

**Bukti Submission (sebagai koresponden)**

Judul Paper :

Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste

Bukti Corresponding Substantif berisi

1. Komentar dari reviewer terkait substantif paper
2. Bukti respon author terhadap hasil review

Bukti print email berisi

1. Bukti submit ke jurnal
2. Bukti persetujuan Jurnal terhadap hasil review
3. Bukti accepted

Bukti Corresponding Substantif

Judul Paper :

Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste

## List of changes of revision 1

Title : Affordable dye sensitizer by waste

Code : MRSE-D-16-00054R3

No	Peer Reviewer's comments	Revision
1	This work describes the use of dye waste as sensitizer for solar cells. This is a interesting study about the use of alternative light harvester. The authors need to increase the quality of the paper to be published.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Some typo was revised like TiO2 became TiO<sub>2</sub></li> <li>- The number of words in abstract was increase from 92 be 155 words</li> </ul>
2	The Authors must increase the literature on the dyes used in the paper, searching other papers about these dyes comparing the results.	<p>Was adding the other dyes under Table 4.</p> <p>“Table 4 shows that dye waste generate diverse efficiency of DSSC value; the efficiency of DSSC reached is 1.9 %. This value are significantly higher than those of the DSSC sensitized by other synthetics dyes or natural dyes. Synthetics dyes from hydrazonoyl and their derivatives reported obtain the efficiency of DSSC of 0.00009 % - 0.003 % [23]. Natural dyes from five plants <i>Amaranthus caudatus</i>, <i>Bougainvillea spectabilis</i>, <i>Delonix regia</i>, <i>Nerium oleander</i> and <i>Spathodea campanulata</i> obtained the highest efficiency of DSSC reached 0.610 % from <i>Amaranthus caudatus</i> [24]. Natural dyes from beet, red cabbage, strawberry, spinach, mallow, and henna extract obtained the highest efficiency of 0.229 % [25]. Chlorophyll and xanthophyll from <i>Cladophora sp.</i> reported obtained the highest efficiency of 0.08 % [26]. This result indicates that dye waste was potentially applied as dye sensitizer on DSSC.</p>

3	In the section "Preparation of working electrode" the Authors mentioned the preparation of TiO <sub>2</sub> film without any reference about the use of surfactant mentioned in the Characterizations section.	<p>Was adding the reference in "Preparation of working electrode".</p> <p>“First, the FTO glasses were washed with deionized water and dried at 80°C for 10 minutes. The conductive side of the FTO glass was covered on two edges with adhesive tape to control the thickness of TiO<sub>2</sub> film. Subsequently, the FTO glass was coated with TiO<sub>2</sub> sol 3 times. Then each FTO glass was dried at 80°C for 10 minutes. In the last coating, FTO glasses were calcined at 450 °C for 2 hours and then cooling down in ambient temperature [9]. The electrode was immersed in the each solution of dye (0.1 mmolL<sup>-1</sup>) for 24 hours at room temperature and then dried [10]. Four dye waste were immersed with TiO<sub>2</sub> glasses “</p>
4	The sentence "This chromophore group officiate capturing photons from sunlight for later use on generating a cycle of movement of electrons in DSSC cells" is not clear.	Was revised be “The chromophore that owned by dye will increase the dye’s ability for capturing the photon from sunlight so the number of photon that use to generating a cycle of electrons in DSSC cells will be increase. This process will generate a continuous electrical current.”
5	Table 3 label probably the right word is Benzene	Was revised be benzene
6	Figure 3 the labels are "with surfactant" "without surfactant".	Was revised be surfactant
7	Is it possible to report the JV curve of all dyes?	Was represented in Table 4
8	The values of V <sub>max</sub> and V <sub>oc</sub> for the methyl orange are the same	Was revised : V <sub>oc</sub> = 0.150 and V <sub>max</sub> = 0,145
9	The value of J <sub>max</sub> for Naphtol blue black is higher than J <sub>sc</sub>	<p>Was revised : J<sub>sc</sub> = 0.00575</p> <p>Was revised : J<sub>max</sub> = 0.00525</p>

10	The area of DSSC reported is 4 cm <sup>2</sup> , it is similar to the dimension of FTO, is it a right value?	The dimension of FTO 10Ω, 25 x 25 x 3.2 mm. The top and the left of FTO glass was isolated by adhesive tape about 0.5 cm for the clamp side and to control the thickness of the coating of TiO <sub>2</sub> . So the area of DSSC cells : 4 cm <sup>2</sup> . This information was adding in " <b>Experimental</b> "
11	The authors must increase the quality of the figures (labels with font more clear) and check the right space between the words in the text.	All figures was revised. The label and font more clear. The space was revised too.

