



Carbon

Certificate of Reviewing

Awarded for 1 review in September 2018
presented to

MOCHAMAD ZAKKI FAHMI

in recognition of the review contributed to the journal

The Editors of Carbon




















← Completed Reviewer Assignments

Page: 1 of 1 (1 total assignments)

Results per page 10

Action 	My Reviewer Number 	Manuscript Number 	Article Type 	Article Title 	Status Date 	Current Status 	Final Disposition 	Date Reviewer Invited 	Date Reviewer Agreed 	Date Review Due 	Date Review Submitted 	Days Taken 	Editor's Name 	Corr. Author 
Action Links	3	CARBON-D-18-03137	Research Paper	Carbon dots directly interact with virus to block the viral infectivity	2018.09.25	Completed - Reject	Reject	2018.09.04	2018.09.04	2018.09.25	2018.09.25	21		Jiangjiang Gu, Ph.D.

Page: 1 of 1 (1 total assignments)

Results per page 10

Close

CARBON-D-18-03137

"Carbon dots directly interact with virus to block the viral infectivity"

Original Submission

mochamad zakki fahmi, Ph.D (Reviewer 3)

Reviewer Recommendation Term:	Not acceptable
Overall Reviewer Manuscript Rating:	45

Comments to Editor:

- incomplete data on synthesis process of CDs
- no information any bonding or responsibly active sites for attraction in between virus and CDs.

Comments to Author:

The manuscript discussed interestingly application of benzoxazine based carbon dots from on blocking virus entry. Further improvements to show carbon dots capability on virus inhibition were performed up to in vivo observation. However, some part must be considered:

1. Some sentences on abstract and introduction using unsuitable words.
2. There is no clear information on the introduction about the background and reason on using benzoxazine as raw material of carbon dots. Beside that, no previous report related on application of Benzoxazine as carbon dots,
3. There is also no logical explanation of structure and mechanism of carbon dots formed,
4. Incomplete synthesis method of BZM-CDs , including centrifugation speed to collecting CDs
5. Author performs TEM data to declare formation of BZM-CDs with show higher magnification of CDs and show lattice spacing 100 of sp² graphitic carbon, but it convincingly to perform XRD data instead of TEM. Also, Raman spectra must be furnished due to its data valid to prove formation carbon dots with sp² for G band and sp³ for D band.
6. Author not informs chemically bonding mechanism of BZM-CDs to virus and any active species from both virus and BZM-CDs on the inhibition process. Also, there is no characterization performed to prove the existence of those active site.

Close

Close

View Reviewer Comments for Manuscript

CARBON-D-18-03137

"Carbon dots directly interact with virus to block the viral infectivity"

Click the Reviewer recommendation term to view the Reviewer comments.

	Original Submission
(Reviewer 1)	Not acceptable
(Reviewer 2)	Major revision, further review required
mochamad zakki fahmi, Ph.D (Reviewer 3)	Not acceptable
Author Decision Letter	Reject

Close