim:

Manuscript ID END-2021-0761-RA entitled "Endoscopic Combined Intrarenal Surgery (ECIRS) Versus Percutaneous Nephrolithotomy (PCNL) for Large and Complex Renal Stone: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis" which you submitted to the Journal of Endourology, has been reviewed. The comments of the reviewer(s) are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewer(s) have recommended publication, but also suggest some minor revisions to your manuscript. Therefore, I invite you to respond to the reviewer(s)' comments and revise your manuscript. REVISION IS NO GUARANTEE OF ACCEPTANCE. All revised manuscripts are reviewed again by the editors and if deemed necessary are sent out for additional review at which time acceptance/revision/or rejection may occur.

To revise your manuscript, you can click on the link below or log into <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/endourology> and enter your Author Center. You will find your manuscript title listed under "Manuscripts with Decisions." Under "Actions," click on "Create a Revision." You will notice the manuscript number has been appended to denote a revision.

\*\*\* PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. \*\*\*

[https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/endourology?URL\\_MASK=871a324eb2404e138482e30a50d1f46d](https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/endourology?URL_MASK=871a324eb2404e138482e30a50d1f46d)

Please submit your revision by 06-Feb-2022.

You will be unable to make your revisions on the originally submitted version of the manuscript. Instead, revise your manuscript using a word processing program and save it on your computer. Please also highlight the changes to your manuscript within the document by using the track changes mode in MS Word or by using bold or colored text.

Once the revised manuscript is prepared, you can upload it and submit it through your Author Center.

When submitting your revised manuscript, you will be able to respond to the comments made by the reviewer(s) in the space provided. You can use this space to document any changes you make to the original manuscript. In order to expedite the processing of the revised manuscript, please be as specific as possible in your response to the reviewer(s).

When sending your revised manuscript to us, it is ESSENTIAL that you respond to EACH reviewer's comment in a numbered fashion corresponding to the number of the comment. These comments must address each reviewer's comments in order (e.g. Reviewer 1, Comment 1, Comment 2, ... Reviewer 2: Comment 1, Comment 2, etc.).

**FAILURE TO RESPOND TO EACH OF THE REVIEWERS' CRITIQUES IN AN INDIVIDUAL POINT BY POINT MANNER WILL RESULT IN NONREVIEW OF YOUR REVISED MANUSCRIPT.**

**IMPORTANT:** Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.

Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to the Journal of Endourology, your revised manuscript should be uploaded as soon as possible. If it is not possible for you to submit your revision in a reasonable amount of time, we may have to consider your paper as a new submission.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to the Journal of Endourology and I look forward to receiving your revision.

Sincerely,  
Dr. Jaime Landman

Editor, Journal of Endourology  
[landmanj@uci.edu](mailto:landmanj@uci.edu)

Reviewer(s)' Comments to Author:

Reviewer: 1

#### Comments to the Author

The systematic review and meta-analysis compared the efficacy and safety between ECIRS and PCNL for treating large and complex renal stones.

The Embase, Scopus, and MEDLINE databases have been used for analysis. Eligible studies comprised both randomized and non-randomized studies comparing ECIRS and PCNL. A total of five non-randomized studies and one randomized controlled trial (RCT) has been included.

The study reveals that the one-step stone-free rate and lower postoperative complication rates are in favor of ECIRS. On the other hand, the need for auxiliary procedures was higher in the PCNL group.

My opinion about the manuscript is as follows;

1- The title is relevant to the paper

2- There is no fault related to the study design, keywords, statistical analysis, and interpretation of results.

3- Transfusion rate is crucial problem or complication after PCNL for complex and large renal stones due to the need for multiple renal access. The transfusion rate has only indicated in table 2. Could the authors indicate their opinion about the transfusion rate? Is it really lower in the ECIRS procedure?

4- The main problem is to evaluate the stone-free rate after an operation. There is still no consensus on this issue.

Therefore, it causes a bias related to the stone-free rates after one-step surgery.

Reviewer: 2

#### Comments to the Author

This is a review of articles comparing conventional and mini PCNL with ECIRS in different aspects; I would like authors respond to the following issues:

- I did not find any explanation on why those 141 articles were excluded in screening step.

- In Table 2, Hb drop in Nuno 2013 study is reported to be a decrease of 165 gr/dl vs. 134 gr/dl, which does not seem to be correct. Also, complication rate based on Clavien-Dindo grade column of this table is left completely blank.