## List of changes of revision 2

Title : Affordable dye sensitizer by waste

Code : MRSE-D-16-00054R3

No	Peer Reviewer's comments	Revision
1	The english is not good, please check all the sentences.	- All of grammatical error was revised. The English was improved.
2	The authors need to complete/modify/add/change the Fig. 5 with the curves of the cells sensitized with the other dyes.	- Figure 5 was complete by adding the curves of another dyes and it was represented in Table 4 too.
3	The area of DSSC reported is 4 cm <sup>2</sup> , it is similar to the dimension of FTO, is it a right value? Please answer to this question and correct it.	The dimension of FTO is 25 x 25 x 3.2 mm. The top and the left of FTO glass was isolated by adhesive tape about 0.5 cm for the clamp side and to control the thickness of the coating of TiO <sub>2</sub> . So the area of DSSC cells: 4 cm <sup>2</sup> . This information was adding in " <b>Experimental</b> "

## List of changes of revision 3

Title : Affordable dye sensitizer by waste

Code : MRSE-D-16-00054R3

Peer Reviewer's comment	Correction
<b>About the quality of English</b>	
1. The counter electrode is graphite.	1. Graphite was used as a counter electrode.
2. In this study, variation of semiconductor were done through two technique	2. In this study, synthesis of semiconductor (titanium dioxide) was done by two techniques.
3. Four types of dye wastes were immersed with TiO <sub>2</sub> glasses.	3. The dyes were congo red, rhodamine B, methyl orange and naphthol blue black
4. It is chosen as a counter electrode because it is of less costly and easily prepared	4. Graphite was chosen as a counter electrode because less costly and easily prepared.
5. The example of J-V curve was J-V curve methyl orange in Figure 5.	5. The current density-voltage (J-V) curve of dye wastes were shown in Figure 5.
<b>About the procedure to obtain J-V curves</b>	
1. The authors reported the JV curves for the different dyes. Why did they use only 4-5 points to describe the JV curves?	The procedure to obtain J-V curve and the determination of % efficiency has been repeated in a uniform procedure. The result has been putted in the Figure 5 and Table 4.
2. In the Figure 5 Congo Red X-axis is Voltage not Votage, please correct it.	
3. There is a big descrepancy between the JV curves and the data reported in the table: In the JV curve related to Congo Red the Authors reported a value of Jsc close to 3.1 mA/cm <sup>2</sup> (value of current density at x=0), in the Table 1 the Authors reported 14 mA/cm <sup>2</sup> . why is there this descrepancy?	
4. In the JV curve realted to Methyl Orange the value of the current at short circuit condition is different from the value repoerted in the Table	
5. The JV curve related to Napthol blue black the FF reported in the Table is close to 80% but the shape of JV curve does not seem to have the same FF, 80% means that the curve is close to the ideality. There is a discrepancy between Jsc reported in the graph and in the Table.	
6. In the JV curve related to Rhodamine B the current reported in the JV curve is extraordinary high close to 22 mA/cm <sup>2</sup> and it is totally different from the current reported in the Table.	

7. All the JV curves start from a value of bias different from 0, why?  
In the case of congo red the FF reported in the table is very low but the shape of the curve is typically describable with FF close to 90%



## List of changes of revision 4

Title : Affordable dye sensitizer by waste

Code : MRSE-D-16-00054R3

Peer Reviewer's comment	Correction
The conclusion is related to the previous result, please change with the new results and observation.	The conclusion has been changed based on the new results of observation. The efficiency value of congo red has been changed from 1.9% be 1.0133 %

## **Bukti Print Email**

Judul paper :

Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE-D-16-00054 - Submission Confirmation**

1 pesan

**Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)** <em@editorialmanager.com>22 Oktober 2016 pukul  
16.58

Balas Ke: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" &lt;anand.venugopal@springer.com&gt;

Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript, Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste, to Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy.

The submission id is: MRSE-D-16-00054

Please refer to this number in any future correspondence.

During the review process, you can keep track of the status of your manuscript by accessing the following web site:

<http://mrse.edmgr.com/>

Your username is: harsasi85

Your password is: available at this link [http://mrse.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email\\_address=harsasi85@gmail.com](http://mrse.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email_address=harsasi85@gmail.com)

Should you require any further assistance please feel free to e-mail the Editorial Office by clicking on "Contact Us" in the menu bar at the top of the screen.

With kind regards,  
Springer Journals Editorial Office  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

**MRSE: Your manuscript entitled Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste**

2 pesan

**Enrico Traversa** <em@editorialmanager.com>  
Balas Ke: Enrico Traversa <traversa@uniroma2.it>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

3 Desember 2016 pukul 22.12

Ref.: Ms. No. MRSE-D-16-00054  
Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. You will see that they are advising that you revise your manuscript. If you are prepared to undertake the work required, I would be pleased to reconsider the revised manuscript.

The reviewers' comments can be found at the end of this email or can be accessed by following the provided link.

This is your login information:

Your username is: harsasi85

Your password is: available at this link [http://mrse.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email\\_address=harsasi85@gmail.com](http://mrse.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email_address=harsasi85@gmail.com)

When revising your work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

Your revision is due by 02-01-2017.

"Please note: when uploading your revised files, please make sure only to submit your editable source files (i. e. word, tex)".

To submit a revision, go to <http://mrse.edmgr.com/> and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item called 'Submissions Needing Revision'. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Enrico Traversa  
Editor-in-Chief  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: -This work describes the use of dye waste as sensitizer for solar cells. This is a interesting study about the use of alternative light harvester. The authors need to increase the quality of the paper to be published.

-The Authors must increase the literature on the dyes used in the paper, searching other papers about these dyes comparing the results.

-In the section "Preparation of working electrode" the Authors mentioned the preparation of TiO<sub>2</sub> film without any reference about the use of surfactant mentioned in the Characterizations section.

-The sentence "This chromophore group officiate capturing photons from sunlight for later use on generating a cycle of movement of electrons in DSSC cells" is not clear.

-Table 3 label probably the right word is Benzene

-Figure 3 the labels are "with surfactant" "without surfactant".

-Is it possible to report the JV curve of all dyes?

-In the tabel 4 there are some mistakes:

possible;  
- The values of V<sub>max</sub> and V<sub>oc</sub> for the methyl orange are the same, it is not

possible;  
- The value of J<sub>max</sub> for Naphtol blue black is higher than J<sub>sc</sub> and it is not

possible;  
please check all the experimental data

- The area of DSSC reported is 4 cm<sup>2</sup>, it is similar to the dimension of FTO, is it a right value?

The authors must increase the quality of the figures (labels with font more clear) and check the right space between the words in the text.

---

**Harsasi Setyawati** <harsasi85@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Enrico Traversa <traversa@uniroma2.it>

23 Desember 2016 pukul 12.11

Dear editor Journal of Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

I would say a huge thanks for your notifications and your review.

Based on your review, I decided to postponed my article because I have been collecting supporting data for my article.

I hope you can understand.

Thank you very much.

Best regards,

Harsasi Setyawati, S.Si, M.Si  
Lecturer of Inorganic Chemistry,  
Department of Chemistry,  
Faculty of Science and Technology,  
Airlangga University

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE - Your revision is due**

2 pesan

**Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)**

26 Desember 2016 pukul

&lt;em@editorialmanager.com&gt;

15.00

Balas Ke: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" &lt;anand.venugopal@springer.com&gt;

Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

Ref.: Ms. No. MRSE-D-16-00054  
Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

We are expecting the revision of MRSE-D-16-00054 by 02-01-2017.

If you require more time, please contact the journal office. If you are ready to submit your revision, then please go to <http://MRSE.edmgr.com/> and submit the revision.