Reviewer: 3

#### Comments to the Author

In this manuscript the authors present a systematic review and meta-analysis of Endoscopic combined intra-renal surgery (ECIRS) versus Conventional and Mini-Percutaneous nephrolithotomy (cPCNL and mPCNL, respectively) for complex renal calculi. The authors identify that for large and complex renal calculi there is sometimes a need for multiple access or repeat procedures reducing stone free rates and increasing complications. ECIRS is an increasingly adopted procedure that leverages retrograde access in addition to a single percutaneous access allowing for simultaneous targeting of complex stones. They compare several outcomes including overall stone free rate, operative time, hemoglobin drop, incidence of urosepsis and other complications. The literature search ranges from 2010-2021.

Overall, the study is well designed and follows the PRISMA framework for systematic reviews. A severe limitation of the study is the number and retrospective nature of the majority of studies with only 1 RCT being included. Small numbers along with variability in reporting of the various outcomes results in significant heterogeneity for example operative times. This may reflect the paucity of published literature in this area as outlined by the authors and reflects the need for further well-designed standardized trials comparing ECIRS to PCNL. The authors conclude based on their review and analysis that ECIRS results in greater stone free rate, less number of auxiliary procedures, comparable operative time, amount of bleeding and lower complication rates.

I recommend some minor revisions. Consider expanding the discussion section to include the role of newer technologies such as the thulium laser and whether these will facilitate ECIRS or flexible nephroscopy during PCNL. Consider including reasons why ECIRS is not more widely adapted. Is this due to unfamiliarity of urologists with the technique, concerns regarding GMSV positioning or maybe cost? Consider discussing the role and need of a ureteral access sheath (UAS) in ECIRS? Does ECIRS require UAS in all cases? If yes, what size is optimal and are there concerns about ureteral injury which to my knowledge are not captured in the studies analyzed.



lukman hakim &lt;lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id&gt;

---

## END-2021-0761-RA.R1 - Endoscopic Combined Intrarenal Surgery (ECIRS) Versus Percutaneous Nephrolithotomy (PCNL) for Large and Complex Renal Stone: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis - URGENT - ACTION REQUIRED

---

Journal of Endourology <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Thu, Jan 27, 2022 at 12:22 AM

Reply-To: lbrodsky@liebertpub.com

To: lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id

26-Jan-2022

Dear Dr. Lukman Hakim:

Your manuscript has been returned to the submitting author's Author Center for you to review and make the changes or corrections requested below prior to production and publication.

You will find your manuscript in the submitting author's Author Center under the list "Manuscripts Accepted for First Look." Click on the link to "submit updated manuscript" and follow the steps as you would during a manuscript submission process.

**Please make only the changed requested. Do not make any other changes or reupload files that did not require changes.**

Manuscript ID: END-2021-0761-RA.R1

Manuscript Title: Endoscopic Combined Intrarenal Surgery (ECIRS) Versus Percutaneous Nephrolithotomy (PCNL) for Large and Complex Renal Stone: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis

Any special instructions will be listed below:

- **References are not formatted correctly. In text citations should be in superscript numbers with no brackets or parentheses.**
- **Ref 1 is missing volume and issue information.**
- **Figure legends should be uploaded in a single doc file. Supplementary figure legends in its own doc file.**
- **File names should only have letters and numbers. Remove all periods, hyphens, underscore, etc. They should be labeled simply as LastNameMainDoc, LastNameFigure1, etc.**

I thank you in advance for your prompt attention to this matter.

Regards,

Ms Lisa Brodsky  
Journal of Endourology



lukman hakim <lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id>

---

## Thank You for Submitting the Copyright Form for Manuscript ID END-2021-0761-RA.R1

---

**Journal of Endourology** <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>  
Reply-To: debra@endourologysociety.com  
To: lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id

Fri, Feb 11, 2022 at 2:31 PM

11-Feb-2022

Dear Dr. Hakim:

Thank you for submitting the copyright form for Manuscript ID END-2021-0761-RA.R1 titled "Endoscopic Combined Intrarenal Surgery (ECIRS) Versus Percutaneous Nephrolithotomy (PCNL) for Large and Complex Renal Stone: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis" for Journal of Endourology.