Your username is: harsasi85

Your password is: available at this link [http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email\\_address=harsasi85@gmail.com](http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email_address=harsasi85@gmail.com)

With kind regards,  
Springer Journals Editorial Office  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

---

**Harsasi Setyawati** <harsasi85@gmail.com>

29 Desember 2016 pukul 11.46

Kepada: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" &lt;anand.venugopal@springer.com&gt;

Dear editor MRSE, thank you for your suggestion. Me and my team was work hard to completely my revision. So I hope I can submit my revision on time. Thank you very much.

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE-D-16-00054R1 : Your PDF Has Been Built**

1 pesan

---

**Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)** <em@editorialmanager.com> 2 Januari 2017 pukul 09.48  
Balas Ke: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" <anand.venugopal@springer.com>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

The PDF for your manuscript, "Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste" is ready for viewing.

In order to formally submit your manuscript to the journal, you must approve the PDF.

Please access the following web site:

<http://mrse.edmgr.com/>

Your username is: harsasi85

Your password is: available at this link [http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email\\_address=harsasi85@gmail.com](http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email_address=harsasi85@gmail.com)

Click "Author Login".

In your main menu, you will see there is a category entitled "Submission Waiting for Author's Approval". Click on that category, view your submission and approve it. In the unlikely case of conversion issues please contact the Journal's Editorial Office by clicking the "CONTACT US" link on the journal EM home page.

Your manuscript will then be formally submitted to the journal.

Thank you very much.

With kind regards,  
Springer Journals Editorial Office  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE: Your manuscript entitled Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste**2 pesan

---

**Enrico Traversa** <em@editorialmanager.com>  
Balas Ke: Enrico Traversa <traversa@uniroma2.it>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

4 Mei 2017 pukul 13.12

Ref.: Ms. No. MRSE-D-16-00054R1  
Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. Some minor revisions have been suggested. If you are prepared to make the revisions, I would be pleased to consider publication.

The reviewers' comments can be found at the end of this email or can be accessed by following the provided link.

This is your login information:

Your username is: harsasi85

Your password is: available at this link [http://mrse.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email\\_address=harsasi85@gmail.com](http://mrse.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email_address=harsasi85@gmail.com)

When revising your work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

Your revision is due by 03 Jun 2017.

"Please note: when uploading your revised files, please make sure only to submit your editable source files (i. e. word, tex)".

To submit a revision, go to <http://mrse.edmgr.com/> and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item called 'Submissions Needing Revision'. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Enrico Traversa  
Editor-in-Chief  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: The authors describe a nice idea to re-use the wastewater from batik industries but the paper is not well written and it is not ready for the publication.

- The english is not good, please check all the sentences.
- The authors need to complete/modify/add/change the Fig. 5 with the curves of the cells sensitized with the other dyes.
- The area of DSSC reported is 4 cm<sup>2</sup>, it is similar to the dimension of FTO, is it a right value? Please answer to this question and correct it.

---

**Harsasi Setyawati** <harsasi85@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Enrico Traversa <traversa@uniroma2.it>

6 Mei 2017 pukul 20.47

Dear Editor,  
Many thanks for your information. ASAP, I will revise my paper.

Harsasi Setyawati, S.Si, M.Si  
Lecturer of Inorganic Chemistry,



6/18/23, 6:24 PM

Gmail - MRSE: Your manuscript entitled Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste

Department of Chemistry,  
Faculty of Science and Technology,  
Airlangga University  
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE - Your revision is due**

1 pesan

---

**Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)** <em@editorialmanager.com> 27 Mei 2017 pukul 13.17  
Balas Ke: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" <anand.venugopal@springer.com>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

Ref.: Ms. No. MRSE-D-16-00054R2  
Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

We are expecting the revision of MRSE-D-16-00054R2 by 03 Jun 2017.

If you require more time, please contact the journal office. If you are ready to submit your revision, then please go to <http://MRSE.edmgr.com/> and submit the revision.

Your username is: harsasi85

Your password is: available at this link [http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email\\_address=harsasi85@gmail.com](http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email_address=harsasi85@gmail.com)

With kind regards,  
Springer Journals Editorial Office  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE-D-16-00054R2 : Your PDF Has Been Built**1 pesan

---

**Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)** <em@editorialmanager.com>29 Mei 2017 pukul  
10.57

Balas Ke: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" &lt;anand.venugopal@springer.com&gt;

Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

The PDF for your manuscript, "Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste" is ready for viewing.

In order to formally submit your manuscript to the journal, you must approve the PDF.

Please access the following web site:

<http://mrse.edmgr.com/>

Your username is: harsasi85

Your password is: available at this link [http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email\\_address=harsasi85@gmail.com](http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email_address=harsasi85@gmail.com)

Click "Author Login".

In your main menu, you will see there is a category entitled "Submission Waiting for Author's Approval". Click on that category, view your submission and approve it. In the unlikely case of conversion issues please contact the Journal's Editorial Office by clicking the "CONTACT US" link on the journal EM home page.

Your manuscript will then be formally submitted to the journal.

Thank you very much.

With kind regards,  
Springer Journals Editorial Office  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE: Your manuscript entitled Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste**1 pesan

---

**Enrico Traversa** <em@editorialmanager.com>  
Balas Ke: Enrico Traversa <traversa@uniroma2.it>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

28 Juni 2017 pukul 20.03

Ref.: Ms. No. MRSE-D-16-00054R2  
Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. You will see that they are advising that you revise your manuscript. If you are prepared to undertake the work required, I would be pleased to reconsider the revised manuscript.

The reviewers' comments can be found at the end of this email or can be accessed by following the provided link.

This is your login information:

Your username is: harsasi85

Your password is: available at this link [http://mrse.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email\\_address=harsasi85@gmail.com](http://mrse.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email_address=harsasi85@gmail.com)

When revising your work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

Your revision is due by 28 Jul 2017.

"Please note: when uploading your revised files, please make sure only to submit your editable source files (i. e. word, tex)".

To submit a revision, go to <http://mrse.edmgr.com/> and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item called 'Submissions Needing Revision'. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Enrico Traversa  
Editor-in-Chief  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: The authors reported the JV curves for the different dyes. Why did they use only 4-5 points to describe the JV curves? In the Figure 5 Congo Red X-axis is Voltage not Votage, please correct it.

There is a big discrepancy between the JV curves and the data reported in the table:

In the JV curve related to Congo Red the Authors reported a value of  $J_{sc}$  close to 3.1 mA/cm<sup>2</sup> (value of current density at  $x=0$ ), in the Table 1 the Authors reported 14 mA/cm<sup>2</sup>. why is there this discrepancy?

In the JV curve related to Methyl Orange the value of the current at short circuit condition is different from the value reported in the Table

In the JV curve related to Naphthol blue black the FF reported in the Table is close to 80% but the shape of JV curve does not seem to have the same FF, 80% means that the curve is close to the ideality. There is a discrepancy between  $J_{sc}$  reported in the graph and in the Table.

In the JV curve related to Rhodamine B the current reported in the JV curve is extraordinary high close to 22 mA/cm<sup>2</sup> and it is totally different from the current reported in the Table.

All the JV curves start from a value of bias different from 0, why?

In the case of Congo red the FF reported in the table is very low but the shape of the curve is typically describable with FF close to 90%

I suggest to the Authors to repeat the tests of the cells with a uniform protocol, using high number of working points to trace the JV curves.

The quality of English is still not good, for example:

1. The counter electrode is graphite
2. In this study, variation of semiconductor were done through two technique (plural)
3. Four types of dye wastes were immersed with TiO<sub>2</sub> glasses.
4. It is chosen as a counter electrode because it is of less costly and easily prepared. (graphite?)
5. The example of J-V curve was J-V curve methyl orange in Figure 5

Please increase the quality of the Figures (labels of axis in the Jv curves are not clear)

—



Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

---

## MRSE-D-16-00054R2

1 pesan

---

**Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)** <em@editorialmanager.com> 28 Juli 2017 pukul 15.32  
Balas Ke: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" <anand.venugopal@springer.com>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

Journal Name : Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Article Title : Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste

Manuscript Number : MRSE-D-16-00054R2

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

This is to inform you that, as requested, the due date for submitting your revision entitled "Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste" has now been changed.

The new due date is: 04 Aug 2017

We look forward to receiving the revision.

With kind regards,

Springer Journals Editorial Office

Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE - Your revision is due**

3 pesan

---

**Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)** <em@editorialmanager.com> 21 Juli 2017 pukul 13.42  
Balas Ke: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" <anand.venugopal@springer.com>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

Ref.: Ms. No. MRSE-D-16-00054R2  
Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

We are expecting the revision of MRSE-D-16-00054R2 by 28 Jul 2017.