This email is simply an automatic confirmation that the form has been received. PLEASE DO NOT RESPOND TO THIS EMAIL.

Sincerely,

Journal of Endourology Editorial Office



lukman hakim &lt;lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id&gt;

---

**FW: FW: (PAGE PROOFS) JOURNAL OF ENDOUROLOGY 36/7 END-2021-0761-RA -  
Need Suppl. Table S1 file**

2 messages

---

**Chan, Maria** <mchan@liebertpub.com>  
To: "lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id" <lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id>  
Cc: "debra@endourologysociety.com" <debra@endourologysociety.com>

Tue, Jun 28, 2022 at 12:18 AM

Dear Dr. Lukman Hakim,

Please send us the file for Supplementary Table S1.

Your article will be the first article for END 36/7 – July 2022 issue and the title will be featured on the cover of the issue as well.

Looking forward to have your article published online and in print.

Thanks very much, best,

Maria

---

**From:** Chan, Maria  
**Sent:** Thursday, June 23, 2022 11:57 AM  
**To:** lukman hakim <lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id>  
**Subject:** RE: FW: (PAGE PROOFS) JOURNAL OF ENDOUROLOGY 36/7 END-2021-0761-RA -2nd pass version for Fast Track  
**Importance:** High

Thank you, Lukman. Your article should be live online in a couple of days.

Best,

Maria

[www.liebertpub.com/end](http://www.liebertpub.com/end)

---

**From:** lukman hakim <lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id>  
**Sent:** Thursday, June 23, 2022 4:12 AM  
**To:** Chan, Maria <mchan@liebertpub.com>

**Subject:** Re: FW: (PAGE PROOFS) JOURNAL OF ENDOUROLOGY 36/7 END-2021-0761-RA -2nd pass version for review

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] DO NOT CLICK links or attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Maria Chan,

We have no further corrections. The final version is ready for publication. Thank you.

Warmest regards,

Lukman Hakim

On Tue, Jun 21, 2022, 03:58 Chan, Maria <mchan@liebertpub.com> wrote:

Dear Dr. Lukman Hakim,

Please review the 2<sup>nd</sup> pass version of END-2021-0761 and let me know if you have additional corrections.

Otherwise, we can publish your article online ahead of print.

Thanks very much, best,

Maria

---

**From:** lukman hakim <lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id>

**Sent:** Saturday, June 11, 2022 1:32 AM

**To:** Chan, Maria <mchan@liebertpub.com>

**Subject:** Re: FW: (PAGE PROOFS) JOURNAL OF ENDOUROLOGY 36/7 END-2021-0761-RA - just a reminder

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] DO NOT CLICK links or attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mrs. Maria Chan,

We have revised the PDF for the page proofs and responded to the author queries. The responses are displayed as annotations in each section.

Just in case the annotation for AU4 is unclear, the 4th affiliation is supposed to be "Department of Urology, Universitas Airlangga Teaching Hospital, Surabaya, East Java, Indonesia". The PDF file is attached below. Thank you.

Warmest regards,

Lukman Hakim

On Fri, Jun 10, 2022 at 10:03 PM Chan, Maria <[mchan@liebertpub.com](mailto:mchan@liebertpub.com)> wrote:

Dear Dr. Lukman Hakim,

You may use the attached pdf to mark your changes/answers to queries. Your article is scheduled to publish in END 36/7 July 2022 issue.

Looking forward to hear from you soon!

Thank you and best regards,

Maria

[www.liebertpub.com/END](http://www.liebertpub.com/END)

---

**From:** lukman hakim <[lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id](mailto:lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id)>

**Sent:** Thursday, May 26, 2022 5:04 PM

**To:** Chan, Maria <[mchan@liebertpub.com](mailto:mchan@liebertpub.com)>

**Subject:** Re: FW: (PAGE PROOFS) JOURNAL OF ENDOUROLOGY 36 END-2021-0761-RA

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] DO NOT CLICK links or attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mrs. Maria Chan,

Thank you for sending us the page proofs of our article. We are currently reviewing the article and responding to the author's queries. We will send you the corrected proofs as soon as possible. Thank you.

Warmest regards,



Lukman Hakim

On Wed, May 25, 2022 at 2:47 AM Chan, Maria <mchan@liebertpub.com> wrote:

Dear Dr. Lukman Hakim,

Please review the page proofs for END-2021-0761 and mark your changes/answers to author queries at the end of your article. You may send me a scanned or annotated pdf when you are ready.