If you require more time, please contact the journal office. If you are ready to submit your revision, then please go to <http://MRSE.edmgr.com/> and submit the revision.

Your username is: harsasi85

Your password is: available at this link [http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email\\_address=harsasi85@gmail.com](http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email_address=harsasi85@gmail.com)

With kind regards,  
Springer Journals Editorial Office  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

---

**Harsasi Setyawati** <harsasi85@gmail.com> 28 Juli 2017 pukul 13.11  
Kepada: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" <anand.venugopal@springer.com>

Dear Editor MRSE,  
Related to the reviewer suggestion, He have me to repeat the tests of the cells with an uniform protocol. And until now, the "repeat test" is not finish yet, because of weather condition in Indonesia. (it is hard to predict rainy or not). I apologize if I can't submit my revision on time at this day. I need your huge understanding. In my prediction, the test will finish next week. I apologize of that.

Many thanks,

Harsasi Setyawati, S.Si, M.Si  
Lecturer of Inorganic Chemistry,  
Department of Chemistry,  
Faculty of Science and Technology,  
Airlangga University

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

---

**Harsasi Setyawati** <harsasi85@gmail.com> 31 Juli 2017 pukul 13.38  
Kepada: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" <anand.venugopal@springer.com>

Dear editor MRSE,  
Many thanks for your understanding. Hopefully i can submit my revision asap.  
Best regards

Sent from my iPhone

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE-D-16-00054R3 : Your PDF Has Been Built**

1 pesan

---

**Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)** <em@editorialmanager.com> 3 Agustus 2017 pukul 15.36  
Balas Ke: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" <anand.venugopal@springer.com>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

The PDF for your manuscript, "Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste" is ready for viewing.

In order to formally submit your manuscript to the journal, you must approve the PDF.

Please access the following web site:

<http://mrse.edmgr.com/>

Your username is: harsasi85

Your password is: available at this link [http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email\\_address=harsasi85@gmail.com](http://MRSE.edmgr.com/Default.aspx?pg=accountFinder.aspx&firstname=Harsasi&lastname=Setyawati&email_address=harsasi85@gmail.com)

Click "Author Login".

In your main menu, you will see there is a category entitled "Submission Waiting for Author's Approval". Click on that category, view your submission and approve it. In the unlikely case of conversion issues please contact the Journal's Editorial Office by clicking the "CONTACT US" link on the journal EM home page.

Your manuscript will then be formally submitted to the journal.

Thank you very much.

With kind regards,  
Springer Journals Editorial Office  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy





Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

---

## MRSE: Submission Confirmation for MRSE-D-16-00054R3

1 pesan

---

**Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)** <em@editorialmanager.com> 3 Agustus 2017 pukul 15.39  
Balas Ke: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" <anand.venugopal@springer.com>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

Ref.: Ms. No. MRSE-D-16-00054R3  
Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy has received your revised submission.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging onto Editorial Manager at <http://mrse.edmgr.com/>.

Kind regards,

Editorial Office  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE: Your manuscript entitled Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste**1 pesan

---

**Enrico Traversa** <em@editorialmanager.com>  
Balas Ke: Enrico Traversa <traversa@uniroma2.it>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

21 Agustus 2017 pukul 22.05

Ref.: Ms. No. MRSE-D-16-00054R3  
Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. Some minor revisions have been suggested. If you are prepared to make the revisions, I would be pleased to consider publication.

The reviewers' comments can be found at the end of this email or can be accessed from the journal's website.

Your username is: harsasi85

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at <http://mrse.edmgr.com/>

When revising your work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

Your revision is due by 20 Sep 2017.

"Please note: when uploading your revised files, please make sure only to submit your editable source files (i. e. word, tex)".

To submit a revision, go to <http://mrse.edmgr.com/> and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item called 'Submissions Needing Revision'. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Enrico Traversa  
Editor-in-Chief  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: The conclusion is related to the previous result, please change with the new results and observation.

—



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

---

**MRSE-D-16-00054R4 : Your PDF Has Been Built**

1 pesan

**Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)** <em@editorialmanager.com>24 Agustus 2017 pukul  
09.49

Balas Ke: "Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy (MRSE)" &lt;anand.venugopal@springer.com&gt;

Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

The PDF for your manuscript, "Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste" is ready for viewing.

In order to formally submit your manuscript to the journal, you must approve the PDF.

Please access the journal's website.

Your username is: harsasi85

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at

<http://mrse.edmgr.com/>

Click "Author Login".

In your main menu, you will see there is a category entitled "Submission Waiting for Author's Approval". Click on that category, view your submission and approve it. In the unlikely case of conversion issues please contact the Journal's Editorial Office by clicking the "CONTACT US" link on the journal EM home page.

Your manuscript will then be formally submitted to the journal.

Thank you very much.

With kind regards,  
Springer Journals Editorial Office  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy



Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

---

## MRSE: Your manuscript entitled Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste

1 pesan

---

**Enrico Traversa** <em@editorialmanager.com>  
Balas Ke: Enrico Traversa <traversa@uniroma2.it>  
Kepada: Harsasi Setyawati <harsasi85@gmail.com>

24 Agustus 2017 pukul 21.54

Ref.: Ms. No. MRSE-D-16-00054R4  
Affordable Dye Sensitizer by Waste  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

Dear Mrs Setyawati,

I am pleased to inform you that your manuscript has now been accepted for publication in the journal Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy.

Thank you for submitting your work to our journal. We are looking forward to receiving other contributions from your group in the future.

With kind regards

Enrico Traversa  
Editor-in-Chief  
Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy

—



Harsasi Setyawati &lt;harsasi85@gmail.com&gt;

**Proofs for your article in Materials for Renewable and Sustainable Energy ( 101 )**

1 pesan

**spr\_corrections@sps.co.in** <spr\_corrections@sps.co.in>  
Kepada: harsasi85@gmail.com

30 Agustus 2017 pukul 15.15

Learn. Discover. Achieve

**SPRINGER NATURE****Article Title** : Affordable dye sensitizer by waste**DOI** : 10.1007/s40243-017-0101-9

MRSE-D-16-00054.4

Dear Author,

We are pleased to inform you that your paper is nearing publication. Your article proofs are available at:

[http://eproofing.springer.com/journals/index.php?token=NeNOpV2c\\_yLhtRAipZei-yAR0P0nZM09p0Tp4yVKpMg](http://eproofing.springer.com/journals/index.php?token=NeNOpV2c_yLhtRAipZei-yAR0P0nZM09p0Tp4yVKpMg)

The URL is valid only until your paper is published online. It is for proof purposes only and may not be used by third parties.

You can help us facilitate quick and accurate publication by using our e.Proofing system. The system will show you an HTML version of the article that you can correct online. In addition, you can view/download a PDF version for your reference.

As you are reviewing the proofs, please keep in mind the following:

- This is the only set of proofs you will see prior to publication.
- Only errors introduced during production process or that directly compromise the scientific integrity of the paper may be corrected.
- Any changes that contradict journal style will not be made.
- Any changes to scientific content (including figures) will require editorial review and approval.

Please check the author/editor names very carefully to ensure correct spelling, correct sequence of given and family names and that the given and family names have been correctly designated (NB the family name is highlighted in blue).

Please submit your corrections within 2 working days and make sure you fill out your

response to any AUTHOR QUERIES raised during typesetting. Without your response to these queries, we will not be able to continue with the processing of your article for Online Publication.

Should you encounter difficulties with the proofs, please contact me.

Thank you very much.

Sincerely yours,

**Springer Nature Corrections Team**

No. 6&7, 5th Street, Radhakrishnan Salai,

Mylapore, Chennai, Tamilnadu

India, Pincode 600 004

e-mail: [spr\\_corrections@sps.co.in](mailto:spr_corrections@sps.co.in)

Fax: +91 73 0588 0700 (or) +91 44 4219 7763

**SPRINGER NATURE**  
Learn. Discover. Achieve

 Springer  
nature research

 BioMed Central  
BIOLOGICAL  
J.B. METZLER

 palgrave  
macmillan  
apress

 SCIENTIFIC  
AMERICAN  
macmillan  
education

 Springer Healthcare

 Springer Pflege  
Springer Medizin