Looking forward to hear from you.

Thanks much, best,

Maria

---

**From:** Author.Proofs@westchesterpubsvcs.com <Author.Proofs@westchesterpubsvcs.com>

**Sent:** Wednesday, February 23, 2022 12:03 PM

**To:** lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id

**Cc:** Author Proofs <AuthorProofs@liebertpub.com>; journals\_notification@westchesterpubsvcs.com; Chan, Maria <mchan@liebertpub.com>

**Subject:** (PAGE PROOFS) JOURNAL OF ENDOUROLOGY 36 END-2021-0761-RA

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] DO NOT CLICK links or attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.



**PLEASE REPLY TO Maria Chan**

**mchan@liebertpub.com**

Dear Author:

Enclosed please find the link to the page proofs of your paper that is being published in **JOURNAL OF ENDOUROLOGY**.

**Please print out the page proofs from the link below.**

[https://www.dropbox.com/s/a1ep1mfqj47bkyg/END-2021-0761-Widyokirono\\_1P.pdf?dl=1](https://www.dropbox.com/s/a1ep1mfqj47bkyg/END-2021-0761-Widyokirono_1P.pdf?dl=1)

**Mark the proofs with your changes, and scan and email all affected pages to my attention.**

**Please read your page proofs carefully and mark all corrections clearly in the margins.**

Send corrections via email to [mchan@liebertpub.com](mailto:mchan@liebertpub.com) or via fax to **914-740-2108**

Please note the following instructions:

1. Scan and email your corrections to me within **2 business days** of the date of this email.
2. Be sure to include the title page of your article. This is for identification purposes.
3. Please answer all queries directly on the affected page and where the correction should be made. Please be sure to check all figures and tables.
4. **Please note that the file you are viewing is a LOW resolution file**, therefore figures may appear blurred or "fuzzy." The figures will appear clearly in the printed version, unless we notify you of any problems with your artwork.
5. If your paper was submitted with color figures, but you have opted not to purchase color printing, please ensure that any affected figure legends do not contain any references to color.
6. **If you do not have any corrections**, please email the title page indicating that your article contains no errors and is ready for press.
7. **Liebert Open Option** – quick posting of your paper on-line, and accessibility to all. For information and ordering details, please see attached form.
8. If you would like to **order reprints of your article** please fill out the attached form completely and fax to (914) 740-2108 OR click on the link below.

If you have any questions or problems, please contact me at **914-740-2100** or email: [mchan@liebertpub.com](mailto:mchan@liebertpub.com).

Sincerely,

Maria Chan

Production Editor

Journal of Endourology

## Disclaimer

The information contained in this communication from the sender is confidential. It is intended solely for use by the recipient and others authorized to receive it. If you are not the recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying,

distribution or taking action in relation of the contents of this information is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful.

This email has been scanned for viruses and malware, and may have been automatically archived by Mimecast, a leader in email security and cyber resilience. Mimecast integrates email defenses with brand protection, security awareness training, web security, compliance and other essential capabilities. Mimecast helps protect large and small organizations from malicious activity, human error and technology failure; and to lead the movement toward building a more resilient world. To find out more, visit our website.

## Disclaimer

The information contained in this communication from the sender is confidential. It is intended solely for use by the recipient and others authorized to receive it. If you are not the recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or taking action in relation of the contents of this information is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful.

This email has been scanned for viruses and malware, and may have been automatically archived by Mimecast, a leader in email security and cyber resilience. Mimecast integrates email defenses with brand protection, security awareness training, web security, compliance and other essential capabilities. Mimecast helps protect large and small organizations from malicious activity, human error and technology failure; and to lead the movement toward building a more resilient world. To find out more, visit our website.

---

 **END-2021-0761-Widyokirono\_2P\_CX-assembly.pdf**  
1274K

---

**lukman hakim** <lukman-h@fk.unair.ac.id>  
To: "Chan, Maria" <mchan@liebertpub.com>

Wed, Jun 29, 2022 at 8:22 AM

Dear Maria Chan,

The Supplementary Table S1 is attached below. Thank you.

Best regards,

Lukman Hakim  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

 **Supplementary Table S1.docx**  
13K